

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Meeting Minutes

April 27, 2010 – 2:00 p.m.

City Commission Chamber

Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street



The Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission will hold a public hearing on **Tuesday, April 27, 2010 at 2:00 p.m.**, in the City Commission Chambers of Old City Hall located at 510 Greene Street.

1. **Roll Call** Board members present included Rudy Molinet, Carlos Rojas, and Chairman Peter Batty. Staff present included Assistant City Attorney Ronald Ramsingh, Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, Senior Planner Brendon Cunningham, and recording secretary Patrick Wright.
2. **Pledge of Allegiance**
3. **Approval of Agenda** Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa stated that the applicant for item CL2, 1218 Petronia, would be running late due to a conflict in scheduling and the item would need to be moved to the end of the agenda. A motion to approve the agenda was made by Rudy Molinet, and seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.
4. **Approval of Minutes**
 - a. **HARC Meeting Minutes- April 13, 2010** A motion to approve was made by Carlos Rojas, and seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.
5. **Items for Public Hearing**

- a. **Old Business- Tabled items**

1. **T1- Request to build a two story addition- #1221 Duval Street- Architect William Rowan (H10-03-25-322) Construct two story 20 feet by 28 feet addition to the rear of existing one and a half story historic structure.**

Architect William Rowan represented the project. Mr. Rowan stated that he would be lowering the plate heights down to the 7 ft mark, he also planned on keeping the pitch the same as existing.

No public comment.

Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa stated that the applicant had worked with HARC to make the appropriate changes. The scale of the proposed new building is keeping with HARC guidelines; therefore staff recommended approval based on the new design.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was initially against the project when it was first brought before the board, but he believes it is much improved and is now in favor of it in its current iteration.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

APPROVED

- b. **New Business**

1. **CL1- Request for façade renovations- #810 Duval Street- Architect William Rowan (H10-04-07-374) Remove plexiglass fenestration. New wood deck and landing with new wood railing. Reconfigure steps and add ADA bathroom.**

Architect William Rowan represented the project. This is a change of use from a retail store to an outdoor wine and pastry café. The previous owner had the porch enclosed with Plexiglas; the owner is proposing to remove the Plexiglas from three sides of the existing porch. They plan on extending the porch out over a planter. The stairs are going to be reconfigured so that they are more ADA applicable. There is no plan to change any exterior material. The original windows will be replaced with French doors with transom lights.

No public comment.

Senior Planner Brendon Cunningham stated that the project is a significant improvement; it will return the façade back to its previous design as well as removing unsightly windows. There will be new decking and wood.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

APPROVED

3. CL3- Request for revisions to approved plans - #513 William Street- 1 Pinder Lane- Architect Thomas E. Pope (H10-04-14-408) Revision to previously approved H09-10-16-1192 and H09-07-17-798. New chimneys on 513 William Street as per plans and new pool, deck and landscape.

Architect Thomas Pope represented the project. He stated that the applicant would like to combine the two properties, as well as remove a swimming pool that is located behind 513 William Street. There is also a proposed addition of two fire place and chimneys that are located at the rear of 513 William Street, one on the south side of the building one on the north side of the building. Although staff is recommending denial on the chimneys, Mr. Pope stated that he would like the commission to consider that the proposed north chimneys is being added to the addition, so it would not impact the historic fabric of the existing building.

No public comments.

Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. Mrs. Torregrosa referred to roofing guidelines on page 26 of the HARC guidelines. She stated that the proposed chimneys are not visually compatible with the historic character of the streetscape. The proposed chimney on the south side is 2 ft 6 in from the right of way. The proposed chimney on the north side is behind a bump out, so the flue will be visible from the street. A variance will be needed to build both chimneys. Staff recommends denial on the chimneys. The rest of the application fits guidelines and staff recommends approval.

Peter Batty asked the applicant if one chimney was already approved on the property. Tom Pope informed Peter Batty that a chimney was previously approved at 1 Pinder Lane, but Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa informed the commission that the prior approval was for an interior chimney.

Rudy Molinet commented that the chimneys look quite large for the guidelines and neighborhood.

Carlos Rojas commented on the historical presence of chimneys in Key West.

Tom Pope stated that the chimney on the left side of the house has the feel of a smaller cookhouse due to elevation and scale.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the application with the exception of the chimneys, Rudy Molinet seconded for discussion concerning the items included in the approval. Motion carried.

APPROVED

4. **CL4- Request for modifications and site improvements- # 1119 Royal Street- Architect Thomas E. Pope (H10-04-14-410) Enclose existing porch, new deck addition on side. New laundry storage addition on side, new windows and doors. New wood louvers on front and side. New front picket fence. New pool and terrace.**

Tom Pope represented the project. Proposing to improve the property, but because the house is broken up into rental units they can not afford the space to restore the front porch. He indicated the front porch as an enclosed porch and cited plans to engage columns and louvers in front of windows to appear as a louvered porch. There is also a side porch that they plan on enclosing. No public comments.

Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa reviewed the staff report. Staff recommends approval.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the project as submitted, and Rudy Molinet seconded. Motion carried.

5. **CL5- Request to build a carport- #810 Eisenhower Drive- Adele V. Stones, Stones & Cardenas (H10-04-16-428) Owner desires to construct a 11 feet by 15 feet (165 square feet) carport in rear yard, with v-crimp 6:12 roof pitch wood frame construction The driveway to carport will be enclosed and carport located behind existing 6 foot picket fence. Carport construction within tree drip line reviewed by the Tree Commission on April 12, 2010.**

Ginny Stones represented the project. Proposing carport with dimensions 11'x15' with a revised 6/12 rise roof design. Staff has not passed on the visibility from the right of way. Historically there is undisputed documentation of a garage structure with hipped or gabled roof, according to Sandborn Maps from 1926, 1948, and 1962 as well as the property appraiser's card from 1966-1974.

No public comments.

Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa reviewed the staff report. Staff recommends approval as submitted.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant if what was being approved was in conformity with the Tree Commission. Ginny Stones and Enid Torregrosa confirmed that it had been approved.

Carlos Rojas reminded the board that in many cases car ports can distract from the historic district.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to approve, and it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

APPROVED

2. **CL2- Request to paint house and shutters- #1218 Petronia Street- Heather Carruthers (H10-04-13-404) Preparation and paint exterior trim, shutters and siding of house. Walls- Behr Jasper Cane, trims Ultra Pure White, shutters Red Passion**

Heather Carruthers represented the project. Proposing red shutters although they are not an approved color within the historic district. The rest of the trim and exterior walls would be within guidelines.

Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa reviewed the staff report. Staff recommends denial on the coloring of the shutters. The rest of the colors are within the guidelines.

Rudy Molinet expressed concern over the brightness of the colors. He suggested a workshop on colors due to the stringent nature of the guidelines, and the unconformity towards those guidelines within the historic district.

Peter Batty agreed with Rudy Molinet and suggested the commission should proceed with denial pending a color workshop.

Heather Carruthers expressed concern over inconsistency in approval and guideline restrictions.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to table, and it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

TABLED

6. **Historic Preservation Planner's Report**
7. **Comments from Commissioners**
8. **Adjournment**