



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, March 8, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order Pledge of Allegiance Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the agenda; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes

1 February 8, 2011

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Action Items

Old Business

2 New bathroom facilities for Bayview Park - #1310 Truman Avenue - Bender and Associates Architects (H11-01-142)

Bert Bender presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green clarified that the color of the building is white, the elevation is above FEMA standards, and the roof color is being proposed white.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve subject to the roof color being within the approved HARC guidelines; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

3 Demolish lower loading dock and remove trailer - #201 William Street - City of Key West - John P. Castro (H11-01-154)

John Paul Castro presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

4 Demolition of one story structure and new two story building - Key West Bight - William P. Horn (H11-01-184)

William Horn presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented the staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

5 New back rear addition and new guesthouse, new pool and deck - # 921 Eaton Street - William P. Horn (H11-01-185)

William Horn presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business

6 Installation of wood deck, railing and screen fence over first floor roof - After the fact application - Code Compliance Case - #816, 818, 822 Fleming Street and #2 Scheppens Lane - Trepanier and Associates (H11-01-217)

Owen Trepanier presented the project.

Recording Secretary Patrick Wright read a letter received from Margo Alexander into the record.

Public Comment:

Susan Cardenas, Stones and Cardenas.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Ron Ramsingh reviewed that the charge of the commission was to specifically look at the application they received. He added that there is a current code compliance case pending.

Bryan Green asked Mr. Trepanier to clarify what exactly the application was referring to.

Mr. Trepanier stated that it was for the entirety of the work done. He added that they did not include the demolition of the gabled roof in this application.

Ron Ramsingh stated that the demolition of the gabled roof needs to be noticed.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone due to modification of the application until the next meeting; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

7 Replacement of doors and windows and new covered porch - #518 Elizabeth Street - Nancy Forester (H11-01-223)

Elizabeth Newland presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa stated that that the house had been moved at some point, and is listed as contributing. She added that the height had been reduced.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

8 Demolish back addition and replace with new addition, new deck and pool - #321 Catherine Street - William P. Horn (H11-01-245)

William Horn presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented the staff report.

Nil Muench made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

9 Addition to existing single family residence - #7 Sunset Key Dr. - Adele V. Stones (H11-01-249)

Ginny Stones presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented the staff report

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

10 Relocation of historic house and new addition - #616 Virginia Street - Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-250)

Michael Ingram presented the project. He is proposing relocating the historic house to preserve both the house and the old tree, demolishing non historic additions and build new one story addition

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the relocation of the structure; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

11 Enclose existing side porch, new second floor deck, roof modifications, replacement of windows and repairs to wood surfaces and deck - **#1108 Southard Street - Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-251)**

Michael Ingram presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant to clarify the position of the deck.

Michael Ingram stated that the looks toward the backyard of the property.

Daniel Metzler asked staff if the adjacent property owner was aware of the application.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the Item was noticed in The Citizen newspaper prior to the meeting.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant the types of windows that are being proposed.

Michael Ingram stated that the front visible windows would be wood and the back windows would be aluminum.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

12 Second floor addition on south east side, new windows and painting - **#1420 White Street - Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-252)**

Michael Ingram presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench asked the applicant why the stairway could not be put inside the house.

Michael Ingram stated that to put the stairway inside the house the entire house would have to be gutted.

Bryan Green stated that there were no internal layouts available.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone the Item for 30 days; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

POSTPONED

13 Demolish existing office overhang and portion of existing side porch roof. Construct new office attached to 716 South Street. Construct three turrets roofs, new fence and gate relocation of sign - **#716-718 South Street- John M. Ganton- Dennis Beebe -Solaria (H11-01-256)**

Dennis Beebe presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Owen Trepanier reviewed the history of the property.

Ron Ramsingh stated that he did not feel comfortable giving a legal opinion on the Item after Mr. Trepanier had provided new information not available to City Staff or the commission for review before the meeting.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

HARC Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa stated that she needed comments from all commissioners on the proposed guidelines regarding solar panels and colors.

Ron Ramsingh stated that he and Assistant City Manager Mark Finnegan had a meeting with Wayne Garcia and his attorney Manny Garcia concerning the code compliance case at 936 United Street. He added that they have yet to turn in a new application.

Ron Ramisingh informed the commission that they are required submit written findings when denying a demolition.

Comments from Commissioners

Nils Muench reviewed a recently approved resolution dealing with cool roof technology. Included Attachment.

Adjournment

Daniel Metzler made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 5:25 pm.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.