



**CITY OF KEY WEST  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
(305) 809-3770**

**AGENDA  
CITY OF KEY WEST CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
JUNE 19, 2013 – 5:30 P.M.  
CITY HALL – LEGAL CONFERENCE ROOM  
3128 FLAGLER AVENUE – HABANA PLAZA**

- I. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER
- II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
- III. ROLL CALL
- IV. APPROVE MINUTES  
FEBRUARY 20, 2013 REGULAR MEETING
- V. NEW BUSINESS
  - A. REPORT ON 5/15/2013 POLICE PROMOTIONAL EXAMS
  - B. REPORT ON POLICE EXAM REVIEW
  - C. POLICE EXAM CHALLENGE (if any)
  - D. RATIFY 5/15/2013 POLICE PROMOTIONAL EXAM SCORES
  - G. NEXT SCHEDULED CSB ACTIVITIES:
    - Fire Promotional Exam – July 17, 2013
    - Regular Meeting – August 21, 2013
- VI. OTHER BUSINESS
- VII. ADJOURN

IF ANYONE DECIDES TO APPEAL ANY DECISION MADE BY THE BOARD WITH RESPECT TO ANY MATTER CONSIDERED AT THIS TIME OR HEARING, HE/SHE WILL NEED TO ENSURE THAT A VERBATIM RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS IS MADE, WHICH RECORD INCLUDES THE TESTIMONY AND EVIDENCE UPON WHICH THE APPEAL IS TO BE BASED. (FLORIDA STATUTE SECTION 286.0105)

**\* It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number at 305-809-1000 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.**

**CITY OF KEY WEST**  
**CIVIL SERVICE BOARD**  
**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF**  
**FEBRUARY 20, 2013**  
**LEGAL CONFERENCE ROOM – CITY HALL 3128 FLAGLER AVE**

***BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:***

George Cabanas, Chairman Pro Tem  
Mark Albury  
Brian Dunlap  
Tommy Mack  
Tim Atwell, Chairman (not present)

***STAFF PRESENT:***

Claire Hurd, Clerk  
Thomas Bouchard, KWFD  
Manuel Pichardo, KWFD

**I. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:35 p.m. by Chairman Pro Tem Cabanas.

**II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**III. ROLL CALL**

The Clerk called the roll. A quorum was present.

**IV. APPROVE MINUTES**

**NOVEMBER 14, 2012 REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

Mr. Albury moved to approve the minutes of November 14, 2012, Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

**V. NEW BUSINESS**

**A. REPORT ON 1/16/13 FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAMS**

The Clerk advised that five driver/engineer candidates and three captain candidates sat for the exam. There were no incidents to report.

**B. FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAM CHALLENGE – 2/6/2013**

The Clerk reported that Mr. Cabanas and Mr. Dunlap attended the challenge session, along with the Clerk. One candidate submitted three challenges. The challenges were submitted to the test

preparer. Board members were provided with copies of the test preparer response to the challenges. The test preparer recommendation was to remove two of the questions from the examination.

Mr. Mack moved to accept the test preparer's recommendation on both questions. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Albury moved to award a point to all driver/engineer candidates for the each of the two questions removed from the examination. The Clerk clarified that this would affect the scores of candidates who originally had one or both questions scored wrong, but would not affect the scores of candidates who had already earned a point for those questions. Mr. Dunlap seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

The Clerk specified that the driver/engineer scores, as amended would be: Manuel Pichardo – 70; Thomas Bouchard Jr. – 71; Brandon Kocis – 57; Tim Anson – 58; Brian Rose – 53.

### **C. Ratify 1/16/2013 FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAM SCORES**

There were no challenges to the Fire Captain Scores, as presented in the agenda package.

Mr. Dunlap moved to ratify the captain and driver/engineer promotional scores, as amended. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

[Clerk's note -- the final scores, after the challenges were accepted by the Board, are: Captain: Robert Franco – 74; Daniel Galvan – 61; Tyrone Cervantes – 52. Driver/engineer: Manuel Pichardo – 70; Thomas Bouchard Jr. – 71; Brandon Kocis – 57; Tim Anson – 58; Brian Rose – 53.]

### **D. PROPOSED RULES AND REGULATIONS AMENDMENT – III.H.I.**

The Clerk explained that there was no language in the CSB rules or union contract about how long a review session is allowed to be. The Board, in recent years, had been limiting reviews to an hour. Some fire department employees asserted that an hour was not enough time, and the Board agreed to consider a rule to require a two-hour review session.

In her capacity as City staff, the Clerk recommended that the Board should not make a rule about the length of time a review session is allowed to be. She said if a department wants additional rules about the review process, they can include them in their union contract or department directives, and the CSB would have to comply. The Board acknowledged that there was a flawed exam a few years ago which included questions not in the approved study materials. Those questions, about 30 of them, were removed from the exam after the review. One person at the meeting (tape was inaudible) said that issues like that is why a review needs to be longer.

Mr. Mack said that candidates recently complained that they did not know the review was just an hour long, but he said that they had been informed. Mr. Mack said that he has experience in taking promotional exams, and during review it is good to have an opportunity to review a question with its source material – but two hours is more than necessary, especially with a volunteer board ensuring the fairness of the process. Some Board members (inaudible tape) said that union input should be sought on the subject.

Mr. Cabanas suggested a compromise would be 90 minutes.

Mr. Albury moved to amend the proposed rule to provide for a 90 minute review session. Mr. Mack seconded the motion. Motion passed. Cabanas, Albury, Mack in favor. Dunlap opposed.

#### **E. SELECT POLICE PROMOTIONAL EXAM PREPARER**

The Clerk explained that the Board is responsible for selecting each exam preparer. The Finance Department requires price quotes on purchases over \$250, with an expectation that the lowest responsive price will be accepted. In the case of the CSB police exams, the Police Chief needs to recommend the preparer, and approve the study materials and the test questions. The Chief recommended Florida Police Chief's Association – who commissions exams through Stanard & Associates. The company has been preparing exams for the past few years. The cost varies, depending on the number of candidates -- \$2,407.00 in 2011 and \$1,762.50 in 2012, including both ranks, once per year. The Clerk said that she would like approval for one year, with an option to renew for two additional years.

The Board then considered price quotes provided in the agenda package, along with an email from the Police Chief, approving the examinations provided by the Florida Police Chief's Association (FPCA) - prepared by Stanard & Associates.

The Board concluded that the examinations prepared by FPCA were the lowest price, and met CSB requirements.

Mr. Dunlap moved to select FPCA to provide police promotional examinations. Mr. Mack seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

#### **F. SELECT FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAM PREPARER**

The Clerk explained that the selection process for fire examinations is the same as for the police department, and that the exams are administered two times per year.

The Board reviewed price quotes provided in the agenda package, and considered the recommendation of the fire department. The Clerk said the products offered by some exam preparers are limited by the study materials which the Fire Department's is willing to supply. The IAFF contract requires the Department to provide study materials.

Mr. Albury said that it appears that only two of the test preparers can be considered within the criteria. One test preparer costs twice as much as the other one. He said FSTC appears to be the best choice for the next year.

Mr. Dunlap moved to continue using FSTC – Fire Service Testing Company, as the fire exam preparer. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

**G. NEXT SCHEDULED ACTIVITIES**

The next Police Promotional Exam is scheduled for May 15, 2013.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for June 19, 2013

Mr. Albury and Mr. Cabanas offered to attend the police promotional examinations.

**VI. OTHER BUSINESS**

There was no other business.

**VII. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Mr. Cabanas moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Albury seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously. Meeting adjourned at 6:10 pm.

---

Claire Hurd, Clerk of the Board

Item V. D.



**CIVIL SERVICE BOARD**  
(305) 809-3770

**MEMORANDUM**

TO: Chief Donald Lee  
FROM: Claire Hurd, Civil Service Board Clerk *CHA*  
DATE: May 23, 2013  
RE: Test Results for May 15, 2013 police promotional exams

Here is a list in grade order of candidates who took the police department promotional exam exams on May 15, 2013. *Please be aware that THESE SCORES ARE ONLY PRELIMINARY. THE REVIEW PERIOD HAS NOT YET EXPIRED; AND THE BOARD HAS NOT YET RATIFIED THE SCORES.*

<u>CANDIDATE</u>	<u>TEST SCORE</u>	<u>SENIORITY</u>	<u>TOTAL</u>
<b><u>Lieutenant Exam</u></b>			
Areaka Jewell	93	4.5	97.50
Jeffery Williamson	85	5.0	90.00
Hollis Wood	81	5.0	86.00
Pablo Rodriguez	77	5.0	82.00
<b><u>Sergeant Exam</u></b>			
Randall Smith	89	3.75	92.75
Frank Duponty	84	5.0	89.00
Matthew Haley	83	4.0	87.00
Fred Carter Sims	81	5.0	86.00
Donald Barrios	78	5.0	83.00
Richard Thomas	79	4.0	83.00
Kuniko Keohane	78	4.5	82.50
Michael Chaustit	76	3.5	79.50

cc: Civil Service Board File

AMENDMENT TO CSB RULES & REGULATIONS –

SECTION III.A.1.

(FOR REGULAR MEETING OF THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ON 6/19/2013)

H. Review Procedure

1. An applicant may inspect his/her examination after taking the examination and receiving his/her preliminary examination results. The Board shall establish a Review Date for all applicants who, within five (5) working days after notification of the results, request inspection of his/her examination in writing to the Clerk of the Board. The Board shall designate two (2) Board members to be present during the examination review. One Board member designated to be present during the examination review shall be the Review Supervisor. The Review Supervisor and other designated Board member shall ensure that applicants limit their inspection to a mere review of the questions and their incorrect answers. The examination review shall not exceed ninety minutes in length. The applicant is not permitted to review his/her examination with any resource materials other than the reference material from which the promotional examination questions were created.

[\*\* Coding: Added text is underlined; deleted text is ~~struck-through~~.]

C8B- FYI



CIVIL SERVICE BOARD  
CITY OF KEY WEST  
PO BOX 1409  
KEY WEST, FL 33041  
(305) 809-3770

**IMPORTANT NOTICE - PLEASE POST**

TO: All Eligible Key West Firefighters

FROM: Claire Hurd, Clerk  
Civil Service Board

DATE: June 3, 2013

RE: **FIRE PROMOTIONAL EXAM – JULY 17, 2013**

**THIS CONSTITUTES FORMAL NOTICE THAT FIRE  
PROMOTIONAL EXAMS FOR THE RANK OF DRIVER AND  
CAPTAIN WILL BE ADMINISTERED ON  
WEDNESDAY, JULY 17, 2013**

In accordance with *Civil Service Board Rule III.B.2.*, the registration period for this exam officially commences 4 weeks before the exam. Completed registration forms must be received in my office at least eight business days before the exam is scheduled -- by 5 p.m. on Friday, July 5, 2013.

Individual notices of the exam, along with registration forms, were sent today through inter-office mail to each firefighter on the attached eligibility list. If your name is not included on the eligibility list, and you believe you may be eligible for the examination, contact me as soon as possible at 809-3770.

ELIGIBILITY AND STUDY MATERIALS LIST ATTACHED

cc: Chief David Fraga  
Div. Chief Mike Davila  
Samantha Farist, Human Resources

**LIST OF CANDIDATES PROVIDED BY KWFD FOR 7/17/2013  
PROMOTIONAL EXAMINATIONS**

Firefighters eligible for Driver/Engineer Exam

Anson, Tim  
Goodman, Sheldon  
Harris, Andy  
Jones, Wesley  
Kocis, Brandon  
Perez, Andrew  
Rose, Brian  
Torres, John  
Williams, Kyle

Driver/Engineers eligible for Captain's Exam

Bingle, Greg  
Cervantes, Tyrone  
Galvan, Daniel  
Gerez, Greg  
Pellicier, Scott  
Perry, Jake  
Zarate, David

**LIST OF STUDY MATERIALS FOR 7/17/2013 EXAM**

DRIVER/ENGINEER STUDY MATERIALS

IFSTA Pumping Apparatus Driver/Operator Handbook, 2nd Ed. 1st Printing  
Delmar, Introduction to Fire Pump Operations, 2nd Edition  
Map of Key West

FIRE CAPTAIN EXAM STUDY MATERIALS

Jones and Bartlett, Fire Officer, Principles and Practices, 1st Edition  
Delmar, Company Officer, 2nd Edition  
Key West Fire Dept Standard Operating Guidelines September 2011