



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Agenda Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, March 22, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order Pledge of Allegiance Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Enid Torregrosa requested to postpone the proposed revisions to the guidelines.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the applicant for item 3 had requested the item be postponed.

The motion to postpone was denied. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes

1 February 22, 2011

No minutes were available for review.

Action Items

Old Business

2 Demolition of one story structure and new two story building - **Key West Bight - William P. Horn (H11-01-184)**

William Horn presented the project for second reading for demolition.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 3 Installation of wood deck, railing and screen fence over first floor roof - After the fact application - Code Compliance Case - **#816, 818, 822 Fleming Street and #2 Scheppens Lane - Trepanier and Associates (H11-01-217)**

Owen Trepanier presented the project.

Public comment:

Susan Cardenas, Stones and Cardenas Law Firm

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant for clarification on what was being proposed on the application.

Owen Trepanier stated that they are seeking approval to put the property back into the condition that it was prior to the current phase of construction.

Rudy Molinet asked Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh what the outcome would be if the current application was denied.

Ron Ramsingh stated that the applicant would have to re-submit a new application.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on the following guidelines: page 26 number 4, page 28 number 1, page 36 numbers 1, 3 and 4, and page 42 number 9. Daniel Metzler seconded the motion.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

- 4 Demolish back addition and replace with new addition, new deck and pool - **#321 Catherine Street - William P. Horn (H11-01-245)**

William Horn presented the project for second reading for demolition.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

5 Relocation of historic house and new addition - #616 Virginia Street - Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-250)

Michael Ingram presented the project for second reading for demolition.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

6 Demolish existing office overhang and portion of existing side porch roof. Construct new office attached to cbs building. Construct three turrets roofs, new fence and gate relocation of sign - #716-718 South Street- John M. Ganton- Dennis Beebe -Solaria (H11-01-256)

Dennis Beebe presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed the newly submitted documents.

Daniel Metzler clarified with the applicant that no variances would be needed.

Rudy Molinet stated that white v crimp roofing is not allowed in the historic district.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the proposed fence is not in keeping with the CBS block architecture of the existing structure.

Bryan Green stated that he was not in support of the turret roof design. He made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 37 number 3. Rudy Molinet offered a friendly amendment to add the guideline on page 35 concerning white roofs. Bryan Green accepted the friendly amendment; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

DENIED

New Business

- 7 Remove existing windows and replace with Vistawall storefront- #500 Duval Street- Monroe Glass and Mirror (H11-01-264)**

Spence Lewis presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report

Bryan Green stated that the windows on the other side of the facade are bi-fold and they slide back.

Carlos Rojas stated that he could not support because the building is contributing.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 37 numbers 1 and 3; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

- 8 Repair and replace siding on north and east facades of garage building. Add step up parapet at east elevation- #1216 White Street- William Rowan (H11-01-299)**

William Rowan presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 9 Installation of three storage containers and construction of shed roof between two of the storages-#909 Simonton Street- Key West Chemical and Paper- Gilda Fernandez (H11-01-309)**

Gilda Fernandez presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green and Carlos Rojas expressed sympathy toward the applicant because of the history of the existing containers and the business itself.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green for discussion.

Daniel Metzler stated that some attempt should be made to screen the containers so they are not readily visible from the public right-of-way.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was in support of voting for approval with a condition that implements a compromise so that the containers can be screened and not visible from the right-of-way.

Enid Torregrosa stated that planting would be the most appropriate solution.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was not in favor of burdening the applicant with a condition.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Rojas and Green

Nays: Commissioners Metzler and Chairman Molinet.

Motion failed.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve subject to landscaping or screening to be submitted to and approved by staff; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

APPROVED

10 Revisions to previously approved plans, demolition of non historic carport, revisions to side, back and front fences, revisions to back planters and swimming pool wall, site revisions- **#911 Watson Street- Matthew Stratton (H11-01-319)**

Matthew Stratton presented the project for first reading for demolition of a non historic carport.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas referenced the guidelines page 41 number 3 concerning fences and walls.

Bryan Green stated that he was concerned with the demolition of the carport and the nearby tree.

The applicant stated that they have contacted the city landscaping department concerning the tree.

Enid Torregrosa stated that she had spoken to Cynthia Domenech-Coogle in the landscaping department concerning the project.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

APPROVED

11 After the fact amendment to porch columns alternate design-#936 United Street- Manuel Garcia/ Wayne Garcia (H11-01-320)

Manuel Garcia reviewed the history of the project. He stated that they have produced an adequate alternative to the turned columns.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant if it was their belief that the original revisions requested were not economically feasible.

Manuel Garcia stated that within the time frame it was not economically feasible for the owner and contractor.

Daniel Metzler stated that he was stunned by the arrogance of the contractor toward the HARC Commission and the neglect of the homeowner to take action toward the deterioration of the structure.

Rudy Molinet stated that ultimately the agreement was made with the contractor Wayne Garcia and he did not comply with the Commission's decision. Furthermore the new application is not in compliance with the historic house and he is not in favor of it.

Daniel Metzler stated that the porch is extremely important to the architecture of the house.

Manuel Garcia stated that the applicant was given 2 years to complete the project and it ran into financial issues.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 32 numbers 3, 4, 7, and 16; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

12 Façade and porch renovations. Relocation of stairs for ADA accessibility-#529 United Street- **Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-321)**

Thomas Pope presented the project.

Public Comment:

Gregory Orepeza, 309 Witehead Street

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas for discussion.

Rudy Molinet asked Mr. Pope if the windows and doors were wood.

Mr. Pope stated that they were not changing the windows and the door was being replaced to a wood door.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

13 Interior and exterior renovation. Remove and replace garage with pantry addition, new pavilion and Florida room extension, new dormer and spiral stair. New pool, deck and picket fencing-#730 Southard Street- **Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-325)**

Thomas Pope presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler stated that the garage was in bad condition and he supported demolition.

Carlos Rojas and Rudy Molinet agree with staff that the garage should not be demolished.

Mr. Pope stated that he had spoken with the Building Department and they had agreed that the garage was structurally unsound.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny the demolition based on the Code of Ordinances section 102-218 A-2; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Metzler.

DENIED.

Concerning design Carlos Rojas stated that he was not in support of the spiral staircase and dormer. He added that the 3rd floor has not historically used as a bedroom.

Bryan Green stated that he was not in support of the spiral staircase and dormer.

Daniel Metzler recommended a roof scuttle to eliminate the spiral staircase for fire concerns.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was not in support of a change in the roof line.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

Proposed revisions to guidelines- Exterior colors in the historic district and installation of solar devices.

POSTPONED

HARC Planner's Report

None

Comments from Commissioners

None

Adjournment

Carlos Rojas made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

HARC March 22, 2011

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.