

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 1 of 15

---

## Call Meeting To Order

Chairman Rudy Molinet called the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of November 23, 2011 to order at **6:00 pm** at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.

## Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

## Roll Call

Commissioners present include: Barbara Bowers, Daniel Metzler, Vice Chairman Bryan Green, and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Commissioners absent include: Carlos Rojas

Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Mike Rivera, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.

## Approval of Agenda

Chairman Rudy Molinet inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated there were no changes. Ms. Torregrosa added that all the applicants have submitted their affidavits of posting.

## Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the Agenda with no changes be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

## Approval of Minutes

### 1 November 09, 2011

## Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Ms. Barbara Bowers, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the Minutes be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

## HARC Planner's Report

Ms. Torregrosa reported:

1. Panamerican Consultants completed the survey. As a result of the survey 1683 structures may be listed as Historic Resources. Ms. Torregrosa added that this is the first phase and additional work will be accomplished before the draft list will be submitted to the Commission. Mr. Torregrosa stated that they report will also include accessory structures but she did not have the number.
2. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is planned to present the review of what has been done this year. Ms. Torregrosa added that to this date HARC has received 1370 applications.

Mr. Molinet inquired if Mr. Ramsingh had anything to report. Mr. Ramsingh responded that he had handed each Commissioner a draft copy of the proposed Ordinance revision for demolition. Mr. Ramsingh asked the Commissioners to start digesting the proposal. Mr. Molinet summarized the proposal which is an effort to streamline the demolition process. The Commissioners are to submit any comments to Mr. Ramsingh.

Mr. Molinet inquired of Mr. Ramsingh as to the status of the United Street property. Mr.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 2 of 15

---

Ramsingh responded that it is scheduled for a Code Hearing in December.

## **Code Compliance Manager Jim Young**

Mr. Ramsingh informed the Commission that Mr. Young will not be attending the meeting.

Mr. Molinet summarized why the Commissioners had requested Mr. Young to attend the meeting. Mr. Molinet stated that one of the main issues the Commission needs to discuss with Mr. Young is signage.

Mr. Green asked Ms. Torregrosa if she had started planning the signs workshop. Ms. Torregrosa responded that she will need to get times that the Commissioners would be available to attend. Mr. Green stated that he attended the last Code Hearing. Mr. Green added that during the Code Hearing he realized how important signage is to the retailers. Mr. Green stated that he thinks the issue may not be enforcement but the fact that the Sign Ordinance needs to be revised to better suit all the retailers. Mr. Green concluded that he thinks we need to determine a better Ordinance and need to hold a workshop to obtain input for improvement.

Mr. Metzler stated that he has taken rides down Duval to observe the signs. Mr. Metzler added that he agrees with Mr. Green that there is a need to improve the Sign Ordinance.

Ms. Bowers stated that she also agrees there needs to be a re-write of the Sign Ordinance.

Mr. Molinet stated that he agrees that the "one size fits all" needs to be addressed. Mr. Molinet asked that a Public Signage Workshop be scheduled in the new year. Mr. Molinet asked that Mr. Young, the City Commissioners and the retailers be invited to attend the Workshop to give input.

## **Old Business**

- 2** Removal of concrete column bases and concrete block railings on first floor porch. Removal of back side wood deck- **#1017 Eaton Street – David Knoll (H11-01-1409)**  
**Second Reading**

David Knoll was not presented. The Commissioners discussed if they should table the item to the end of the agenda. The Commissioners decided to review the item as it appears in the agenda.

## **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

## **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this staff report is for the second reading review of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a demolition request of non-historic concrete block architectural elements on the first floor wrap porch and the removal of a non-historic deck on the back side of the house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building located on #1017 Eaton Street is listed in the surveys as a contributing resource. The two story frame vernacular house was built c. 1906. The structure has a singular wrap porch with gingerbread railings on the second floor. Ms. Torregrosa added that the house has aluminum siding. Ms. Torregrosa stated that at some point the first floor porch was altered; concrete block bases were built around the posts and decorative concrete blocks were installed as railings. Ms. Torregrosa stated that concrete tile

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 3 of 15

---

resembling marble, known in Key West as *Cuban tiles*, was also installed. The house presents decay of structural members; the wooden second floor porch also presents serious decay due to water damage. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this proposed project is under the auspice of Habitat for Humanity *A brush with kindness* program. Ms. Torregrosa added that after the removal of the non-historical concrete elements it is proposed to study the state of decay of all columns in order to make a determination of how compromise the structural support is and how many columns will need to be replaced. The existing columns are regular wood posts with chamfered corners. Ms. Torregrosa stated that on November 9, 2011 the Commission approved the first reading for demolition, but requested that plans showing how many columns will need to be replaced be prepared for final approval.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the existing concrete bases of the columns as well as the decorative concrete blocks used as railings on the first floor porch are not historic and detracts from the historic character of the house. Ms. Torregrosa added that the existing deck located on the north east side of the house is also a non-historic element that, if removed, will not have any effect on the house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that this request can be considered by the Commission since the elements that are proposed to be demolished are not historic and do not contribute to the historic integrity of the house.

### Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

### Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

### 3 Demolition of non-historic additions - #310 Duval Street/ #429 Caroline Street-William P. Horn (H11-01-1440) Second Reading

Bill Horn presented the project stating that he did not have anything to add from the last meeting.

### Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

### Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this staff report is for the review of second reading for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of five non-historic structures, two of these structures are attached sheds. The main house in the site is listed in the National Register of Historic Places. Ms. Torregrosa added that the Porter Mansion is a fine example of Second Empire architectural style. The three story historic house was built in 1858. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include the demolition of non-historic structures that were built in 1989, when the back side of the property, facing Duval Street, was developed for commercial purposes. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff over imposed the footprint of the house and its ancillary structures from the 1962 Sanborn map. Ms. Torregrosa added that it is evident that the two accessory structures that are depicted in the Sanborn maps have been altered through time. Ms. Torregrosa stated that nevertheless the proposed demolitions will not compromise any historic fabric of the building or its historic accessory structures. Ms. Torregrosa concluded that on November 9, 2011 the Commission approved the first

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 4 of 15

---

reading for demolition and the new proposed design. Ms. Torregrosa added that Staff understands that the proposed demolitions can be considered by the Commission since the structures proposed to be demolished are not historic nor they will contribute to the character of the main house. The request will not have any effect on the historic house.

### **Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

## **4 Demolition of rear wall to be structurally replaced with new openings-#313 Margaret Street -Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-1445) Second Reading**

Michael Ingram presented the project's second reading with nothing to add from the previous meeting.

### **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

### **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this report is for a second reading for the proposed demolition of a back reinforced concrete wall of a historic building. Ms. Torregrosa added that the building located on #313 Margaret Street is not listed in the surveys. The one story reinforced concrete structure was built in 1954 and is one of the fewest utilitarian concrete structures in the area that still stand. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the request for the demolition is due to existing structural conditions. The plans also include the removal of a metal box shed located on the north side of the site. The metal box is not depicted in the Sanborn maps. Ms. Torregrosa stated that on November 9, 2011 the Commission approved the first reading for demolition for this request.

Ms. Torregrosa stated it is staff understanding that although the main building is historic there is visual evidence that the existing back wall presents structural decay signs. Ms. Torregrosa added that this building was built with reinforced concrete and the existing visible cracks are evidence of rebar decay due to corrosion. Ms. Torregrosa added that once reinforced concrete presents this situation the odds that structural steel rebars are corroded is high. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed metal box shed cannot be considered a historic or significant element to its surrounding context. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Commission can consider this application since the proposed plans include the construction of a new wall, although with different fenestrations.

### **Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

## **New Business**

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 5 of 15

---

## 5 Buildings at risk- #1012 Olivia Street

The following eMail from Frank Zamora was read into the record:

Hello,

I am writing in reference to the public meeting notice (nomination of building at risk) for 1012 Olivia Street property dated 11/23/11. Unfortunately I will not be able to attend this meeting, due to work schedule.

I am in the process of clearing the Estate to this property. Once this is complete, I will be seeking assistance in renovating the property.

If you have any questions please contact me at 305-797-0264.

Sincerely,  
Frank Zamora

### Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

### Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Commission has been extensively discussing how to prevent demolition by neglect in the historic district. During the last meeting, on November 9, 2011, Commissioner Green requested that on the next agenda an item for buildings at risk be included and he nominated the house located on #1012 Olivia Street as an example of a neglected structure in the historic district. Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff did a search on past building permits or HARC approvals and there have been no construction activity requests for this address during the past 16 years.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building located on #1012 Olivia Street is listed as a contributing resource. Ms. Torregrosa added that the one and a half story house with board and batten siding was built circa 1892 and was listed as a contributing resource in the 1983 inventory. The building has been abandoned and neglected.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff agrees that the historic house located on #1012 Olivia Street has been deteriorated by neglect and abandonment. Ms. Torregrosa added that measures must be taken in order to correct the back roof and prevent its demolition due to neglect.

### Commission Discussion:

Mr. Green stated that he brought this property forward because this was an area of HARC activity that was very dear to Commissioner Muench. Mr. Green added that he felt this is the appropriate thing to do and much need thing to do. Instead of just looking at the changes to the historic structures we need to also be taking steps to preserve the structures. Mr. Green stated he is very keen to help Officer Zamora in protecting the property to prevent the structure from being demolished. Mr. Green stated that this house has been left alone for too long and in the last year has started deteriorating. Mr. Green stated that he would like to see the City Chief Building Officer – John Woodson assist Officer Zamora with if nothing else putting a tarpaulin over the house to protect it.

Mr. Metzler inquired if Officer Zamora has offered a timeline as to when the estate will be cleared. Ms. Torregrosa responded that Officer Zamora informed her that the will is in the court system until concerns from other family members are resolved. Mr. Metzler

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 6 of 15

---

stated that with that information he would agree with Mr. Green that there needs to be a tarp placed over the house.

Mr. Molinet stated that he had a conversation with the City Chief Building Official – John Woodson. Mr. Molinet added that Mr. Woodson is in agreement that these buildings need to be addressed prior to them getting to the point of needing to be demolished due to unsafe conditions.

Ms. Bowers inquired if this has ever been done before. Ms. Torregrosa responded that this is the first. Ms. Torregrosa stated this will be a good test to see if the Demolition By Neglect Ordinance needs additional work.

Mr. Metzler stated that he was in a town in California that has an ordinance that if a building is neglected to the point of demolition it could only be replaced by exactly what there and that adding that type of verbiage to our ordinance may be helpful.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the building at 1012 Olivia be nominated to the Chief Building Official as a Building At Risk and recommend that the Building Department take appropriate actions as outlined in the Ordinance. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

### **6a Construct a new two story frame residence and pool- #710 Windsor Lane- Thomas Kelly (H11-01-1506)**

Thomas Kelly presented the project. Mr. Kelly stated that this is a new project. There is a double lot there and the structure had been struck by fire back in the sixties. Mr. Kelly added that numerous buildings have been built and torn down on this property over the years. The proposed plans are for a new building setback from the road in order to have a front yard. Mr. Kelly stated he has tried to keep the density down in order not to have an overbuilding on the lots.

### **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

### **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for a new construction of a two story house where an existing one story cbs structure is located. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the Sanborn map of 1962 the footprint and setbacks of what used to be a structure located on #710 Windsor Lane differs with is today in existence on that site.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include a two story wood frame building with v-crimp metal roof panels. The design includes hardi board lap siding, impact resistance wood windows and wood bahama shutters. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the front façade will have a two story four bay porch, on the second floor and a three bay porch on the first floor. The front porch posts are doubled and chamfered. Ms. Torregrosa added that instead of railings on the second floor porches wood louvered shutters are proposed. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new house will be setback from the sidewalk approximately 13'-2". The main roof of the house will have a maximum height of 29'-6".

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 7 of 15

---

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new proposed house, if approved, will require a backyard setback variance since it will be 18' setback from the property line.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff understands that the existing lot for this house is large in size. Ms. Torregrosa added that although the house located on the north side is a one story frame structure, the majority of the buildings in the area are two stories. Ms. Torregrosa added that the one story house on the north side of the site, #708 Windsor Lane, is listed as a contributing resource; as well as #714 Windsor Lane, which is a two story historic house.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed new construction materials for the new house are compatible with existing materials found in the historic district, particularly in new or non-historic structures.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the proposed design is consistent with many of the guidelines for new construction.

### **Commission Discussion:**

Mr. Green asked if the attached form H10-05-27-598 is for the same site. Mr. Kelly responded that that was approved for 710 Windsor. Mr. Green asked if that was already built. Mr. Kelly clarified that the new construction will be going on the open lot. Mr. Green mentioned to the applicant that attaching the streetscape was very helpful.

Mr. Kelly added that the rear setback variance was an over site and that will be corrected so that no variances will be needed.

Mr. Metzler asked why the louvers were being used as railings. Mr. Metzler issued a concern that the louvers be designed and built in a fashion to make sure no one can fall through them. The Commissioners held an extensive discussion concerning the louvers both pro and con.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Ms. Barbara Bowers, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

### **6b Remove non-contributing, non-historic building- #710 Windsor Lane- Thomas Kelly (H11-01-1506)**

Thomas Kelly presented the project. Mr. Kelly stated that he met on-site with Ms. Torregrosa to discuss the demolition portion of the project. Mr. Kelly added that efforts have been made to make sure the existing building is not historic.

### **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

### **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for a first reading for the demolition of a cbs house located on #710 Windsor Lane. Ms. Torregrosa added that the building is not listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the Sanborn map of 1962 the footprint and setbacks of what used to be the structure located on #710 Windsor Lane differs with what is today in existence on that site. The applicant has submitted plans for a new two story house to replace the non-historic

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 8 of 15

---

structure.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the existing structure is not 50 years old, therefore cannot be considered historic. Ms. Torregrosa added that the Sanborn map of 1962 can be used as evidence that the footprint of the structure that sits today on the site is completely different of what is depicted in the Old map. Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff understands that the existing structure cannot be considered on a near future to be deemed contributing to its surrounding historic context. Ms. Torregrosa added it is staff's belief that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if this request is approved a second reading will be requested.

### **Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 7** Remove carport. The structure, built without permits by previous owner is in code violation (Case #11-1116)- **#1103 Virginia Street- Richard Kevin Cain (H11-01-1513)**

Kevin Cain presented the project explaining that this was brought about due to the Virginia Street Sidewalk Project. Mr. Cain explained that he is simply trying to meet the requirements of the Code Case. Mr. Cain inquired if there was a possibility to waive the second reading due to time restraints and the time of the year.

### **Public Comments:**

Roger Ackers stated that he is having the same issues with not getting a complete answer from Code Compliance nor the Project Team.

### **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this staff report is for the first reading for the demolition of an illegally built carport. Ms. Torregrosa added that neither the carport nor the main house are listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the front part of the carport was built on city right-of-way. New sidewalks are proposed to be constructed in the right-of-way.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the existing carport cannot be considered on a near future to be deemed contributing to its surrounding historic context. Ms. Torregrosa added it is staff's belief that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if this request is approved a second reading will be requested.

### **Commission Discussion:**

Per Mr. Ramsingh's suggestion to add the fence to the application, the Commissioners and Mr. Ramsingh along with the applicant discussed if the applicant should add the fence to the application. Following a long detailed discussion the applicant decided not to include the fence to the application.

Mr. Ramsingh stated that the Commissioners cannot waive the second reading.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 9 of 15

---

## **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

## **8 Demolition of a non-permitted carport constructed within the City's Right-of-way- #1103 Virginia Street- City of Key West, Doug Bradshaw (H11-01-1526)**

Doug Bradshaw was not present to discuss the project but the Commissioners decided that they could move forward with the item since it is the item they just discussed. This application is the City's approval / request for the carport removal.

## **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

## **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this staff report is for the first reading of the City's request for the demolition of an illegally built carport. Ms. Torregrosa added that neither the carport nor the main house are listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the front part of the carport was built on city right-of-way. New sidewalks are proposed to be constructed in the right-of-way.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the existing carport cannot be considered on a near future to be deemed contributing to its surrounding historic context. Ms. Torregrosa added it is staff's belief that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if this request is approved a second reading will be requested.

## **Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

## **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

## **9a Rebuilt approximately 25' section of brick wall to matching existing- #910 Simonton Street- Pamela Joan MacKenzie (H11-01-1518)**

Pam MacKenzie presented the project for the Courtyard of Key West Condo Association. Ms. MacKenzie stated that the wall is crumbling due to age and tree roots are pushing it up and over.

## **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

## **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this request is to rebuild of part of a front fence. A condominium association owns the fence and has authorized the applicant to submit the proposal. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the fence is a combined cbs and wood picket. Ms. Torregrosa added that the surface of the concrete block wall was stamped to resemble bricks. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 10 of 15

---

Property Appraiser's photo of circa 1965 the existing fence is different of what it is depicted in the photo. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the fence is presenting structural problems and has been shifted towards the city's right-of-way. Ms. Torregrosa stated that she was able to find on the Naviline System that on 2004 a new block wall and stucco fence, 48' long and 4' high with columns 4' high received staff approval and building permit (HARC # H04-01-14-64). Ms. Torregrosa added that the actual wall differs of what the permit was for and no other HARC approvals or building permits were found for a front wall on this site.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the existing wall rises up to 4'-6" on its highest point, which are the cbs pillars. The wood pickets extend up to 4'-2". Ms. Torregrosa added that the applicant provided a survey showing that the fence is inside of their property line.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the proposed project will exceed the maximum permitted height for a front fence. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the applicant should make the new fence in compliance with the guidelines.

### **Commission Discussion:**

The Commissioners discussed with the applicant the cost of replacing the fence with cbs verse a white picket fence. A recommendation was made for the applicant to modify the application to replace the entire 50 feet with a white picket fence. Ms. MacKenzie agreed to modify the application to include the entire 50 feet.

Mr. Green inquired as to why it is expected that the replacement fence would not have the same issues. Ms. MacKenzie stated that the plan is to remove the trees that are causing the issue. The Commissioners reminded Ms. MacKenzie that she will need to verify with the Tree Commission that she does not need approval to remove the plants/trees that are causing the issue.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Ms. Barbara Bowers seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be **Approved** for a picket fence for the full 50 feet. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

### **9b Demolish approximately 25' section of brick wall - #910 Simonton Street- Pamela Joan MacKenzie (H11-01-1518)**

Pam MacKenzie presented the project for the Courtyard of Key West Condo Association. Ms. MacKenzie stated that as stated for the previous item the wall is crumbling due to age and tree roots are pushing it up and over. Ms. MacKenzie also requested to modify the application to include the entire 50 feet.

### **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

### **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this for a first reading for the demolition of part of an existing front fence. Ms. Torregrosa added that the fence is a combined cbs and wood picket. The surface of the concrete block wall was stamped to resemble bricks. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the Property Appraiser's photo of circa 1965 the existing fence is different of what it is depicted in the photo.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 11 of 15

---

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the existing fence is not historic. The existing fence presents shifting and structural problems due to damage of root systems from palm trees. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if this request is approved a second reading will be requested.

### Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

### Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Ms. Barbara Bowers, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Approved** for the full 50 feet. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 10** Renovations and additions to an existing two story masonry non-historic building. Add new pool and deck- **#1107 Grinnell Street- William P. Horn (H11-01-1520)**

Bill Horn presented the project. Mr. Horn stated that he was sure the Commissioners know the existing building. Mr. Horn added that in his design he tried to address his client's needs for space improvements and upgrades yet still respecting the existing building. Mr. Horn explained the details of the project as the Commissioners viewed the plans. Mr. Horn remained to answer any questions as needed.

### Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

### Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated the building located on 1107 Grinnell Street is not listed in the surveys. The building is a two story cbs structure and was built in 1962-1963. Ms. Torregrosa added that according to the Sanborn map of 1962 the structure in question used to have a different address, 1109 Grinnell Street. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building, as depicted in the 1962 Sanborn map, and as it looks today, is an L shape structure with low pitch gable roofs with exposed rafter tails. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building has two small porches on the second level; one is cantilever and faces south the other serves as the second floor exterior entrance and faces north.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include a new gable roof, with a slope of 6:12 to be built over the existing one. Ms. Torregrosa added that a new two story attached addition is proposed on the North West corner of the building. This addition will be rectangular in footprint and slightly shorter than the main house. In order to differentiate the addition to the existing structure hardi board will be used as siding. The plans also include a new second floor deck on the south east side of the building. On the main façade a bay window for the first and second floor will be added and well as on the second floor of the south east elevation. The new bay window will have a roof that will resemble the same pitch of the existing roof. All new proposed windows will be impact resistant.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that a swimming pool is proposed on the southeast yard and will not be visible from the street.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 12 of 15

---

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff understanding that the plans, as proposed, are consistent with the guidelines. The proposed additions and alterations to the building will be compatible in scale and proportion with the non-historic structure and the surrounding buildings. Ms. Torregrosa added that the change of the slope of the roof will not adversely impact the character of the structure.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that if approved this proposed addition may require back yard setback variances; the building is located on a HMDR historic zoning, which requires a minimum back yard setback of 15'. Ms. Torregrosa added that the new proposed addition will be 3' setback from the back property line.

### Commission Discussion:

Mr. Green stated he liked the design. Mr. Green added that he normally does support projects that require variances but in reviewing the project he felt the applicant had accomplished the best job with the plans submitted.

Mr. Metzler asked for verification that the building is not historic. Ms. Torregrosa responded that the building is not historic that the building is 48.5 years old.

### Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 11a** Reconstruction of irreparable deteriorated wall and roof on #814 Baptist Lane building and new addition. New two story structure. Construct picket fence in front but behind parking and 6' high picket fence around garbage and recycle cans- **#812-#814 Baptist Lane/ #812-#814 Patone Street- Ty Symorski (H11-01-1521)**

Chris Liddle the project architect along with the owner Walter Crumbley presented the project since Ty Symorski was out of town due to the holiday. Mr. Liddle stated that the project is trying preserve and restore the old building in back while creating two (2) apartments. Mr. Liddle added that the property already has some preexisting setback issues but they do not expect to make them any worse.

### Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

### Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for the reconstruction of a wall and rehabilitation of #814 Baptist Lane, a new second floor front porch and extension of existing walls for a higher new roof. Ms. Torregrosa added that the plans also include a new two story structure where an existing one story shed is located and new staircase. A new one story structure with a roof porch will be constructed between the existing building and the new proposed two story structure. None of the buildings in the site are listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that by reviewing the footprint of the 1962 Sanborn map of #812 Rear Baptist Lane, it is clear that the structure has been altered through time. The 1962 Sanborn map shows a two story front porch that is no longer in existence. Ms. Torregrosa added that the buildings in question has been abandoned and neglected.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include a new two story wood frame

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 13 of 15

---

building, rectangular in footprint. The building will have a hip roof that will extend approximately 18'-8" height with v-crimp metal roof panels. For the proposed rehabilitation of the existing two story house the plans include the extension of the exterior walls in order to have a higher roof. The new proposed roof will be a gable one and will extend 18'-8" on its highest point. The design includes wood clap board siding and new wood custom windows and doors. Ms. Torregrosa added that the plans also include a 3'-8" height wood picket fence recessed from the front property line.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the existing building is a non-conforming structure. If approved, the new proposed two story building and the proposed rehabilitation and additions will require setback variances.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed new construction materials for the new structure as well as the proposed materials for the rehabilitation of the existing house are compatible with existing materials found in the historic district.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the proposed design is consistent with many of the guidelines for additions, alterations and new construction. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new design will be sensible to the urban fabric and to the adjacent structures.

## Commission Discussion:

Mr. Green inquired as a renovation but what would be left of the building? Mr. Liddle responded that they are gaining space by lifting the building. Mr. Green asked about the size of the apartments. Mr. Liddle responded they are to be one bedroom and one bath units. Mr. Green inquired how they were to get to the second unit. Mr. Liddle stated that access to the second unit would be across the deck. Mr. Green asked is that wasn't a Code issue. Mr. Liddle responded that since to get to the units you would have to go through the front structure that precludes the issue of crossing the deck to get to the second unit. Mr. Green asked if the units were Affordable Housing units. Mr. Liddle responded no. Mr. Green asked about the ROGO units on the property. Mr. Liddle stated that there are two (2) ROGOs existing that are on the property that have not been used for several years. Mr. Green stated that he thinks this is an over development of the property. Mr. Green asked Mr. Liddle if he had looked at other alternatives to obtain the additional units. Mr. Green stated he could not support the project noting Guidelines page 38-1 Siting.

The Commissioners stated that they do not wish to see the building torn down.

## Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Denied** noting Guidelines page 38-1 Siting.

Mr. Liddle stated that he disagreed with the motion.

Mr. Molinet asked the applicant if he would rather withdraw the item and return with a different design.

The applicant requested to postpone and design something more to the Commissioner's liking.

Mr. Green withdrew his motion and Mr. Metzler withdrew his second.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 14 of 15

---

A motion was made by Ms. Barbara Bowers, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be **Postpone**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 11b** Demolition of a wall and roof on #814 Baptist Lane building, sheds and exterior staircase- **#812-#814 Baptist Lane/ #812-#814 Patone Street- Ty Symorski (H11-01-1521)**

Mr. Liddle stated that the demolition is well described in the package.

### **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

### **Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for a first reading for the demolition of the southwest wall and the roof of #814 Baptist Lane. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the demolition plans also includes an attached shed located on the northwest side of the house, a free standing shed and an existing exterior staircase. Ms. Torregrosa added that none of the buildings in the site are listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that by reviewing the footprint of the 1962 Sanborn map of #812 Rear Baptist Lane, it is clear that the structure has been altered through time. Ms. Torregrosa added that the 1962 Sanborn map shows a two story front porch that is no longer in existence.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building has been abandoned and neglected. The slow pitched gable roof is extremely deteriorated due to maintenance and constant humidity coming from old trees that cover the entire structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that there is evidence of structural decay in the roof and in the southwest wall. Ms. Torregrosa added that there is also evidence of decay of the walls fabric, including the main façade.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that, although #814 Baptist Lane was built more than 50 years, its roof and its southwest wall have been compromised by extreme deterioration. Ms. Torregrosa added that there is evidence that many of the members of the wall are not historic and that severe structural decay may be compromising the stability of the historic house.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that there is evidence in the Sanborn maps that the exterior front staircase, the attached shed on the northwest side of the house as well as the free standing shed to the right side are not historic nor they can be considered contributing to the historic urban fabric on a near future.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's belief that the proposed demolitions can be considered by the Commission since they comply with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district as stated in Chapter 102 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if the first reading for demolition is approved a second reading is required.

### **Commission Discussion:**

Mr. Green asked just what is to be demolished. Mr. Liddle came forward to review the site plan with the Commissioners.

Mr. Molinet asked if they could even consider the demolition since the design was postponed.

# Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 23, 2011

Approved – December 14, 2011

Page 15 of 15

---

## **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Ms. Barbara Bowers, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

## **Commissioners Comments**

Mr. Molinet thanked Ms. Barbara Bowers and Mr. George Galvan for serving and helping the Commission continue to conduct business during the time we have been transitioning to the new Commission.

## **Adjournment**

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the meeting be **Adjourned**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous vote.

Meeting adjourned at **8:13 pm**.

Submitted by,

*Jo Bennett*

Administrative Coordinator  
Planning Department