



## City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall  
510 Greene Street  
Key West, FL 33040

# Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

---

Tuesday, January 25, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

---

**ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.**

### **Call to Order Pledge of Allegiance Roll Call**

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Greene and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation planner Enid Torregrosa, IT support John Padron, Recording Secretary Patrick Wright, and Code Compliance Manager Jim Young.

### **Approval of Agenda**

Enid Torregrosa stated that Item 3 has been withdrawn, and that the applicant for Item 5 has requested postponement until the February 8, 2011 meeting.

Bryan Greene made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

### **Approval of Minutes**

#### **1 December 28, 2010**

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

### **Action Items**

#### **Old Business**

#### **2 Addition of new antennas and equipment on existing monopole- #525-527 Southard Street- Velocitel Inc. (H10-01-353)**

Doug Fulcher presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Greene asked for clarification on how landscape plans would be enforced. Ron Ramsingh stated that the approval would be subject to code violations if granted. Enid Torregrosa added that the landscape plans would have to go through the City Landscape division.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant what kind of wood he would be using.

Doug Fulcher stated they would most likely use pressure treated pine.

Bryan Greene made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Greene and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 3** New carport/ porch and remodel side of new addition to reconfigure windows- **#313 Truman Avenue-Schroeder Builders (H10-01-824)**

WITHDRAWN

- 4** Demolition of shed in rear- **#504-506 Catherine Street- Carlos Rojas - Second reading (H10-01-829)**

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Carlos Rojas presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Greene and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

#### **New Business**

- 5** Second story addition on rear-**#416 White Street- Wayne Smith, William Rowan, Susan Atkins (H10-01-764)**

POSTPONED

- 6** Two story addition on rear, revisions to approved plans- **#907-909 Emma Street- Gary Burchfield (H11-01-004)**

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Gary Burchfield presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Greene expressed concern that the addition would have a dominating presence over the contributing structure.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant why the Gazebo was higher than the existing structure. Gary Burchfield stated that he was open to lowering the height.

Rudy Molinet expressed concern over the height of the addition. He clarified with legal that if the project was approved it would purge the old approval.

Bryan Greene stated that lowering the pitch could cause problems concerning the proportions.

Mr. Burchfield stated he thought the lower pitch created a better balance.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve with the stipulation that the front Gazebo height be lowered to the line of face of the main house's front porch, and that the applicant understands that they are foregoing their prior approval; the motion was seconded by Bryan Greene for discussion.

Enid Torregrosa stated that the window proportions do not match the windows depicted for the main house.

Mr. Burchfield stated that he can change the proportions of the windows on the first floor, but the second floor would need to go to a single window.

Daniel Metzler withdrew his motion.

Bryan Greene made a motion to postpone so that the applicant can come back with accurate drawings of proposed changes; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Greene and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**7 New pergola on rear of property-#623 Fleming Street- Gary Burchfield (H11-01-005)**

Gary Burchfield presented the project.

No public comment

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on page 40 guideline 1 of the guidelines; Bryan Green seconded the motion for discussion.

Gary Burchfield requested that the commission provide recommendations.

Bryan Greene requested that the footprint of the pergola should match the footprint of the cistern.

Nils Muench withdrew his motion to deny.

Nils Muench made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Bryan Greene. Motion carried.

POSTPONED

**8 New concrete slabs- Code Compliance Case- #1105 Simonton Street- Frank Ratcliff (H11-01-047)**

Frank Ratcliff presented the project. He stated that he had poured concrete slabs to put steel containers on.

Public comment:

Patrick Wright read 1 letter of concern into the record.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report

Bryan Greene clarified that the application was for the concrete slabs. He stated that the use of the yard was light industrial and he would support the application.

Nils Muench cited page 41 paragraph 12 of the guidelines.

Mr. Ratcliff stated that the steel containers are temporary storage structures.

Nils Muench stated that the approval of the pads concern the fact that the steel containers are against the guidelines and degrade from the historic neighborhood.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant if the zoning allowed a building on the property line.

Mr. Ratcliff explained that the containers are not buildings, but are temporary structures with occupational licenses allowing them to be placed anywhere on the property.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant if he had considered putting a solid 8 ft wall around the property.

Mr. Ratcliff stated he considered a wrought iron fence, but he was open to suggestions.

Jim Young stated that a complaint came through the Code Compliance department that the applicant was installing concrete pads without HARC approval or building permits. He stated that the Mr. Metzler's comment concerning setbacks would not apply to the concrete pads. He added that the letter of concern that was read into the record will initiate a code compliance case concerning the containers.

Daniel Metzler clarified with Mr. Young that the Building Official did not consider the containers structures.

Bryan Greene asked the applicant if the pads that were installed were specific to the containers.

Mr. Ratcliff stated that one of the slabs was poured to work on, and the other two are for the support of the containers.

Ron Ramsingh advised the Commissioners to review only what is before them in the application.

Rudy Molinet stated he would not be in favor of approving the pads.

Ron Ramsingh suggested that the decision on pads be postponed subject to the generation of a code case concerning the containers so that the decision could incorporate both the concrete pads and the containers together.

Nils Muench made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Greene and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

**9 New gazebo, deck extension, brick walls and driveway-#1120 Packer Street- Guillermo Orozco (H11-01-059)**

Guillermo Orozco presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Greene made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Greene and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**10 New second story addition on rear- #1125 Von Phister Street- Seatech Inc. (H11-01-060)**

Ryan Lachapelle presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on page 37 paragraph 8 of the guidelines; the motion was seconded by Bryan Greene.

Jeff Johnson the home owner stated that the roof line could be lowered.

Nil Muench withdrew his motion.

Nils Muench made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Greene and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

**HARC Planner's Report**

Enid Torregrosa discussed a meeting City staff held concerning the historic cable hut at the proposed Mallory square restaurant site. She added that the code enforcement hearing for the 703 Fleming Street solar panels would be taking place Wednesday January 26, 2011.

Ron Ramsingh gave the commission an update on the white roof appeal.

## **Comments from Commissioners**

Daniel Metzler clarified with Ron Ramsingh the city's definition of what a structure is.

Bryan Greene asked for an update on the 936 United Street code case.

Jim Young stated that the code case has been reassigned and code has spoken with the general contractor.

Rudy Molinet asked staff if they could obtain a color printer so that all package photos appear in color.

## **Adjournment**

Nils Muench made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Bryan Greene. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at [www.keywestcity.com](http://www.keywestcity.com).

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.