



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, April 12, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order Pledge of Allegiance Roll Call

Commissioners present included Nils Muench, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the agenda; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes

1 February 22, 2011

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

2 March 8, 2011

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Action Items

Old Business

- 3 Revisions to previously approved plans, demolition of non historic carport, revisions to side, back and front fences, revisions to back planters and swimming pool wall, site revisions- **#911 Watson Street- Matthew Stratton (H11-01-319)**

Matthew Stratton presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

HARC April 12, 2011

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition of a non-historic carport; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business

- 4** Construct new gable dormer, expand shed dormer, partial demolition of sawtooth roof for a wood deck at roof level- **#806 Carey Lane- Kevin Melloncamp- Toolbox GC (H11-01-331)**

Nils Muench recused himself from the dais.

Rudy Molinet stated that there was not a quorum for the item to be heard and it would therefore have to be postponed to the following meeting.

POSTPONED

- 5** Demolition of non historic additions and two outbuildings. Construct a two story addition on rear-**#513 Truman Avenue- Dar Castillo- Affiliated Design and Const. Mgrs. (H11-01-351)**

Dar Castillo presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

6 Construct new three bay front porch on existing structure- #1315 United Street- William Rowan (H11-01-353)

William Rowan presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant why the window removal was not listed in the application.

Nils Muench stated that the plans are in conflict with the guidelines page 38 paragraph 1.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 33 number 7; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

7 Install retractable awning on front upper porch- After the fact- #1204 Pine Street- April Polston (H11-01-378)

Brandon Demando, the applicant's attorney, presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench questioned the appropriateness in the historic district.

Bryan Green stated that the metal awning is not appropriate in the district and will affectively change the streetscape; he cited the guidelines page 37 paragraph 3.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was not in favor of the aluminum metal awning, and would therefore suggest a different approach to generate the same results but would comply with the Historic guidelines.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 37 number 3. Ron Ramsingh suggested the addition of page 31 numbers 4, 7, and 9. Nils Muench seconded the motion wuith the addition of staff's friendly amendment.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

- 8 Replacement of four front porch columns. Demolition and replacement of front porch deck and part of front porch roof- Code Compliance Case- **#522 Grinnell Street- Keys Contracting Services Inc. (H11-01-387)**

Chris Gratton the President of Keys Contracting Services Inc. presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked staff if the components were necessary for removal.

Enid Torregrosa stated that she was not contacted for this work therefore staff can not determine if the material was salvageable.

Nils Muench stated that the historic fabric needs to be preserved.

Chris Gratton stated that he had felt that there was a life safety issue with rotted material.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the city building official needs to be contacted to determine possible life safety issues.

Nils Muench asked the applicant if the column had been turned to match the original.

Alberto Cruz stated that the columns were matched to the original.

The applicant clarified the original scope of work for the commissioners.

Ron Ramsingh stated that the item was not properly noticed for demolition.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

- 9 Construction of rear deck over one story back portion of house with solar panels and sun tube- **#1901 Flagler Avenue- One Call Construction (H11-01-388)**

David Pouliot presented the project.

No public comment.

HARC April 12, 2011

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green stated he was not in favor of the project.

Nils Muench reviewed the guidelines on page 28 concerning solar panels.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 37 numbers 3, 5 and 6; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench for discussion.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was not in support of the roof deck.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

10 Request to approve mobile vendor cart- Historic District- Meike Zuechner (H11-01-390)

Mekie Zuechner presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

11 Exterior restoration. Remove front addition of garage and reconstruct garage with additions to side and rear. Pantry addition, new pavilion and Florida room extension. Pool, deck and picket fencing- #730 Southard Street- Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-402)

Thomas Pope presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report.

Bryan Green stated that he was not in support of the garage with the proposed dimensions. Commissioner Green made a motion to approve the design with the exception of the garage; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

HARC April 12, 2011

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

12 Proposed revisions to guidelines- Exterior colors in the historic district and installation of solar devices.

Nils Muench asked staff for clarification over the language concerning “natural finish” in the revisions to the guidelines.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the difference is between old wood like Miami-Dade and Pine, and new pressure treated wood.

Bryan Green handed out some information regarding the guideline revisions to his fellow commissioners.

**HARC Planner’s Report
Comments from Commissioners
Adjournment**

Nils Muench made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.