

April 26, 2011



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, April 26, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order
Pledge of Allegiance
Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Enid Torregrosa stated that the applicant for Item 6 had requested to be withdrawn.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried

Approval of Minutes

1 March 22, 2011

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Nils Muench abstained due to his absence at the March 22, 2011 meeting.

Action Items

Old Business

2 Construct new gable dormer, expand shed dormer, partial demolition of sawtooth roof for a wood deck at roof level- #806 Carey Lane- Kevin Melloncamp- Toolbox GC (H11-01-331)

Nils Muench recused himself from the dais.

Kevin Melloncamp presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green stated that he felt changing the nature of the structure negatively affects the contributing structure.

Carlos Rojas stated that the proposed changes were altering the original structure and roofline.

Rudy Molinet stated that the proposed additions alter the historic fabric of the house.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny the proposed design based on the guidelines page 26 number 4, page 28 number 1, page 37 numbers 1, 3, and 5; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

Bryan Green made a motion to deny the proposed demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

3 Demolition of non historic additions and two outbuildings. Construct a two story addition on rear-#513 Truman Avenue- Dar Castillo- Affiliated Design and Const. Mgrs. (H11-01-351)

Dar Castillo presented the project. This was the second reading for a request for demolition.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the proposed demolition; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business

4 Two story addition at rear. New hip roof to replace existing gable one and new additions to existing second floor porches- #1107 Grinnell Street- William Rowan (H11-01-445)

William Rowan presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

William Rowan reviewed the site plans with the commissioners.

Bryan Green stated that he felt the façade changes altered the original historic design of the building.

Daniel Metzler stated that he felt the proposed changes improved the appearance of the building.

Nils Muench cited the guidelines page 37 number 3.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 37 numbers 1, 3, and 4; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Metzler

DENIED

5 Double faced hanging sign with aluminum letters back lit with white neon sign copy *Southern Cross Hotel*- # 415-417 Eaton Street- Southernmost Signs (H11-01-413)

Carl Reed presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant if the free standing sign was being removed.

Mr. Reed stated that it was being removed.

Bryan Green asked the applicant why they were changing from a free standing sign to a hanging sign.

Mr. Reed stated that the owner would like a better view from Eaton and Duval Streets with the hanging sign.

Nils Muench stated that the sign would significantly change the street scape and have an adverse effect on the building.

Daniel Metzler stated that the hotel already has two signs on Duval Street.

Rudy Molinet stated that backlighting is prohibited in the historic district.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed page 50 of the guidelines.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 50 numbers 19 and 24(e); the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

6 Two story addition at rear- #617 Mickens Lane- Michael Skoglund (H11-01-431)

WITHDRAWN

7 General rehabilitation of structure with side and back additions- #1021 Fleming Street- Robert Delaune (H11-01-450)

WITHDRAWN

The applicant withdrew the item during the meeting.

8 Remove existing roof and built a second floor addition. New doors and windows- #312 Olivia Street- Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-468)

Michael Ingram presented the project.

Public comment:

John McKenzie, St. James First Missionary Baptist Church.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that the building is less than 50 years old.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Carlos Rojas stated that the setbacks were not being met.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant if the neighboring property owner was aware of the application especially the proposed elevator shaft.

John McKenzie stated that the neighbors were aware of the project.

Bryan Green stated that he was concerned that the proportions are not reminiscent of a church.

Michael Ingram stated that the design helps bring light into the building.

Carlos Rojas asked if the existing building was going to be demolished.

Enid Torregrosa stated they would use the existing walls. She then reviewed the demolition definition in the Code of Ordinances Chapter 102.

Rudy Molinet asked when the building was built.

John McKenzie stated that the building was built in 1962.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was not in support of the proposed contemporary design.

Nils Muench stated that the basis for review is the guidelines.

The commissioners discussed design details with Mr. Ingram regarding scale and appearance.

Rudy Molinet stated that there were conflicting dates given for the construction of the building, and the structure may be more historic than indicated.

Enid Torregrosa informed the commissioners that between 1948 and 1962 there were no Sanborn maps. She added that on the cornerstone the date was listed as rebuilt in 1962.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler and Muench.

Nays: Commissioners Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Motion Failed.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone to the May 24, 2011 meeting; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

9 Replace 38 existing windows, replace rotted siding and paint - #1122 Watson Street- Kim Fisher (H11-01-490)

Jonathan S. Fisher, authorized representative of Kim Fisher, presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone so that the applicant can provide scale elevation showing the proposed windows; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

- 10** Replace decking, wood guardrails and steel handrails, pole mounted light fixtures and surface mounted pathway lights- **Harbor walk at the Historic Seaport- Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-505)**

Michael Ingram presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that he was concerned with the durability of the materials.

Michael Ingram stated they would have a reasonable life expectancy with maintenance.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Nils Muench stated that the durability should be researched.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 11** Revision to application H11-01-402 for demolition of existing garage and replacement- **#730 Southard Street- Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-507)**

Tom Pope presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that the garage was ideal for electric cars.

Bryan Green stated that most of the garage is beyond renovation.

Daniel Metzler agreed that the structure is deteriorated.

Nils Muench stated that he was not in support of demolition.

Carlos Rojas stated that the wood is able to be restored.

The commissioners reviewed possible uses for the garage. They then reviewed the plans of previous application.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the plans of drawing A 1 from the April 12, 2011 plans; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench

APPROVED

12 Proposed revisions to guidelines- Exterior colors in the historic district and installation of solar devices.

POSTPONED

**HARC Planner's Report
Comments from Commissioners**

Bryan green asked staff for an update on the Equator Hotel.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the owner hired an architect and she was meeting with him.

Adjournment

Nils Muench made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.