

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Meeting Agenda

August 31, 2010 – 3:00 p.m.

City Commission Chamber
Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street
Key West Florida



The Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission will hold a public hearing on **Tuesday, August 31, 2010 at 3:00 p.m.**, in the **City Commission Chamber located at Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street, Key West Florida.**

1. Roll Call Board members present included Rudy Molinet, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, and Chairman George Galvan.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

3. Approval of Agenda Enid Torregrosa noted that the applicant for agenda Item 5 had requested to be postponed. She added that Item 15 has been requested to be moved to the first item under New Business at the request of city staff. Nils Muench made a motion to approve the agenda; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

4. Approval of Minutes

HARC Meeting Minutes – **July 13, 2010**

Rudy Molinet mad a motion to approve the minutes; it was seconded by George Galvan. Motion carried.

HARC Meeting Minutes – **July 27, 2010**

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the minutes; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet

5. Items for Public Hearing

a. Old Business

- 1. Request for demolition of back portion and new construction – #313 Truman Avenue – Applicant: Carlos Rojas, Architect (H10-01-77) – Demolish non contributing second addition and replace with two story addition.**

Carlos Rojas recused himself from dais. Carlos Rojas presented the project. He stated that this is the second reading for demolition. He explained that the structure being demolished is a non-historic addition, and the new addition was going to replicate the historic structure as far as materials. He added that he kept the height of the addition as low as possible.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that there is currently construction taking place at the site, and the non-historic portion of the house has been cut without the board's approval.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the demolition; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet for discussion.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant to explain what work had taken place on the property in recent days.

Carlos Rojas stated that the contractor may have made the cut to fix the foundations, but he is unsure on exactly why the cut was made.

George Galvan clarified with staff that this is the second reading for demolition.

Motion for demolition carried.

Public comment:

Owen Trepanier 1024 Thomas Street

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the design; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

APPROVED

2. Request for demolition of non historic structures, new construction and restoration of historic house- # **911 Watson Street- Applicant: Matthew Stratton, Architect (H10-01-94)** – Demolish non-historic additions and accessory structures, including: enclosed L-shaped shed roof addition at NW corner of historic structure, covered side porch with shed roof along entire length of south elevation, gable roof addition on the north side of the building, a “pop-up” rooftop structure, a free standing pool house on north corner of property, a free standing 16’ by 24’ gable roof accessory structure at the rear of the property, and the in-ground concrete swimming pool. Restore front elevation include: replacement of french doors with pair of wood 6 over 6 double hung windows, replace front door with solid 4 panel wood door, and restore the gable louvered vent. Restore historic roofline over front 24’ (+/-) of structure, utilizing salvaged historic rafters from rear 12’ of structure. Install new Galvalume v-crimp roof at historic structure and porch. Patch and paint existing wood novelty siding, trim and rafter tails. Replace three existing doors at historic window opening locations on side elevations with new wood windows. Add 650 sq. ft. addition to south side of historic structure, 232 sq. ft. addition at rear of historic structure, and 1,000 sq. ft. addition at north side of historic structure. Add wood awning and porch at south elevation at existing door location. Tile existing concrete porch floor. Site improvements include a new lap pool, splash pool, pool decking, 10’ by 10’ cabana and observation tower, a 4’ tall curved concrete garden wall, 8’ tall louvered garden walls, louvered panels and gates at existing carport, tiered 6’-12” concrete planters behind pool, wood picket fencing at side and rear yards, and brick paving for sidewalk and driveway.

Matthew Stratton presented the project. He stated that they were planning on demolishing 2,069 square feet of non-historic structures. He presented a model to the commission to illustrate the design. He reviewed the location of the proposed additions in relation to the model. Mr. Stratton reviewed setback issues and stated that the proposed planters and fences will bring the site into compliance.

No public comment.

Rudy Molinet asked Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh if the procedures for voting on demolition were being followed correctly.

Ron Ramsingh stated that he would look into this issue

Enid Torregrosa stated that staff recommends approval for demolition.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the demolition; Rudy Molinet seconded for discussion.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Rojas and Galvan

Nays: Commissioners Molinet and Muench

Motion failed.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to table; there was no second. Motion failed.

Rudy Molinet made a motion that demolition be approved contingent on the design being approved; it was seconded by Nils Muench

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet, Muench, and Galvan.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas.

Motion carried.

Public comment:

Judy Clark 1008 Olivia Street

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that the upper deck observation tower is visible from the graveyard and is inappropriate. She added that the height of the planters should be reviewed. Staff recommended approval with the exception of these two issues.

Nils Muench stated that the observation deck on the tower is inappropriate.

Rudy Molinet stated that the garage was higher than the main structure which goes against the guidelines.

Matthew Stratton clarified that the guideline only applies if the garage is an accessory structure; in this case the garage is attached to the main structure.

Carlos Rojas noted several concerns with the project, including pages 37, 38, 40, 41, 42 concerning out buildings, fences, parking, air conditioners, and carports.

Nils Muench recommended a motion be made to table so that some of the issues Commissioner Rojas had mentioned can be addressed by the applicant.

Matthew Stratton stated that he would not like the item to be tabled. He added that the only issue that might need to be addressed is the observation deck on the tower, there are no out buildings and the garage is not an accessory structure.

Rudy Molinet expressed concern over the fences as well as the visibility of the tower from the historic cemetery.

Carlos Rojas stated that there are several issues with the proposed plans. He made a motion to deny; it was seconded by Nils Muench.

Ron Ramsingh asked Mr. Rojas to reiterate his motion with the corresponding guidelines.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to deny based on the following guidelines; page 36 the last paragraph, page 37 paragraph 1, numbers, 5, 6, 7 and 8, page 38, page 39, page 40, numbers 1-12, page 41 and 42 numbers 1-10, page 43 numbers 1-8. Nils Muench made a friendly amendment to Commissioner Rojas's motion to add page 28 of the guidelines to the motion. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

The Chairman requested the Clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Galvan

Nays: None

DENIED

3. Major Development Plan- Request to demolish non historic addition and exterior staircase and construction of new frame building, new exterior staircase, restoration of existing structures, new swimming pool and site improvements- **#802-804-806 and 808 Whitehead Street, #324 Petronia Street, #809-811 Terry Lane- Applicant: Michael B. Ingram- MBI-K2M Architecture (H10-01-101)-** #802-804 Whitehead- removal of single story addition and replace with 35'-0" by 30'-2" by 25'-7" high addition plus single story 30'-0" by 7'-7" addition on south elevation. Repairs of existing structure and painting. Existing sales pavilion to remain with addition of bathrooms on west end. Paint white. Existing cistern/bar to remain and reuse as walk in cooler, infill to be wood white lattice, Compressor equipment housed in louvered boxed area to eliminate visual clutter. #324 Petronia Street-Existing building to remain. Remove awning section on north elevation, replace with section to match side profile. Signage as shown, building to be painted. Remove stair at east side. Market place pavilion to remain, Petronia Street end to be enclosed. Remove deteriorated wood/ glass doors and leave open. Paint white. #808 Whitehead Street Repair and replace wood siding to match. Replace wood windows with Marvin wood true divided light units with smallest muntins. Replace one window with four panel wood door. Porch railings to be in filled with 2 by 2 balusters. Paint. This building will contain three units for living. New control pavilion painted white. Existing sales booth for HTA trolleys relocated from corner of Petronia Street to Whitehead Street. Site improvements including refuse area, fences, new swimming pool with water feature, parking area and landscape.

POSTPONED

b. New Business

1. Request to build a covered porch addition, replacement of doors and windows, new shutters, reconstruction of fixed awning, changes to existing fence and site improvements- **# 730 Fleming Street- Applicant Matthew Stratton, Architect (H10-01-198).** Replace two metal louvered windows on front of house with wood 6 over 6 double hung windows in existing openings. Add pair of colonial style shutters to front door to match existing. Replace railings on front of altered porch to match historic railings on side. Construct new 12' by 17' covered porch addition at west side yard towards rear to replace existing canvas awning and wood stairs. Construct 180 square feet of new wood deck at rear to join main house and guest cottage. Add six 2 over 2 wood double hung windows at existing openings at cottage (two at north, two at east and two at south)- historic window openings and sills exist but are currently boarded shut. Install new 3'-0" by 6'-8" single lite wood French door at existing rear door of cottage (facing west) - opening exists but is currently boarded shut. Reconstruct fixed awning at cottage to match historic photographs. Remnants of all four historic wood brackets with mortise and tenon joinery exist. Repair damaged section of existing historic concrete retaining wall facing Fleming Street, and extend wall 10 feet west to existing off street parking area. Add new pickets between columns. Remove non-conforming and damaged concrete block retaining wall along William Street and construct new concrete wall inside property line. The first 22 feet from the corner (approximately) is to match the Fleming Street configuration, and the rear 26 feet (approximately) is to be a 24" tall concrete wall without any columns or picket infill. The existing 4 feet picket fence and 6 foot tall gate located at the rear facing William Street is to be repositioned approximately 18" to the west to sit behind the new 24" concrete wall.

Matthew Stratton presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that the project complies with HARC guidelines and staff recommends approval.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

APPROVED

2. Request to demolish second floor and left side of existing building, build a second floor addition and renovate existing building- **#710 Bakers Lane rear- Applicant: Michael Skoglund Architect (H10-01-230)**. Demolish second floor of existing building. Demolish left side of structure. Renovate existing building as per enclosed drawings into a single family residence.

Michael Skoglund presented the project. He stated that the second floor framing has been removed due to a Code Enforcement issue. He proposed adding a new second floor addition and renovating the first floor. He added that he planned on bringing the setbacks into compliance.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report, she stated that this was the first reading for demolition. She stated that there were no permits on record for the second story addition; however staff did receive a permit from the applicant that was not in the records. Staff recommends approval on the first reading for demolition

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

APPROVED

3. Request to extend previously approved application and revision to plans- **#522 Grinnell Street- Applicant: Sea Tech of the Florida Keys Inc. (H10-01-041)** Revisions to previously approved application H08-05-09-587. New pitched roof to replace existing flat roof at rear of house.

Paul Simms presented the project. He stated that a restoration had been previously approved.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. Mrs. Torregrosa stated that the applicant is proposing a new roof on the back section of the house. She stated that she had previously stressed the need for the applicant to be careful not to remove historic siding; the applicant had complied with this request and included a note on the plans. Staff recommended approval.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

APPROVED

4. Request to replace existing garage door, open boarded fenestrations and install new storefront and windows. New color scheme and new fence- **#1114 White Street Applicant: Mike Marino (H10-01-242)** Change existing storefront glass to impact rated, windows and doors with white frames. Replace existing garage door at storefront with the same impact rated windows as above. Existing garage door art will be saved and used inside. Replace double doors in rear of building

with impact rated overhead door. Replace jalousie windows along right side of building with impact rated fixed windows. Reopen old window openings and add impact rated windows (4) along left side of building. Repair spalling concrete as needed. Request to add architectural details as shown on attached elevation drawing. Paint exterior. Replace existing chain link fence with white picket fence with working gates.

Mike Marino presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that the changes to the façade complied with HARC guidelines. She added the only issue with the plans was an existing mural on the garage door. Staff contacted Frank Gardner, the chair of Art in Public Places; he informed staff there are no guidelines for protecting the mural. The applicant stated that he would keep the mural inside of the building.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

APPROVED

5. Request to remove two non historic additions and built a new two story addition- **#513 Truman Avenue Applicant: Dar Castillo Affiliated Design and Construction Management (H10-01-243)** Remove two non historic additions on rear and construct a two story rear addition.

City Commissioner Terry Johnston presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report, she stated that this was the first reading for demolition. She stated that the demolition is on a non-historic, non-contributing portion of the house.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve. It was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried

APPROVED

6. Request to replace existing columns with replicas and railings from exterior porch- **#936 United Street Applicant: Wayne Garcia (H10-01-245)** Replace porch and balcony post with 6" by 6" replicas, as to photo submitted. Replace railing with same.

Wayne Garcia presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. Staff recommended approval with the condition that final shop drawings of what is going to be turned be given to staff for final approval.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve with staff's recommendation; it was seconded for discussion by Rudy Molinet. He asked for clarification on the motion that the approval is for all the columns both first floor and second floor.

Nils Muench asked the applicant if the design intent was to turn the columns down to a cylindrical shape.

The applicant confirmed that was his intent.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant if all columns were being replaced.

The applicant stated all would be replaced.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the first floor railings were compromised in the past. The new columns will replicate the originals as best as possible.

Nils Muench asked if the wood was going to be pressure treated.

Wayne Garcia stated that it would be treated wood.

Motion carried.

APPROVED

7. Request to replace metal shingles with v-crimp- #509 Louisa Street- Applicant: Tony's Roofing and Wayne Garcia (H10-01-262) 5 V crimp metal roof on cbs building.

Wayne Garcia presented the project. He reviewed a brief history of Key West roofs.

No public comment

Enid Torregrosa stated that the house is listed as contributing. She stated that the front porch has metal v-crimp roofing; however the rest of the main house has metal shingles. Mrs. Torregrosa stated that an economic hardship affidavit was given to the applicant, and the applicant explained to her that the owner did not qualify. Staff recommended denial.

Carlos Rojas asked the applicant what the pitch of the roof is

Wayne Garcia stated that the pitch of the roof is 6/12.

Carlos Rojas asked staff if the roof was visible from the street.

Mrs. Torregrosa stated that it was visible from the street.

Carlos Rojas stated he believed that there was only partial visibility from the street, and he recommended the board have leniency.

Nils Muench stated that he did not recommend any leniency on guideline interpretation. He made a motion to deny based on page 26 of the guidelines.

Rudy Molinet stated that it is important to follow the guidelines on a contributing structure.

Carlos Rojas debated whether the roof was visible from the street in the photographs given to staff.

Nils Muench believed the photograph was misleading.

Ron Ramsingh reviewed the provision for alternative roofing materials in the code.

Rudy Molinet clarified that the owner could not meet the economic hardship criteria.

The Chairman requested the Clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet, Muench, and Rojas

Nays: Chairman Galvan

DENIED

8. Request to install two signs- **#830 Truman Avenue- Applicant: Southernmost Signs (H10-01-283)** One wall sign of aluminum fabrication 14 square feet free standing letters reading *Silver Palms Inn* and one double faced pole sign 22 square feet, 120 inches tall by 68 inches wide, stucco textured exterior finish with aluminum palm logo and letters reading *Silver Palms Inn* with *parking* and *vacancy* double faced panels.

Motion to table was made by Carlos Rojas; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

TABLED

9. Request to replace existing back stairs and built new deck on second floor and stairs- **#313 Amelia Street- Applicant Sea Tech of the Florida Keys Inc. (H10-01-299)** Replace existing rear stairs and landing with new stairs and wood deck.

Paul Simms presented the project. He stated the purpose of the deck was to provide outdoor access for the tenant in the upstairs apartment.

No public comment

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that all the houses surrounding the property are one story except for the two story house, to the right of the property which is one story high on its back portion. Staff recommended denial.

Rudy Molinet asked if the house behind the property was one or two story.

The applicant stated that it was two stories.

Rudy Molinet asked staff if this project would need variances.

Mrs. Torregrosa stated they would need a variance for setbacks.

Nils Muench asked staff if the house on the rear end of the property was one or two story.

Staff stated that the house was one story on the back end.

Nils Muench stated that he felt the deck took up to much of the lot.

Carlos Rojas asked for the total lot measurement minus the building footprint and the total of the proposed decking.

The applicant stated it would be less than 50% of the lot.

Rudy Molinet asked staff if the house was contributing. Staff confirmed that it was.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet.

Carlos Rojas stated he did not see anything in the guidelines to deny this project.

Rudy Molinet sighted the guidelines concerning decks.

Nils Muench cited page 39 of the guidelines concerning wood decking and lot square footage.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant if the deck was wider than the house. The applicant stated that it was not.

Paul Simms stated that the mass and scale is less intense.

The Chairman requested the Clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet and Muench

Nays: Commissioner Rojas and Chairman Galvan.

Motion failed.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to table; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet.

The Chairman requested the Clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Galvan

Nays: None

TABLED

- 10. Request to demolish existing one story restaurant and historical cable hut and built a new two story restaurant building- Mallory Square- Applicant Architect William P. Horn (H10-01-300) Add handicap ramp to hospitality house, re paint exterior, new paving and landscaping. Demolition of existing one story restaurant building, including removal of the non-contributing but historic cable hut structure and removal of the non historic additions. Add new two story restaurant building.**

Bill Horn, Paul Simms, Owen Trepanier, and Joe Walsh presented the project. Bill Horn reviewed the site plans for the commission. He stated that the area is in a high velocity flood zone according to FEMA, which necessitates the demolition of the historic non-contributing structure.

Paul Simms stated that the wood framing on the structure is deteriorating and the historic wall is structurally unsound. He added that repairing the structure would easily go over the 50% FEMA rule concerning restoration and building value.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that although the cable hut was not listed as contributing it is historically significant. Staff recommends approval for the demolition of the non-historic structures.

Nils Muench reviewed the history of the cable hut. He stated that he believed the structure is historically significant

Nils Muench made a motion to deny; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet.

The Chairman requested the Clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet, Muench, and Chairman Galvan

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

DENIED

6. Historic Preservation Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa stated that there are two appeals in front of the Judge. She stated that every HARC package from the last year is available online, and is now on the Legistar system.

Nils Muench stated that the numbering system under the new Legistar system is flawed.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the numbering system will be corrected for the next meeting.

Rudy Molinet stated that the photos in the packet should all be situated properly. He then asked legal how the Harbor House fence issue was coming.

Ron Ramsingh stated it is a current Code Enforcement issue with the end goal of having full HARC compliance.

7. Comments from Commissioners

8. Adjournment

Carlos Rojas mad a motion to adjourn; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried

Interested parties may appear at the public hearing(s) and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

ADA ASSISTANCE: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., or information on access available to individuals with disabilities. To request materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), please call 305-809-1000 for assistance.

Please note that one or more City Commission and or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.