



**CITY OF KEY WEST  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
(305) 809-3770**

AGENDA  
CITY OF KEY WEST CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
*FEBRUARY 18, 2015 – 5:30 P.M.*  
CITY HALL – LEGAL CONFERENCE ROOM  
3128 FLAGLER AVENUE – HABANA PLAZA

- I. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER
- II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
- III. ROLL CALL
- IV. APPROVE MINUTES  
AUGUST 20, 2014 REGULAR MEETING  
(NOVEMBER 19, 2014 WAS CANCELLED)
- V. NEW BUSINESS
  - A. REPORT ON 1/14/2015 FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAMS
  - B. REPORT ON 2/11/15 EXAM REVIEW SESSION
  - C. CONSIDER EXAM CHALLENGES (IF NECESSARY)
  - D. RATIFY 1/14/2015 FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAM SCORES
  - E. NEXT SCHEDULED CSB ACTIVITIES:
    - Police Promotional Exam – May 20, 2015
    - Regular Meeting – June 17, 2015
    - Fire Promotional Exam – July 15, 2015
- VI. OTHER BUSINESS
- VII. ADJOURN

IF ANYONE DECIDES TO APPEAL ANY DECISION MADE BY THE BOARD WITH RESPECT TO ANY MATTER CONSIDERED AT THIS TIME OR HEARING, HE/SHE WILL NEED TO ENSURE THAT A VERBATIM RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS IS MADE, WHICH RECORD INCLUDES THE TESTIMONY AND EVIDENCE UPON WHICH THE APPEAL IS TO BE BASED. (FLORIDA STATUTE SECTION 286.0105)

***\* It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number at 305-809-1000 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.***

**CITY OF KEY WEST**  
**CIVIL SERVICE BOARD**  
**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF**  
**AUGUST 20, 2014**  
**LEGAL CONFERENCE ROOM – CITY HALL 3128 FLAGLER AVE**

***BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:***

Tim Atwell, Chairman  
George Cabanas  
Mark Albury  
Brian Dunlap  
Michael Brockner (not present – excused)

***STAFF PRESENT:***

Claire Hurd, Clerk  
Richard Franco, KWFD  
Jason Barroso, KWFD  
Michael Davila, KWFD

**I. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:32 p.m. by Chairman Atwell.

**II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**III. ROLL CALL**

The Clerk called the roll. Mr. Brockner advised the Clerk in advance that he was not available. There was a quorum.

**IV. APPROVE MINUTES**

Mr. Cabanas moved to approve the minutes of June 18, 2014. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

**V. NEW BUSINESS**

**A. REPORT ON FIRE EXAM – 7/16/2014**

The Clerk advised that five candidates registered for the examination. Mr. Dunlap proctored the exam. Four candidates took an exam.

## **B. REPORT ON FIRE EXAM REVIEW – 8/13/2014**

The Clerk reported that the two candidates who took the Captain exam requested to review their exams. Mr. Albury and Mr. Dunlap attended the review session. The candidates submitted challenges to a total of ten questions – four jointly, and six separately. The Clerk provided the test preparer with a summary of the challenged questions, along with copies of the candidates handwritten challenges and supporting materials for a response and recommendation.

The test preparer provided a confidential response to the challenges on Monday, August 18, and the Clerk forwarded that document to all CSB members by email. A hard copy of the test preparer's response, along with copies of the package provided to the test preparer – including the original challenges and supporting materials were provided for review to all Board members at the CSB meeting.

## **C. FIRE EXAM CHALLENGES**

The Clerk reminded all Board members that the test materials are confidential. The Board members decided to discuss each challenged question, and the test preparer's response thereto, individually.

Question #87. there was discussion among the Board members, Mr. Dunlap and Mr. Atwell agreed there were several leading causes of residential fire, and the question could be more specific. The candidates chose the same answer. Mr. Cabanas moved to accept the challenge to question #87 from the firefighters, and give credit to each candidate for their response. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note -- one point awarded to each candidate]

Question #41. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to uphold the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note -- no point awarded to the candidates.]

Question #44. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to uphold the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidates.]

Question #94. Mr. Dunlap commented that information excerpted from the KWFDD SOG represents *guidelines*, not *procedures*. Division Chief Davila commented that he approved the question before it was included on the examinations, nonetheless it was poorly worded. After further discussion, the Clerk advised that if the Board believes the question is inappropriate, they can remove it from the test, and then decide whether to award a point to all candidates, or re-score the examination based on 99 points. Mr. Cabanas moved to remove the question from the examination, and to award one point to each candidate. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – one point awarded to each candidate.]

Question #5. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidate.]

Question #45. After brief discussion, Mr. Dunlap moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Cabanas seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidate.]

Question #55. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidate.]

Question #63. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidate.]

Question #7. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidate.]

Question #47. After brief discussion, Mr. Cabanas moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation. Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. [Clerk's note – no point awarded to the candidate.]

#### **D. RATIFY FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAM SCORES – 7/16/2014**

The Clerk summarized that as a result of the exam challenges, a total of two points were added to the scores of each Captain exam for question 87 and question 94. This brings the adjusted score for candidate Jason Barroso to 70 points, and the score for candidate Richard Franco to 70 points.

Mr. Dunlap moved to ratify the fire scores – the driver/engineer scores as reported in the agenda package, and the captain scores, as adjusted. Mr. Cabanas seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

[Clerk's note: The scores were ratified as follows: *Driver/Engineer Exam:* Tin Anson 72; John Torres 58; *Captain Exam:* Jason Barroso 70; Richard Franco 70]

#### **E. APPROVE DATES OF UPCOMING MEETINGS, EXAMINATIONS**

The Clerk explained that while CSB Rules require setting the meeting schedule at the beginning of the calendar year, a fire examination is traditionally administered in January – so it is necessary to set dates earlier than the beginning of the year. The Chairman asked if the dates

were acceptable, and the Clerk advised that the Fire Chief and the Police Chief approved the tentative exam dates for 2015.

Mr. Cabanas moved to approve the dates for the next CSB meeting and exams. Mr. Atwell seconded the motion. Passed unanimously.

**F. NEXT SCHEDULED ACTIVITIES**

**Regular Meeting – November 19, 2014**

**Fire Exam – January 14, 2015**

**Next Regular Meeting – Wednesday, February 18, 2015**

**VI. OTHER BUSINESS**

There was no other business.

**VII. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Mr. Albury moved to adjourn the meeting. Meeting adjourned at 6:05 pm

---

Claire Hurd, Clerk of the Board

## CSB MEETING 2/18/15

### ITEMS V. B. and C.

An exam review session took place on Weds, February 11, 2015. (The same day the meeting agenda must be published.)

One candidate submitted challenges to five questions on the driver/engineer exam. The Clerk forwarded the challenges to the test preparer for a response and recommendation. As soon as a response is received from the Test Preparer, it will be forwarded to all Board members for review.

Test Questions and answers are considered CONFIDENTIAL and will not be included in the standard agenda package.

At the 2/18/15 meeting, the Board should consider the challenges, and make a determination prior to ratifying the exam scores. If there is not adequate information available, or adequate time to consider the challenges, the Board may choose to postpone consideration of the exam challenge and scores until another meeting.



CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
CITY OF KEY WEST  
PO BOX 1409  
KEY WEST, FL 33041  
(305) 809-3770

**MEMORANDUM**

TO: Chief David Fraga  
FROM: Claire Hurd, Civil Service Board Clerk   
DATE: January 26, 2015  
RE: Test Results for January 14, 2015 fire promotional exams

Listed below are the preliminary results for the January 14, 2015 fire promotional exams. The CSB rules specify that the passing score is 70 points. It is anticipated that the Civil Service Board will ratify the scores at their next meeting scheduled for February 18, 2015.

<b><u>CANDIDATE</u></b>	<b><u>TOTAL SCORE</u></b>
<b><i>Driver</i></b>	
Dylan Snider	77
John Torres	70
Sheldon Goodman	69
Kyle Williams	58
<b><i>Captain</i></b>	
Greg Bringle	59

If you have any questions concerning the exams or scores, please do not hesitate to contact me at (305) 809-3770.

cc: Division Chief Mike Davila, Civil Service Board File

V D



CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
CITY OF KEY WEST  
PO Box 1409  
Key West, FL 33041  
(305) 809-3770

## MEETING NOTICE

THE CITY OF KEY WEST

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD

WILL HOLD A REGULAR MEETING ON

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 18, 2015

at 5:30 p.m.

CITY HALL-LEGAL DEPT. CONFERENCE ROOM  
3128 FLAGLER AVE, HABANA PLAZA, KEY WEST

ANY QUESTIONS, PLEASE CONTACT CLAIRE HURD AT 809-3770. THANK YOU.

*\* It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number at 305-809-1000 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format*

cc: Board Members  
Samantha Farist, Human Resources  
City Clerk's Office  
Chief Donnie Lee, Police Dept.  
Chief David Fraga, Fire Dept.  
Posting on bulletin boards

*emailed to staff  
+ Bd members 2/5/15*