



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, February 22, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order Pledge of Allegiance Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Senior Planner and HARC representative Brendon Cunningham, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Brendon Cunningham stated that the applicant for Item 10 had requested to be postponed pending City Commission approval.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the agenda; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes

1 January 25, 2011

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Action Items

Old Business

2 Modification to previously approved plans (H10-01-334) for demolition of back addition and replacement- #711 Bakers Lane- Bender and Associates Architects (H11-01-106) Second reading.

David Salay presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

A motion for reconsideration for the second reading for demolition was made by Bryan Green at 3:27 PM; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

David Salay presented the second reading for demolition.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

3 Demolish existing back addition - #504-506 Catherine Street- Carlos Rojas AIA (H11-01-107) Second reading.

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Carlos Rojas presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

4 Replacement of existing front porch and construction of new addition along the front- #611 Grinnell Street Unit 1- Anthony D. Sarno / MBI-K2M Architects (H11-01-110) Second reading

Anthony Sarno presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business

5 New bathroom facilities for Bayview Park- #1310 Truman Avenue- Bender and Associates Architects (H11-01-142)

David Salay presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Nils Muench and Bryan Green expressed concern over the proposed white roof color.

David Salay stated that the white color was being used to save energy, as directed by a city resolution.

Bryan Green asked the applicant what color the walls would be painted.

David Salay stated they would be painted to match the existing Boys and Girls Club building.

Bryan Green asked why the building was being built at grade level.

David Salay stated that he was unsure on why the building was being proposed at grade level.

Nils Muench made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded for discussion by Daniel Metzler.

Carlos Rojas suggested the commission move for approval without the colors.

Ron Ramsingh clarified that the city resolution stated the use of "cool roof" technology was encouraged, not specifically white roofs.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

POSTPONED

6 Demolish lower loading dock and remove trailer- #201 William Street- City of Key West- John P. Castro (H11-01-154)

John Paul Castro presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

7 Alterations to rear addition, new skylights and new pool- #1119 Von Phister Street-Bender and Associates Architects (H11-01-160)

David Salay presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

8 Doughnut vending cart on private property- #101 Duval Street- Frank Piku (H11-01-171)

Frank Piku presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Bryan Green asked staff if the application was for approval of the cart site or approval of the cart design itself.

Brendon Cunningham explained that the application was for location of the cart.

Ron Ramsingh clarified that the application is for both location of the cart as well as the architectural design of the cart.

Rudy Molinet stated that the workshop on mobile vending helped develop a proposed guideline that staff is currently developing.

Ron Ramsingh further clarified that in the past the approval of design was tabled or approved with the understanding that after the adoption of a new guideline the applicant would have to come back to the commission and comply with new guidelines.

Nils Muench stated that creativity in the design of the cart should be the decision of the vendor and not the commission.

Rudy Molinet questioned if the other vending stands on the site had approval.

Ron Ramsingh stated that staff will forward the photos of the neighboring vending structures to Code Compliance.

Mr. Piku further clarified the position of the cart for the commissioners.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the application for the location of the cart, while postponing the decision on design; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED for location and POSTPONED for design.

9 Relocation of neon sign copy *Graffiti*- #721 Duval Street- Phil Anderton (H11-01-178)

Phil Anderton presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the project.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Nils Muench asked the applicant if the sign was larger than the existing glass window.

Mr. Anderton stated that he measured the transom and the sign will fit at the new location.

Rudy Molinet stated that the guidelines apply to new signs, and the sign would be less intrusive than the previous location.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the relocation of the neon sign; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas.

APPROVED

- 10 Demolition of one story structure and new two story building- **Key West Bight- William P. Horn (H11-01-184)**

POSTPONED

- 11 New back rear addition and new guesthouse, new pool and deck- # **921 Eaton Street William P. Horn (H11-01-185)**

William Horn presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented the staff report.

Carlos Rojas stated that the proposed addition is consistent with the guidelines.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

HARC Planner's Report

Comments from Commissioners

Ron Ramsingh stated that the homeowner and contractor are currently working on putting together a new application for 936 United Street.

Mr. Greene asked for an update on the code case for the containers at 1105 Simonton Street.

Ron Ramsingh stated that a notice of code violation has been issued.

Adjournment

Nils Muench made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.