



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, November 23, 2010

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order

Pledge of Allegiance

Roll Call

Commissioners present included Bryan Green, Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Approval of Agenda

Enid Torregrosa stated that Item 11 has requested to withdraw the application.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the Agenda; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes

1 October 26, 2010

Nils Muench made a motion to postpone the minutes; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

The Commission presented a plaque to outgoing Planning Department Director Amy Kimball-Murley for her service to The Historic District of Key West and the HARC Commission.

Action Items

Old Business

- 2 Request to paint composition roof white (per guidelines) Paint rusted and discolored roof white- After the fact- # 720 Emma Street- Applicant Victor Cushman (H10-05-27-594) on remand of HARC appeal from magistrate Overby

Rudy Molinet stated that the only decision before the body per the magistrate's order is the determination of color.

John Marston the attorney for Victor Cushman stated that he and his client were present at the meeting to take direction from the Commission.

Public Comment:

Judy Martinez 1020 Emma

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report, this included a review of the grey colors from the Lanco Corporation and other technologies such as clear coats and ceramic additives for painting on roofs.

The applicant Victor Cushman and his attorney John Marston left the chambers prior to discussion of color.

Rudy Molinet reviewed the guidelines concerning roof color.

Bryan Green made a motion to accept color number 1 Grey Button from the Lanco Corporation; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

- 3** Request to paint front porch roof (composition) white per guidelines. Paint rear cottage composition roof white per guidelines. Paint 6' by 20' 45 degree wall to roof transition white to match white wall. Paint non visible nearly flat v-groove white. Non- conforming building- After the fact- **#726 Emma Street- Applicant Victor Cushman (H10-05-27-595) on remand of HARC appeal from magistrate Overby.**

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to accept color number 1 Grey Button from the Lanco Corporation; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

- 4** Request to demolish portions of utility shed and deck as to Code Compliance- **#728 Windsor Lane- Applicant Wayne Garcia (H10-01-555)**

Rudy Molinet recused himself from the Dias and passed the gavel to Bryan Green.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Vice Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Vice Chairman Green.

Nays: None

APPROVED

5 Request to place temporary shed - #918 James Street- Applicant Donald Morris (H10-01-560)

Donald Morris presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that metal sheds are not allowed in the historic district.

The Commissioners discussed the appropriateness of a metal shed on the property.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve for 1 year; Bryan Green seconded for discussion.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green and Rojas

Nays: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet

Motion failed.

Nils Muench made a motion to reconsider; it was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on page 41 of the guidelines; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioners Green and Rojas

DENIED

New Business

6 Request to install new antennas and equipment cabinet at an existing monopole- #525-527 Southard Street- Applicant Velocitel Inc. (H10-01-353)

Doug Fulture presented the project.

Public Comment:

David Knoll, Architect

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone so the applicant could provide response in written form for the citations in the letter given by the Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

7 Request to install pergola and fence- After the fact- #222 Olivia Street- Applicant Paul Ciceri (H10-01-584)

Paul Ciceri presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

APPROVED

8 Request to install new door on side of house- After the fact- #222 Olivia Street- Applicant Paul Ciceri (H10-01-585)

Paul Ciceri presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler questioned if the door was visible form the right-of-way.

The applicant stated it was visible.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 9 Request to built a second floor addition with an exterior porch and railings- **#1125 Von Phister Street- Applicant John P. Castro Seatech Inc (H10-01-586)**

John Paul Castro presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 10 Request to install solar panels mounted on top of third floor not visible from street- **#532 Fleming Street- Applicant D. Shirlee Ezmirly- Jeff Ruberg/ Salt Service Inc.**

Jeff Ruberg presented the project

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 11 Request to install a detached sign with neon copy Southern Cross Hotel, lounge, restaurant pool- **415-417 Eaton Street- Applicant Southernmost Signs (H10-01-608)**

WITHDRAWN

- 12 Request to install a second story porch and revise windows on new addition. Paint colors- **#313 Truman Avenue- Applicant Carlos Rojas Architect (H10-01-620)**

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the Dias.

Carlos Rojas presented the project.

No public comment

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report.

Public Comment:

The clerk read the following public comment letters into the record:

Claudia Pennington, Executive Director of the Key West Lighthouse and Keepers Quarters Museum

William Holt, Terry Lane Resident

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green stated that in this case he was in favor of the carport.

Nils Muench stated that he was not in favor of the carport; he cited the guidelines page 40 paragraph 5.

Daniel Metzler suggested planting along the right-of-way.

The commissioners discussed past HARC decisions on carports and their relation to the guidelines.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green and Metzler.

Nays: Commissioners Muench and Chairman Molinet

Motion Failed.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny; Rudy Molinet passed the Gavel to Bryan Green, Rudy Molinet seconded the motion.

The Vice Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench and Chairman Molinet

Nays: Commissioners Green and Metzler.

Motion Failed.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Vice Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Molinet, and Vice Chairman Green

Nays: Commissioner Muench

POSTPONED

- 13** Request to demolish back porch and built a two story addition. Request to change windows and remove concrete steps and stoop- **#1415 Olivia Street- Applicant David Knoll Architect (H10-01-621)**

David Knoll presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green expressed concern over mass and scale.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny the design based on page 37 and 38 of the guidelines; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

DENIED

14 Request to install a wood deck, two propane gas tanks and tent- Code Compliance Case-#1127 Truman Avenue- Applicant Armando Parra (H10-01-636)

Armando Parra presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report.

The commissioners and staff discussed the clarity of the application.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; there was no second. Motion failed.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny base on page 40 and 41 of the guidelines; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

Nils Muench stated he was not in favor of denial of this project and supported a postponement.

Danial Metzler expressed concern over hurricane safety.

Bryan Green withdrew his motion; Daniel Metzler withdrew his second.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone for 30 days; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

POSTPONED

15 Request to install menu board- Code Compliance Case -#1127 Truman Avenue- Applicant Armando Parra (H10-01-637)

Armando Parra presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented he staff report.

The commissioners and staff discussed with the applicants what signs were currently in place.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on page 49 of the guidelines; there was no second. Motion failed.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

16 Request to add a new covered deck at rear at second floor- #313 Amelia Street- Applicant Eduard Russell (H10-01-640)

Ed Russell presented the project.

Public Comment:

The clerk read the following public comment letters into the record:

Beverly Green Mingo, 311 Amelia St.

Sean and Jodi McGeough, 314 Virginia St

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on page 38 of the guidelines; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

DENIED

17 Request to demolish part of existing building, add a second floor and renovate existing building- #710 Bakers Lane rear- Applicant Michael Skoglund, Architect (H10-01-643)

Michael Skoglund presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

Motion carried.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

APPROVED

- 18** Request to demolish non historic rear addition and front porch. Replace with new porch and one story rear addition, renovate existing historic structure and elevate to FEMA elevation +8'- #319 Amelia Street- Applicant Thomas E. Pope Architect (H10-01-646)

Thomas Pope presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that this will require a second reading.

Nils Muench expressed concern over how much of the original material of the house is going to be retained.

Staff informed that 20% would be retained.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

APPROVED

- 19** Request to change aluminum windows to wood ones, front porch modifications, new side and rear porches, new doors and general renovations- #1210 Washington Street- Applicant Robert Delaune Architect (H10-01-647)

Robert Delaune presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

HARC Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa discussed the removal of the construction fence at the Harbor House development site, and the replacement of a wood white picket fence at 4ft high.

Comments from Commissioners

None.

Adjournment

Bryan Green made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

**Respectfully Submitted by,
Patrick Wright
Administrative Coordinator
Planning Department**

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.