



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, June 14, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order
Pledge of Allegiance
Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, and acting chair Bryan Green.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the agenda; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

Approval of Minutes **1 May 10, 2011**

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

Action Items

Old Business

- 2** Replacement of four front porch columns. Demolition and replacement of front porch deck and part of front porch roof- Code Compliance case- **#522 Grinnell Street- Keys Contracting Services Inc. (H11-01-387)**

Alberto Cruz presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None
APPROVED

- 3 Remove existing roof and built a second floor addition. New doors and windows- **#312 Olivia Street- Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-468)**

Anthony Sarno presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business

- 4 After the fact application for drop canvas banner and light fixtures. Banner sign copy Jungle Photos of Key West- **#101 Duval Street-Gregory M. Scorza (H11-01-614)**

Applicant was not present.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked staff if the commission had jurisdiction over a banner.

Ron Ramsingh stated that they did not have jurisdiction over banners.

Carlos Rojas asked if the applicant had a license.

Enid Torregrosa stated he did have a license,

Daniel Metzler made a motion to deny based on the Commission not having jurisdiction over banners as shown in Section 114-103 of the Code of Ordinances; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

DENIED

- 5 Revision to previous approval H10-01-355. Shrink new building to get it out of side yard setback (less 8 feet. All else remains same- **Mallory Square- William P. Horn (H11-01-625)- Major Development Plan**

William Horn presented the project. He reviewed the proposed plans with the commissioners.

Public Comment:

Ginny Stones 221 Simonton Street

William Horn responded to the documents Mrs. Stones presented, and stated that they were false representations of the proposed and surrounding buildings.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that the commission has previously approved the project and the plans brought forward are on a smaller scale therefore the commission has no grounds to disapprove.

Daniel Metzler stated that he agreed they had no basis on which to deny the application.

Carlos Rojas stated he was in favor of approval.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

6 Remove existing bricks on front of property and replace with 4" concrete stained and sealed slab -#221 Duval Street- Bella Construction of Key West Inc. (H11-01-628)

Bryan Wofsey presented the project

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas asked the applicant why it was a necessity to remove the bricks.

Mr. Wofsey stated that overall maintenance and tripping hazard concerns were the main reason for the proposed removal of the bricks.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on page 43 of the guidelines numbers 4 and 7; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

DENIED

7 Demolition of non historic side porch and new addition on same location-#1227 South Street- Michael Miller (H11-01-650)-

Michael Miller presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the design with the details of the Bahama shutters to be presented to staff before the second reading; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

8 Menu board sign, six square feet- #1127 Truman Avenue-Armando Parra (H11-01-679)

Armando Parra presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was in support of the commission being lenient toward the sign.

Nils Muench stated that the applicant must follow the guidelines.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 49 number 11; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, and acting chair Green

Nays: Commissioner Rojas.

DENIED

9 Installation of tent and wood deck- #1127 Truman Avenue- Armando Parra (H11-01-680)

Armando Parra presented the project

Public comment:

Wayne Garcia 1123 Simonton Street

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas stated he was in favor of approval of the wood deck and tent.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

10 Alteration to existing 6” by 6” columns, from turned columns to square with added trim- #936 United Street- Wayne Garcia (H11-01-685)

Wayne Garcia presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant if an engineer has stated that a replica column is not possible.

Mr. Garcia stated that an engineer has not stated that. He added that the replica is too expensive for the home owner and an identical column would not be signed off by the engineer.

Bryan Green stated that the commission has no such representations from an engineer in front of them that supported this argument.

Enid Torregrosa stated that a turned column was submitted to the commission and approved, and this was the application submitted for the building permit.

Mr. Garcia clarified that they altered the original column.

Daniel Metzler stated that the arguments presented by the applicant were ridiculous and he was in favor of denial.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 33 numbers 2, 4, 7 and 17; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

DENIED

11 Demolition of non historic attendant parking booth. No new built back- #402 Wall Street- City of Key West (H11-01-693)

John Wilkins City of Key West Parking Manager presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

12 Demolition of non-historic attendant parking booth. No new built back- #800 Block Caroline Street- City of Key West (H11-01-694)

John Wilkins City of Key West Parking Manager presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and acting chair Green

Nays: None

APPROVED

HARC Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa reviewed the Draft Membership and Noticing Ordinances with the commissioners.

Carlos Rojas stated that he had no objections and was in favor of the draft ordinances.

Nils Muench stated that he was not in favor of increasing the number of board members.

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment

Nils Muench made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

HARC June 14, 2011

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.