



**City of Key West
Tree Commission Meeting
April 13, 2009
510 Greene Street, Old City Hall, 5:00 PM
Minutes**

1. Call Meeting to Order

2. Roll Call

Tree Commissioners:

 x **Julio Barroso**
 x **Danilo Crespo**
 x **Gregory Curry**
 x **Mimi McCoy Grantham**
 x **Sandra Lee – Chairperson**
 x **Rudy Molinet**
 x **Niels Weise**

Staff:

 x **Ronald Ramsingh**
 Asst. City Attorney
 x **Cynthia Domenech-Coogle**
 Urban Forestry Program Manager
 - **Gladys Abreda**
 Administrative Secretary

3. Approval of the Agenda

(a) **Additions/Changes:** none

4. Presentations

Urban Forestry Program Manager Report

Staff discussed office relocation on Monday 04-13-09, to Public Works facility at 633 Palm Ave. and encouraged Tree Commissioners to visit new location.

Planting has commenced to replace the 16 removed Washingtonias by planting (5) Buccaneers palms (2) Coccothrinax argentata, (4) Thrinax morrisii, and (5) Thrinax radiata will be planted. (6) Sabal Palms donated by Native Design will be planted next week. In conjunction with Arbor Day the Trophia Foundation will plant (10) Sabal palms.

5. Approval of Minutes

(a) **May 14, 2007**

(b) **September 10, 2007**

(c) **March 09, 2009**

Motion to table Minutes for May 14, 2007 and September 2007 Ms. McCoy-Grantham, second Mr. Weise.

Ms. Lee referenced minutes for March 09, 2009, item 7-F

1319 Olivia Street, corrected to state imminent danger was there, she and staff inspected trees and they, on site, made the recommendation to issue and 'emergency approval'.

Motion to approve the minutes for March 9, 2009, with correction, Ms. McCoy-Grantham, second Mr. Weise.

6. Resolutions Tabled Items:

(a) **1319 Olivia Street, Paul Tripp:** Represented by Havlicek Stump Grinding. Remove 2 Spanish Lime trees.

() **Approved** () **Denied** (**x**) **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Ms. Susan Cardenas, attorney, from Stone & Cardenas represented Mr. Tripp. Discussion regarding diseased Spanish Lime trees.

Mr. Havlicek and Ms. Domenech-Coogle, were sworn in by Ms. Lee-chair, Tree Commission Chair

Discussion of collecting samples from Mr. Havlicek. Results were Armillaria and Wood Rot Fungus. Domenech-Coogle discussed history concerning property and prior removed trees and subsequent landscaping involving added soil to root systems of Spanish Lime trees.

Discussion of current condition of trees.

Due to Ordinance Sec.110-330, Sub 4, 5 and 6, the trees shall be removed due to disease. Request of owner to submit a landscape tree replacement plan.

Motion to table until the July 13 meeting Rudy Molinet, second Mimi

McCoy-Grantham. Gregory Curry (yes), Rudy Molinet (yes), Mimi McCoy-Grantham (yes), Sandra Lee (yes), Danilo Crespo (yes). Niels Weise (yes) and Julio Barroso (no).

7. Resolutions:

(a) **700-714 Thomas Street, Bahama Gardens, LTD:** Represented by Larry Busloff/Leaping Lizard Tree Service. Remove (1) Avocado tree.

(**x**) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Tabled** () **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. Larry Busloff said that the Avocado tree has been hatracked and it is full of holes in the trunk. Homeowner wants to build in same location as tree.

Replacements: 7.7 caliper inches, native canopy trees of choice Fl # 1

Motion to approve the removal- Mr. Curry, second Mr. Molinet.

- (b) **3323 Donald Avenue, Buttonwood Court:** Represented by John Mumford/Details Landscaping. Remove (1) Green Buttonwood tree.
(x) **Approved** () **Denied** () **Tabled** () **Further Action**
Notes: Mr. Mumford discussed tree roots causing problems with neighbors' property, lifting fence and under back porch. Staff concurs. Mr. Weise discussed appropriate address of tree being on association common ground.
Replacements: 9 caliper inches, native canopy trees of choice, Fl #1.
Motion to Approve Mr. Weise, second Mr. Barroso.
- (c) **612-616 Olivia, Thorpe McKenzie:** Represented by Craig Reynolds Landscape Architect. Transplant (5) Royal Palms on site.
(x) **Approved**() **Denied** () **Tabled** () **Further Action**
Notes: Mr. Craig Reynolds discussed relocation of Royal Palms on site. Mr. Weise asked staff if the palms would survive transplant. Staff responded in the affirmative and that if the trees died within one year they would have to be replaced with like size and will be stipulated in the permit.
No public input.
Motion to approve transplant of (5) Royal Palms on site with 1 year survivability, Mr. Curry, second Mr. Weise.
- (d) **3601 Northside Drive, Asset Holdings Group, LP:** Represented by Larry Busloff/Leaping Lizard Tree Service. Remove (1) Mahogany tree.
(x) **Approved**() **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**
Notes: Mr. Busloff discussed tree has multiple included bark branches and will be fail in a small wind event, Staff agreed.
No public input
Replacements: 14 caliper inches of native canopy trees of choice, Fl #1 to be planted on site.
Motion to approve Mr. Weise, second Mr. Barroso.
- (e) **517 Grinnell Street, Rudy Molinet & Harry Hoehn:** Represented by Larry Busloff/Leaping Lizard Tree Service. Remove (7) Breadfruit trees and (6) Spanish Lime trees.
(x) **Approved**() **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**
Notes: Mr. Molinet recused himself from dais noting it as his property. Mr. Busloff stated Spanish Limes trees were very small and probably less than 10 years old. Roots are in the utility lines (water, sewer and overhead lines). Breadfruit trees severely damaged from past storms and showing signs of decay. Ms. Lee discussed what replacements will be made due to the large amount of caliper inches of replacement trees.
Mr. Molinet and Mr. Hoehn new homeowners of 517 Grinnell Street intend to remove all concrete in the yard and hire a landscape architect to design and plant native, Fl# 1, species rarely seen in Key West.
No public input
Replacements: 63.5 caliper inches, native canopy trees of choice, Fl#1

Motion to approve Mr. Curry, second Mr. Barroso

- (f) **515 Frances Street, C.W. Carr:** Represented by Ken King/Golden Bough Tree Service. Remove (2) Spanish Lime trees.

Approved **Denied** **Table** **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. Ken King stated he trimmed these trees 20 years ago, they are now overlifted and overthinned and show signs of decay. The property changed ownership only several years ago.

Staff discussed prior history of property. In 2003 there were 7 Spanish Limes trees and over the years, with permitting, have been reduced to 3.

One tree is dead. Additional soil and rocks have been placed around the trees through a landscape installer causing root decay.

No public input,

Mr. Rudy Molinet suggested since there is no room left to plant more trees on the property that the homeowner mitigate \$150.00 per inch of replacement and plant trees in the neighborhood.

Replacements: 38 diameter inches of native canopy trees of choice Fl #1

Motion to approve Mr. Molinet, second Ms. McCoy-Grantham owner will donate \$150.00 per inch

- (g) **1125 VonPhister Street, John and Wendy Cooke:** Represented by Kenneth King/Golden Bough Tree Service. Remove (1) Poinciana Tree.

Approved **Denied** **Table** **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. King discussed trees condition and states tree is growing on city property extending over private driveway,

Ms. Lee said stated we need more information and a determination of whos tree.

Staff stated if the tree is in right of way the city will remove tree.

**Motion to table Ms. McCoy Grantham until staff can determine ownership
Second Mr. Curry.**

- (h) **628 Grinnell Street, Carla Curtis:** Represented by Scott Montgomery. Native Landscape Design. Transplant (1) Thatch Palm on site.

Approved **Denied** **Table** **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. Scott stated homeowner wants to relocate driveway to Angela Street. where the Thrinax radiata is planted. Palm will be root pruned for better survival.

No public input

Motion to approve the transplant Mr. Barroso, with one year of survivability, second Mr. Weise.

- (i) **Roosevelt C. Sands Jr., Housing Complex; Housing Authority:** Represented by Scott Montgomery, Native Landscape Design. Landscape plan approval.

Approved **Denied** **Table** **Further Action**

Notes: Discussion regarding plans and dimensions not on plans.

Mr. Montgomery noted plans had been revised several times. Discussion regarding property size and open space.

Ms. Lee stated the project is state funded and needed to be fast tracked.

Cont. Pg. 5 TC Minutes 04/13/09

Mr. Montgomery stated the landscaping will be 100% native and very diverse with the trees at 12 feet. Staff noted compliance.

Motion to accept plan for Roosevelt Sands Jr. Housing Complex, Ms. McCoy-Grantham, second Mr. Barroso

- (j) **1709 Atlantic Blvd, Bruce L Boros MD:** Heavy Maintenance to Seagrape tree.
() **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Applicant not in attendance.

Motion to table Mr. Curry, second Mr. Barroso

8. Administrative Hearing

- (a) **1609 Patricia Street, Lynn Kephart:** Tree trimming and removals without permits.

() **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. Kephart stated he had the property rented and tenant requested more light into the yard. His maintenance man was the one who did the trimming and removing, unfortunately he was out of town when it happened. He is willing to take and accept compliance settlement agreement.

Discussion of length of time to prune trees back into trees again

Ms. Lee suggested to Mr. Kephart a journal be kept and submitted to staff yearly by an ISA Certified Arborist regarding progress of trees. Staff has current pictures.

No public input

Motion: Ms. Grantham requested the ISA Certified Arborist work on trees and keep a journal for compliance settlement agreement requirements, for 10 years, to be reviewed and submitted to staff yearly, second Mr. Molinet,

Commission vote for Settlement Agreement: Mr. Barroso (no), Mr. Molinet (yes), Ms. Lee (yes), Mr. Crespo (yes), Mr. Curry (yes), Ms. McCoy-Grantham (yes) and Mr. Weise (yes)

Mr. Molinet commented on record is nice to see an applicant to stand up for his right and care for trees.

- (b) **1221 3rd Street, Deutsche Bank National Trust;** Tree removals without permits.

() **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Unfounded as current owner did not remove tree and

Mr. Barroso reported conflict of interest he knows Ms. Nancy Cruz and her family for long time he excluded himself. no vote.

- (c) **1319 Duval Street, Olde Town Resorts, Inc.** Tree trimming without permits.

() **Approved** () **Denied** () **Table** () **Further Action**

Notes: Staff discussed proper trimming of palm trees.

Aladdin Landscape admitted pruning and apologized

No public input.

Cont. Pg. 6 TC Minutes 04/13/09

Motion: Ms. McCoy-Grantham to have Southernmost Hotel have Aladdin Landscape secure his ISA Certification in 1 year. Second Mr. Molinet with a friendly amendment that if any trees die as a consequence of the pruning that they be replaced, Mr. Babich agreed with the Compliance Settlement agreement.

9. Champion Tree Nomination:

10. 'Trees Florida', Annual Conference and Trade Show

The tree commissioners attending are: Mr. Crespo, Ms. McCoy-Grantham, Ms. Lee and Mr. Molinet.

June 14-16, 2009 Sarasota, FL

Native Conference Mr. Curry and Mr. Crespo

Held in May/2009

(x) Approved () Denied

Approved Unanimous.

11. Discussion Items: none

12. Staff and Emergency Approval Permits

(a) 3709 Pearlman Ct, Barbara Hoffman: Remove (2) Coconut palms.

Permit #5295

(b) 822 Washington Street, Joseph Famularo: Remove (1) Coconut palm.

Permit #5296

(c) 823 Johnson Lane, Dean Townsend: Remove (1) Coconut palm.

Permit# 5297

(d) 714 Olivia Street, Gene Giancombo: Remove (1) Coconut palm.

Permit #5298

(e) 1529 White Street, Terri & Adrian Goodrich: Remove (1) Coconut palm. **Permit #5299**

(f) 1119 Royal Street, Brian & Debbie Arnold: Remove (1) Coconut palm

Permit #5300

(g) 700-714 Thomas Street, Steven A. Justi: Remove (2) Coconut palms

Permit # 5301

(h) 1319 Olivia Street, Paul Tripp: Remove (2) Spanish Lime trees.

Permit # 5302

(i) 1214 Varela Street, John Woods: Remove (2) Foxtail Palms. **Permit #5303**

Adjourn: Mr. Weise, second Mr. Barroso