



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, October 26, 2010

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order

Pledge of Allegiance

Roll Call

Board members present included Bryan Green, Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, and Vice Chairman Rudy Molinet who in lack of a Chairman is the acting Chairman for this meeting.

Approval of Agenda

Enid Torregrosa stated that New Business Items 5 and 6 have been postponed.

Rudy Molinet clarified with staff on when the election of a new Chairman and Vice Chairman would take place.

Bryan Green made a motion to put the election of a new Chair and Vice Chair on the agenda for the next meeting; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes

1 September 14, 2010

Recording secretary Patrick Wright clarified that the two minor spelling corrections have been made, and after researching the meeting audio the motion on Item 5 was correctly stated in the originally submitted minutes.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried

2 September 28, 2010

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried

Action Items**Old Business**

- 3 Request for demolition of existing additions on the rear and second floor, new one story kitchen and porch, add new dormers, new doors and site improvements - # **426 Elizabeth Street - Applicant David Salay Architect, Bender and Associates (H10-01-474)**

David Salay presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa stated that this is the second reading for demolition. Mrs. Torregrosa stated that the applicant had revised the plans and they are now consistent with the guidelines.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the plans; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

APPROVED

New Business

- 4 Request to install new handrails at deck and new 6'-0" high wood fence- #**1000 Eaton Street- Applicant Michael Skoglund, Architect (H10-01-504)**

Michael Skoglund presented the project. He stated they planned on replacing the existing handrails with a newly proposed handrail.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that the handrail is not in compliance with the guidelines, she added that the 6 ft picket fence was also not consistent with the guidelines.

Nils Muench made a motion to table to allow the applicant to bring the plans into compliance; the motion was seconded for discussion by Bryan Green. Mr. Green stated that the raised platform is at the root of staff's concerns and the applicant should consider if its retention is necessary. Motion Carried

TABLED

- 5 Request to demolish part of building and built a second story - #**710 Bakers Lane- Applicant- Michael Skoglund, Architect (H10-01-506)**

POSTPONED

- 6 Request to install mechanical equipment through roof and built secure railings - #**1000 Eaton Street - Applicant Michael Skoglund, Architect (H10-01-514)**

POSTPONED

- 7 Request to demolish non historic rear additions and replace with new two story addition. Renovations to historic main house and elevate it 8" for FEMA requirements- **#319 Amelia Street- Applicant Thomas E. Pope, Architect (H10-01-526)**

Thomas Pope presented the project. He proposed an addition that would have a narrower footprint than the original historic structure. He stated they are proposing the minimal addition to meet the requirements. He added that there are a number of other two story buildings in the vicinity of the proposed addition.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that this is the first reading for demolition. She stated that the proposed structure to be demolished is non historic and can be considered by the board. She added that the mass and scale of the newly proposed addition is not in compliance with the guidelines.

Nils Muench stated that he would like to know how much of the structure is going to be replaced.

Carlos Rojas stated this is about as small of an addition as he would feel comfortable approving.

Daniel Metzler stated that he was in support of the addition.

Rudy Molinet stated that he felt the addition was not consistent with the mass and scale of the neighborhood.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny the design based on the guidelines on page 37; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioners Metzler and Rojas.

DENIED

Nils Muench made a motion to deny the demolition based on page 39 section 2; it was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas.

DENIED

- 8 Request to built a stair for third floor level egress to the back of the building-**#715 Duval Street- Applicant Michael B. Ingram, Architect (H10-01-531).**

Michael Ingram presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that the plans were consistent with the guidelines.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried

9 Request to remove storefront and install full light doors and steps in front of the building- #1100 Duval Street- Applicant One Call Construction (H10-01-533)

David Pouliot presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that the proposed design is not in compliance with the guidelines.

Nil Muench made a motion to deny; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

10 Request to replace doors and windows, new swimming pool at side- #417 Truman Avenue- Applicant Thomas E. Kelly (H10-01-535)

Thomas Kelly presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated that the swimming pool does not have the minimum 5 ft setbacks. Mrs. Torregrosa added that the deck already exceeds 50% of the lot coverage minus the foot print, and the windows do not comply with HARC guidelines.

Bryan Green asked the Assistant City attorney Larry Erskine if the Commission was to approve the application would unapproved existing aspects of the plans tie into that approval. He also noted that there was an issue with impervious surface.

Carlos Rojas reviewed the Commissions previous path of action concerning the question Commissioner Green presented to Mr. Erskine.

Larry Erskine clarified for Mr. Green that if there was a previously unapproved aspect of the site that did not involve the application or would not directly affect the approval than the Commission's approval would not rectify the unapproved portion. He added that if the unapproved aspect of the plans was directly affected by the applications approval it should be referred to Code Enforcement.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to table so that the applicant could coordinate with staff; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green for discussion.

Rudy Molinet clarified with Mr. Erskine on the legal interpretation of the difference between tabling and postponing an item.

Carlos Rojas and Bryan Green withdrew the motion and the second. Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone the item; it was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

POSTPONED

- 11** Request to remove existing carport, replace concrete porch with wood, replace metal windows with wood windows and install 4' wood picket fence with cutouts- **#1124 Eaton Street- Applicant Thomas E. Kelly (H10-01-536)**

Thomas Kelley presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. She stated the demolition of the carport would need two readings. She added that the porch was non historic and the historic photo should be considered when building the new porch. Mrs. Torregrosa stated the proposed pineapple cut-outs on the fence were not consistent with the guidelines.

Nils Muench made a motion to postpone the approval of design; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Bryan Green stated that since this item was coming back for a second reading for demolition it was not necessary to postpone.

Carlos Rojas stated that he believed the historic front porch and windows should be built back to their historic appearance.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Vice Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 12** Request to demolish non contributing structure, former Navy guard/ gate house as requested by the Navy- **End of Southard Street, Truman Waterfront- Applicant The City of Key West- Doug Bradshaw(H10-01-544).**

Doug Bradshaw presented the project. He stated that the structure was planning to be demolished because it impedes Navy vehicle traffic.

Public comment:

The following Public Comments were read into the record by recording secretary Patrick Wright:

Richard Talmadge

Ty Symroski

Christine Russell 1014 Grinnell Street

Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff Report. She stated this was the first reading for demolition. She stated that the building was built after the base was closed and can be reviewed for demolition by the board.

Nils Muench expressed concern over demolishing the structure.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant if the structure was included in the plans for the proposed Meisel-Spottswood Truman Waterfront development. Doug Bradshaw stated that it was not included in those plans.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench.

APPROVED

13 Request to add doors and window on previous openings-#422 Front Street- Applicant William P. Horn, Architect (H10-01-547)

William Horn presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff Report. She stated that plans comply with the guidelines, but the bricks being removed should be kept for future restoration.

Nils Muench asked the applicant how they planned on safely removing the brick.

Bill Horn stated that they would hire a qualified mason. He then reviewed the plans with the commissioners.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

14 Motion to rescind previous Certificate of Appropriateness, sponsored by Commissioner Rudy Molinet-#936 United Street Applicant Wayne Garcia(H10-01-245)- Replace porch and balcony posts with 6" by 6" replicas, as to photo submitted. Replace railing with same.

Larry Erskine stated that there is a time limit on when the board can rescind an approval. He added that if Commissioner Molinet were to pass the gavel someone would have to be appointed as Vice Chairman for this portion of the meeting.

Carlos Rojas volunteered to be Vice Chairman; Bryan Green seconded this motion. Motion Carried.

Rudy Molinet reviewed the history of the project and discussed the possibility of rescinding this approval.

Larry Erskine reviewed the legal ramifications of rescinding the approval.

Nils Muench questioned the commission's ability to give conditional approvals.

The following Public Comments were read into the record by recording secretary Patrick Wright:

Michael Miller

Ken Ducote

Brian Green made a motion to request that the City Attorney pursue all available avenues to seek the earliest compliance for HARC Approval number H10-01-245; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench for discussion. Rudy Molinet proposed an amendment to the motion that a specific time line be set for compliance. Bryan Green accepted the motion and amended the motion to read: a motion to request that the City Attorney pursue all available avenues to seek the compliance within 30 days for HARC Approval number H10-01-245. Nils Muench seconded the amended motion.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Rudy Molinet made a motion to rescind item number 14 on the agenda; it was seconded Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Green, Metzler, Muench, Rojas and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

HARC Planner's Report

Comments from Commissioners

The commissioners discussed how to decrease the volume of the agendas.

Adjournment

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.