



**City of Key West
Tree Commission Meeting
May 11, 2009
510 Greene Street, Old City Hall, 5:00 PM
Minutes**

1. Call Meeting to Order

2. Roll Call

Tree Commissioners:

 x **Julio Barroso - Acting Chair**

 x **Danilo Crespo**

 x **Gregory Curry**

5:15 x **Mimi McCoy Grantham**

 - **Sandra Lee – Chairperson**

 x **Rudy Molinet**

 - **Niels Weise**

Staff:

5:15 x **Ronald Ramsingh**

Asst. City Attorney

 x **Cynthia Domenech-Coogle**

Urban Forestry Program Manager

 x **Gladys Abreda**

Administrative Secretary

3. Approval of the Agenda

(a) Additions/Changes:

Mr. Curry and staff requested time for discussion at end of agenda. Staff requested change to application item 6.(b), 1709 Atlantic Blvd. from Seagrape heavy maintenance to removal as per owner with letter.

Motion to accept the change Mr. Molinet; second Mr. Crespo

4. Presentations

Urban Forestry Program Manager Report

Cynthia Domenech-Coogle reported on:

City's Cemetery: thanking the Trophia Foundation's donation of 10, 15'-18' Sabal palms planted in corridor design on 2nd and 3rd Avenues and Native Landscape Design for planting 7 on 1st Avenue

Southernmost Pt. planting of 7, 13'-15' Sabal palms and numerous Crinum Lilies as well as painting the monument and converting planter into a bench.

Tree's Florida Annual Conference, will be held in Key West next June. Trees Florida is the combination of the FL Chapter International Society of Arboriculture and the FL Urban Forestry Council annual conferences. Key West hosted the conference in '04 and was the largest attended conference since inception. The conference board unanimously voted to return to Key West next year, 2010. Domenech-Coogle requested the Tree Commission to assist in preparation for conference.

Glen Martin of Martin's Tree Trimming – has been fined by the CODE ENFORCEMENT SPECIAL MAGISTRATE, in the amount of \$12,650.00, due to violating the Tree Protection Ordinances.

Mr. Molinet stated appreciation for plantings at Southernmost Pt. and that a dedication ceremony should be held at the Cemetery.

5. Approval of Minutes

(a) May 14, 2007

(b) September 10, 2007

(c) April 13, 2009

Motion to table minutes until next meeting: Mr. Molinet, second Mrs. McCoy-Grantham.

6. Resolutions Tabled Items:

(a) **1319 Olivia Street, Paul Tripp:** Represented by Havlicek Stump Grinding. Remove 2 Spanish Lime trees.

() **Approved** () **Denied** (**x**) **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: tabled by applicant until July/13/2009 meeting.

Motion to table: Mr. Curry, second Mrs. McCoy-Grantham

(b) **1709 Atlantic Blvd, Bruce L Boros MD:** Heavy Maintenance to Seagrape tree.

(**x**) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Dr. Boros requested removal of Seagrape tree in writing,

Tree has columns of decay at root flare and is damaging perimeter a wall.

No public input.

Motion to Approve Removal: Mrs. McCoy Grantham, second Mr. Curry; unanimous

Replacements: 15 caliper inches of native canopy trees of choice, Fl #1 to be planted on site and planted in the six months from the approval date as described here in. All plants shall be planted according to current 'Best Management Practices'.

7. Resolutions:

(a) **2915 Fogarty Ave, Frank Duponty:** Remove (1) Mahogany tree.

Approved Denied Tabled Further Action

Notes: Applicant not in attendance

Motion to table: Mr. Molinet, second Mrs. McCoy-Grantham

(b) **911 Fleming Street, Craig Amato:** Represented by Ken King/Bough Service. Remove (1) Rubber tree.

Approved Denied Tabled Further Action

Notes: Mr. Molinet recused himself.

Discussion: Previously trimmed by another tree company, laterals trimmed to the trunk as requested by the owner, Mr. Amato, for construction.

Domenech-Coogle: letter was sent to owner with notification of caliper inch replacement of 152.7 inches.

Mr. King requested Tree Commission to 'give a break to the homeowner' because of such large replacement requirement.

Discussion: Mrs. McCoy Grantham; tree is not native but terrible loss for island; Mr. Curry; large amount of replacement inches for the size of lot and still wanting to build; Ms. McCoy Grantham asked if there was a landscape plan as the amount of tree replacement inches would cause Mr. Amato to return in future asking to remove replacement trees.

Staff requested Tree Commission to consider tabling issue as the application is for 911 Fleming and tree is on Margaret Street lot. The application was filed with incorrect address.

No public input

Motion to Table: Mr. Crespo, second Mrs. McCoy-Grantham to submit application of physical address of tree.

(c) **830 Truman Avenue, El Rancho Motel:** Represented by Ashish Soni or Gonzalez Architect. Remove (11) Areca Palms, (1) Coconut Palm, (2) Fishtail Palms, (25) Christmas Palms and (6) Queen Palms.

Approved Denied Tabled Further Action

Notes: Gonzalez Architects represented El Rancho Motel development.

Public input; Sharon Wells asked if the palms could be transplanted.

Staff suggests not to transplant due to their condition. Mr. Molinet requested owners to retain palms until Building permit is issued. Owners agreed.

Motion to approve removal: Mr. Curry, second Mrs. McCoy-Grantham, to remove 45 palms with 45 native palm replacement, FL #1, minimum 4', to be planted on site. In addition to retain palms until Building Dept. issues Building permit.

- (d) **1016 Duval Street, Stephen Selka:** Represented by Dar Castillo/Affiliated Design. Remove (3) Spanish Lime trees, (1) China Berry tree, (1) Mahogany tree, (1) Gumbo Limbo and maintenance (1) Mahogany tree.
(x) Approved () Denied () Table () Further Action

Notes:

Discussion: Ms. Dar Castillo represented owner, stating Mahogany is lifting the foundation of the house,
Staff gave tree by tree condition report: summing that all trees requested to be removed are in poor condition.

No public input.

Motion to approve removal: Mr. Crespo, second Mr. Curry to remove 3 Spanish Lime trees, 1 Chinaberry tree, 1 Gumbo Limbo tree, 1 Mahogany tree and maintenance of (1) Mahogany tree with 57.4 caliper inches of native canopy tree replacement, Fl#1, to be planted on site and planted in the six months from the approval date as described here in. All plants shall be planted according to current 'Best Management Practices'.

- (e) **830 Truman Avenue, Tejas Inc.:** Represented by Ashish Soni or Gonzalez Architect. Landscape Plan Approval.
(x) Approved () Denied () Table () Further Action

Notes: Gonzalez Architect represented owners El Rancho Motel.
Staff stated entire landscape is native.

No public input

Motion to approve Landscape plan: Mr. Molinet, second Mrs. McCoy-Grantham.

- (f) **417 Eaton Street, Joseph Cohen:** Represented by Dan's Tropical Tree Service. Remove (1) Poinciana tree.
(x) Approved () Denied () Table () Further Action

Notes: Mr. Dan Kramer represented owner, Tree Commissioners and owner did not receive replacement letter.

Discussion: Mr. Kramer stated tree is on the property line and the neighbor trimmed half of tree.

Mr. Molinet requested for a determination from Assistant City Attorney Mr. Ramsingh if it was ok to approve and make a motion without replacement letter. Mr. Barroso asked staff if there is a replacement letter to which she responded there was and recollects the replacement inch requirement to be 10.2. Mr. Ramsingh replied a motion can be made based on contingency and verification of replacement inches and to provide copy of the replacement letter to the tree commissioners.

No public input

Motion to approve removal: Mr. Molinet, Mr. Curry second. Contingent upon a copy of the replacement letter to Tree Commission. Replacements: 11.4 caliper inches of native canopy trees, Fl#1, to be planted on site, and planted in the six months from the approval date as described here in. All plants shall be planted according to current 'Best Management Practices'.

- (g) **3730 Sunrise Lane, George Robb:** Represented by Colin White. Transplant Lignum Vitae tree.

(x) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. White stated there may be a water leak under the tree. Staff stated the Lignum Vitae tree is very drought tolerant and appears to be in decline due to the constant dampness.

No public input

Motion to approve transplant: Ms. McCoy Grantham, second Mr. Molinet to transplant Lignum Vitae tree with one year survivability. If tree dies it must be replace with 2" diameter Lignum Vitae tree.

- (h) **619 Thomas Street, Nola Keenan:** Represented by Paul Cox. Remove Tamarind tree.

(x) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: The Tamarind tree is partially in the proposed off street parking area uprooted from past storm. Mr. Cox acknowledged the 11" inches of replacement.

No public input.

Motion to approve removal: Mrs. McCoy-Grantham, second Mr. Crespo with 11 caliper inches native canopy trees, Fl #1, to be planted on site.

- (i) **1525 Kennedy Drive, Fire Station #3, City of Key West:** Transplant 5 Gumbo Limbo trees.

(x) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Fire Department is constructing a training area.

Motion to amend action: Mr. Curry, Mrs. McCoy-Grantham second. Change from transplanting 5 Gumbo Limbo trees to transplant 4 Gumbo Limbo trees and 1 Spanish Lime tree.

No public input

Motion to approve removals and transplants: Mr. Curry, Mr. Crespo second, to remove Spanish Lime and Gumbo Limbo tree #1, and transplant Gumbo Limbos #2, 3 and 4. Replacements: 9.7 caliper inches of native canopy trees, Fl #1, to be planted on site. Transplanted trees shall have 1 year survivability or replace with 13.8 caliper inches of native canopy trees, FL#1, to be planted on site. Mr. Molinet requested replacements be planted on Kennedy Drive fence line for buffer.

(j) **1024-1028 Truman Avenue, City of Key West:** Remove (4) Satin Leaf trees. Requested by shop owners.

(x) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: (4) shop owners attended from 1024-1028 Truman Avenue.

Discussion: Staff; trees were planted during the reconstruction of Truman – Whitehead corridor by DOT. All (4) Satin Leaf trees were damaged during hurricanes of, '98, '04, '05

Public input: Ms. Sharon Wells resides at 1023 Truman Ave. She is also speaking for shop owner next to her house, Bill from Waldenbooks. Ms. Wells discussed complaining 5 years ago, to no avail. Ms. Wells thanked staff and Tree Commission as the state does not seem interested in the problem. Problem are the berries, that it is impossible to keep the sidewalks clean, bicycles and pedestrians fall, slipping on the crushed berries and dragging the berries in to stores and homes on shoes. Shop owner Mr. Ed Clark, from 1018 Truman Ave. was saying that this part of Truman is the worst looking place in Key West as 3 or 4 times a year he pressure washes sidewalk because of condition of sidewalk.

Mr. Molinet asked staff who would pay for replacement and would like to replace the trees as soon as possible, we should make it a priority,

Mr. Barroso said staff should make recommendation to the State concerning replacements like the trees already on Truman Ave.

Motion to approve removal: Mrs. McCoy-Grantham, second Mr. Molinet. Remove (4) Satin Leaf trees with replacements of 18.5' caliper inches of native canopy trees, Fl #1, in same location.

8. Administrative Hearing

none

9. Champion Tree Nomination:

none

10. Discussion Items:

Staff reported the city has replaced 5 Buccaneer palms, 2 *Thrinax radiata* palms and 3 *Thrinax morrisii* palms for city's replacement requirement. Staff also discussed the Trees' Florida Conference coming to Key West next June.

Staff described determination letter from Code Compliance Special Master regarding Glen Martin and damages to trees at 709 Washington Street.

Staff discussed Second Quarter Tree Commission funds.

Mr. Molinet commented how great the Southernmost Point looks

Mr. Curry congratulated Julio Barroso, for the successful TREE GIVE AWAY,

11. Staff and Emergency Approval Permits

- (a) **1325 Simonton Street**, Eillen Masiello: Remove (1) Coconut Palm. **Permit #5304**
- (b) **2927 Staples Ave**, Nancy D'Amato: Remove (1) Queen Palm. **Permit #5305**
- (c) **612 & 616 Olivia Street**, Unity of Title: Remove (2) Coconut Palms and transplant (3) Foxtail Palms. **Permit#5306**
- (d) **601 Front Street, Hyatt/Hotel**: Remove (1) Washingtonia Palm. **Permit #5307**
- (e) **3 Higgs Lane**, David A. and Judith L. Desciteau: Remove (1) Coconut Palm and (2) Alexander Palms. **Permit # 5308**
- (f) **406 Porter Court**, Deborah Schlein: Remove (1) Washingtonia Palm **Permit #5309**
- (g) **1019 Varela Street**, Irene Hinden: Remove (1) Coconut Palm. **Permit #5310**
- (h) **323 Whitehead Street/600 Bldg.** Julie Crane: Remove (1) Coconut Palm. **Permit #5311**
- (i) **1022 Catherine Street**, Clark & Jean Sahnnon: Transplant (2) Christmas Palms. **Permit #5312**