

**Historic Architectural Review Commission  
Agenda Packet  
January 12, 2010 – 3:00 p.m.  
City Commission Chamber  
Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street**



**Item 6.**

**Historic Preservation Planner's Report**

**Historic Architectural Review Commission**

**Staff Executive Summary  
For the meeting of  
Tuesday, January 12, 2010**

---

**STAFF APPROVALS:**

H09-09-21-1088 **1101 Truman Avenue, Dimitrios Kalatzis/Taste of Greece**

1Hanging sign- 5 square feet, 1-Detached sign 32" by 26" by 29", plywood, "TASTE OF GREECE MILE 1" .Hanging sign is 5 sq/ft and will be higher than 8 ft from right of way will correct per preservation planner 11/30/09

H09-11-30-1343 **1405 South Street, Chris Gazzale**

Install a handler in wine room. Condenser to be installed in existing mechanical room. Air condition installed over wine room door.

H09-11-30-1344 **811 Southard Street, A Plus Roofing**

Install 1100 sq/ft 11 squares of white 60 mill TPO single ply.

H09-11-30-1346 **726 Caroline Street, All Keys Construction**

Remove and replace 20' by 50' of concrete slab at parking lot. Replace ADA ramp.

H09-11-30-1347 **901 Duval Street, Gary the Carpenter**

Revision to approved HARC #07-05-14-537 change manufacturer from Vista wall systems to Delta door store front system. No change in appearance. No changes to the approved plans per preservation planner 12/1/09.

H09-12-01-1349 **67 Sunset Key, Hurricane Shutters of Key West**

Install aluminum panels to four doors and four windows and two back doors with roll downs.

H09-12-01-1350 **Mobile Vendor Cart, Louis Condos**

Install two new signs on cart. Signs should not exceed 12 square feet per Sec. 18.324. See attached per preservation planner 12/3/09.

H09-12-01-1351 **1107 Angela Street, Chris Fogarty**

Install approximately 10 lineal feet of new 4feet tall open wood picket fence. 6 by 6 posts, decorative pickets and picket gate.

- H09-12-01-1352 **416 Appelrouth Lane, Illona Mayorga**  
Paint outside of building including stairs and outside bar and center gate with same colors as existing colors. White trim light and pastel yellow walls per preservation planner 12-1-09.
- H09-12-01-1353 **702 South Street, Dan Ace Roofing**  
Roofing over existing asphalt shingles with rosin paper and v-crimp 18sq.
- H09-12-01-1354 **712 Duval Street-up (rear), FMH Builders, Inc.**  
Pressure wash, caulk, prime and paint rear of the building with existing color, siding, stairs and handrails stairs platinum gray, handrails-semi gloss white.
- H09-12-02-1355 **1315 United Street, Key King Enterprises Inc.**  
Replace wood deck board with Trek deck composite (brown) 700 sq/ft and repair deck joist. For the rear deck only per preservation planner 12/2/09.
- H09-12-02-1356 **400 Front Street, Keys Roofing Inc.**  
Pitch Grace /Ice 5-v crimp 26g gray. Flat deck 281 B Bar sheet/ ply/180 square feet modified Bitumen 15 sq/s total. Building has v-crimp roof system per preservation planner 12/2/09.
- H09-12-03-1357 **716 William Street, Jeff Hagel**  
Remove 800 sq/ft of 2" by 6" decking and replace with new #1 PT 2" by 6" to be fastened with 3' ceramic screws. Remove 30 lineal feet of existing wood fence, and replace with new wood fence as per drawing, fence location marked on survey. Wood pool deck is located on the back of the house. Wood fence will not be taller than 4 feet per preservation planner 12/7/09.
- H09-12-03-1358 **811 Southard Street, Thomas E. Pope, P.A.**  
Revisions to previously approved H09-07-17-794 converting existing garage into a pool pavilion and installing wood dbl hung windows behind previously approved louvers on side porch of main house. Hung windows will be behind louvers. Plans proposes the removal of two double doors on the garage and leave fenestrations open per preservation planner 12/7/09.
- H09-12-03-1361 **1223 Petronia Street, Surfside Aluminum of FL Keys Inc.**  
Install 83 lineal feet of white seamless gutter 33' front 44' back 6' right side 39' of 2' by 3' white downspout. Not listed in the survey. Front downspout should be located in a way not visible from the street per preservation planner 12/08/09.

H09-12-03-1362 **531 Fleming Street, All Keys Construction Inc**

To prepare and paint building Glidden-Honey Beige. White trims

H09-12-04-1364 **513 Southard Street, Republic Builders Inc.**

Install PGT Series 700 single hung impact windows. Specs are 1-lite panels clear glass with white frames. Total windows 10 installed as 5 double windows. Install storm panels at front doors. Building is Non-conforming and not listed on Hist. Reg. Building is not listed in the survey. Will require installing 6 over 6 windows instead of 1 over 1 per preservation planner. 12/08/09.

H09-12-04-1366 **512 Greene Street, Southernmost Signs**

A-1Wall sign 20 sq/ft, B-1-Detached sign 5 sq/ft. A-Wall sign Red Cedar B-Detached sign pole red Cedar and metallic channel reverse letters Halo effect, "ERNESTOS" Letters are less than 12" tall per preservation planner 12/07/09.

H09-12-07-1367 **400 Duval Street, A Plus Roofing**

Patch along parapet wall roof trim to stop leaks and patch two weak spots.

H09-12-07-1368 **820 White Street, Mark Mayer**

Replacing a deck (top material) 300 sq/ft around pool Grey Terex material. After the fact.

H09-12-07-1369 **126 Simonton Street, Southernmost Signs**

1-Wall sign 3 square feet, wood. "INFINITY HAIR ADDITIONAL PARKING IN REAR".

H09-12-07-1370 **503 Front Street One Call Construction Inc.**

Remove and replace 2 rotted 6 by 6 columns and trim in cement board trim keep same dimensions. Repair arch window trim with dutchman patch and paint white. Will duplicate existing columns per preservation planner 12/08/09.

H09-12-07-1371 **137 Duval Street, One Call Construction Inc.**

Remove window and replace with 6 feet wood full light. Previously approved by the commission. Will not change fenestration dimension per preservation planner 12/08/09.

H09-12-07-1372 **219 Whitehead Street, L.A. Builders Inc.**

Scrape loose paint on siding of house. Repaint same color (Benjamin Moore" Butter). Repaint trim same color (Benjamin Moore " Brilliant White).

- H09-12-07-1373 **519 Frances Street, Dan Ace Roofing**  
Remove and replace conch shingles with same. 6 sq.
- H09-12-07-1374 **1111 Varela Street, Wayne Garcia Bldg. Cont.**  
Paint exterior of house and front door. See attached color chart.
- H09-12-08-1375 **824 Center Street, Holtkamp Construction**  
Replace approx twenty 8' pieces of novelty siding on west side of building paint to match approximately 160 lineal feet. Wood novelty siding per preservation planner 12/08/09.
- H09-12-08-1376 **1209 Duncan Street, Tony's Roofing Co.**  
Replace 5 v-crimp metal roofs with 5 v-crimp metal roofing. V-crimp with v-crimp not for areas that have shingles per preservation planner 12/08/09.
- H09-12-08-1377 **600 Frances Street, A Plus Roofing**  
Install 900 sq/ft, 9 sqs of PVC single ply roofing and 1500 sq/ft of 24g Galvalume Victorian metal shingles.
- H09-12-08-1378 **Higgs Beach/Atlantic Blvd., Mattingly Construction Inc.**  
Build cross walk according to blue prints provided. Approx. 15' wide by 40' long". Construction will be on top of existing asphalt. Removal of minor soil per preservation planner. 12/08/09.
- H09-12-08-1380 **1024 Duval Street,**  
Fabricate and install frame and awning around storefront over non-removable surface. See photos and drawings. Remove existing awning and replace with new frame and canvas per preservation planner 12/09/09.
- H09-12-08-1381 **625 Eaton Street, M. Skoglund**  
2 by 6 wood deck 28' high at rear of property.
- H09-12-09-1382 **1319 Duval Street, Mc Kendry Builders**  
Roofing of thatch Tiki hut new bar top new cabinetry painting. Applicant will protect existing palm tree per preservation planner 12/09/09.
- H09-12-09-1383 **612 William Street, Go Sun & Wind, LLC**  
Install 2 KW PV systems on roof and one solar electric system. Will talk to mechanical inspector regarding location of batteries and existing A/C compressor. Photo Voltaic panels will be located on the back cottage, on its back gable per preservation planner 12/14/09.

- H09-12-09-1384 **726 Fleming Street, A Plus Roofing**  
Maintenance and paint 1150 square feet of Victorian metal shingles.
- H09-12-09-1386 **312 William Street, John Castro**  
Maintenance and paint 1300 square feet of Victorian metal shingles.
- H09-12-10-1390 **601 Front Street, Sub Zero Inc.**  
Change out of a 7 1/2 and 8 1/2 ton condenser.
- H09-12-11-1392 **1018 Elgin Lane, William Cimino**  
Repainting house, trim, jalousies, and door white. After the fact.
- H09-12-11-1393 **804 Truman Avenue, Roberta Fine**  
Replace 6 vinyl windows with 6 over 6 true lite divided wood windows.  
Code Compliance case.
- H09-12-11-1394 **619 Thomas Street, Paul Cox**  
Change gravel driveway to concrete driveway. Revision to permit 09-477 and HARC #H09-01-3095. Will not extend to the right of way per preservation planner 12/11/09.
- H09-12-11-1395 **1310 Seminary Street, Steve & Kristi Gollish**  
6' foot fence inside property line on Street. Fence sets back 10 feet from property line. 4 foot white picket electric gate at drive way. Will lower existing post on front picket fence to 4' ft high. Will remove orange plastic per preservation planner 12/14/09. Code Compliance case
- H09-12-14-1396 **400 Duval Street, A. Arnold Masonry**  
Re-stucco roof parapet, pressure wash bond scratch coat and finish coat. Interior of parapet wall per preservation planner 12/14/09.
- H09-12-14-1397 **1414 White Street, H.E. Goodley, Inc.**  
Replace deteriorated porch column. Install clear Hurricane panel over 26 windows and two doors. Post will be wood with same profile as existing and same measurements. Hurricane panels are removable per preservation planner 12/14/09.
- H09-12-14-1398 **#6 Charles Street, Gaston Breton**  
Install a concrete pad 36" by 36" by 10" for propane tank insulation.

## STAFF REPORTS:

CL1- **720-722-726 Emma Street**, Victor Cushman (H09-12-22-1427)

### **Install white roof paint and device for conservation (we're going green)**

One of the three houses on this complex is listed as contributing, 720 Emma Street. The contributing structure was built circa 1920 and is a frame vernacular resource. All three structures have v crimp metal roofs. 720 and 722 Emma Street are one story buildings, 726 Emma Street is a two story frame vernacular with a low slope hipped roof. The applicant wants to paint the v-crimp roofs in white, using a reflecting elastomeric product. The applicant is also proposing to install a device for conservation at the ridge of each side of the roof. Staff was not provided with the device. Applicant will bring a sample of the device to the public meeting.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application;

- Exterior colors (page 35);
  - *Traditional colors of Key West; roofing, metal: silver gray-* The proposed color for the three v-crimp metal roofs will be white. Staff understands that the proposed white color differs from the color that is recommended by HARC as appropriate within the historic zones.

For the review of this application staff studied Florida Statutes regarding Energy Conservation and Historical Resources. According to Florida Statutes- 163.04- *Energy devices based on renewable resources*, clearly states the following;

*(1) Notwithstanding any provision of this chapter or other provision of general or special law, the adoption of an ordinance by a governing body, as those terms are defined in this chapter, **which prohibits or has the effect of prohibiting the installation of solar collectors, clotheslines, or other energy devices based on renewable resources is expressly prohibited.***

*(2) No deed restrictions, covenants, or similar binding agreements running with the land shall prohibit or have the effect of prohibiting solar collectors, clotheslines, or other energy devices based on renewable resources from being installed on buildings erected on the lots or parcels covered by the deed restrictions, covenants, or binding agreements. A property owner may not be denied permission to install solar collectors or other energy devices based on renewable resources by any entity granted the power or right in any deed restriction, covenant, or similar binding agreement to approve, forbid, control, or direct alteration of property with respect to residential dwellings not exceeding three stories in height. For*

*purposes of this subsection, such entity may determine the specific location where solar collectors may be installed on the roof within an orientation to the south or within 45° east or west of due south provided that such determination does not impair the effective operation of the solar collectors.*

*(3) In any litigation arising under the provisions of this section, the prevailing party shall be entitled to costs and reasonable attorney's fees.*

*(4) The legislative intent in enacting these provisions is to protect the public health, safety, and welfare by encouraging the development and use of renewable resources in order to conserve and protect the value of land, buildings, and resources by preventing the adoption of measures which will have the ultimate effect, however unintended, of driving the costs of owning and operating commercial or residential property beyond the capacity of private owners to maintain. This section shall not apply to patio railings in condominiums, cooperatives, or apartments.*

*History—s. 8, ch. 80-163; s. 1, ch. 92-89; s. 14, ch. 93-249.*

According to the Florida Statutes, Section 196.012, under Definitions for Taxation and Finance, Exemption, there is a definition for “renewable energy source device” or “device”, which is;

*14) "**Renewable energy source device**" or "**device**" means any of the following equipment which, when installed in connection with a dwelling unit or other structure, collects, transmits, stores, or uses solar energy, wind energy, or energy derived from geothermal deposits:*

*(a) Solar energy collectors.*

*(b) Storage tanks and other storage systems, excluding swimming pools used as storage tanks.*

*(c) Rockbeds.*

*(d) Thermostats and other control devices.*

*(e) Heat exchange devices.*

*(f) Pumps and fans.*

*(g) Roof ponds.*

*(h) Freestanding thermal containers.*

*(i) Pipes, ducts, refrigerant handling systems, and other equipment used to interconnect such systems; however,*

*conventional backup systems of any type are not included in this definition.*

*(j) Windmills.*

*(k) Wind-driven generators.*

*(l) Power conditioning and storage devices that use wind energy to generate electricity or mechanical forms of energy.*

*(m) Pipes and other equipment used to transmit hot geothermal water to a dwelling or structure from a geothermal deposit.*

It is staff understanding that applying white paint over existing metal v-crimp roof system is not a *renewable energy source device* or *device* as defined in the Florida Statutes. Because staff did not have access to the device mentioned by the applicant we can not make any recommendation to this Commission regarding the proposed device.

Staff wants this Commission to be aware that the Florida Energy Efficiency Code for Building Construction- Chapter 13 includes under Sec. 13-101.5, Exempt buildings- Buildings exempt from compliance with this chapter include those described in Sections 101.5.1 through 101.5.7;

*13-101.5.5- Any historical building as described in Section 267.021, Florida Statutes.*

Chapter 267 of the Florida Statutes is about Historical Resources. Section 267.021 includes under Definitions, the following for historic property or historic resource;

*(3) "Historic property" or "historic resource" means any prehistoric or historic district, site, building, object, or other real or personal property of historical, architectural, or archaeological value, and folklife resources. These properties or resources may include, but are not limited to, monuments, memorials, Indian habitations, ceremonial sites, abandoned settlements, sunken or abandoned ships, engineering works, treasure trove, artifacts, or other objects with intrinsic historical or archaeological value, or any part thereof, relating to the history, government, and culture of the state.*

Florida Statutes recognizes and promotes the preservation and conservation of the integrity of historic resources and historic districts.

Staff recommends to this commission to review the proposed device that the applicant will present in the public hearing. This device must comply with the definition under Florida Statutes, Section 196.012.

CL2- **909 Grinnell Street**, Victor Cushman (H09-12-22-1428)  
**Install white roof device for conservation (we're going green)**

The structure located on 909 Grinnell Street is not listed in the survey. According to the Monroe Properties Appraisers website the house was built in 1976. The house is a cbs structure covered with v-crimp metal panels. Although the application states under detail description of work- install white roof device for conservation, the applicant wants to paint the v-crimp roof in white, using a reflecting elastomeric product. The applicant is also proposing to install a device for conservation at the ridge of each side of the roof. Staff was not provided with the device. Applicant will bring a sample of the device to the public meeting.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application;

- Exterior colors (page 35);
  - *Traditional colors of Key West; roofing, metal: silver gray-* The proposed color for the three v-crimp metal roofs will be white. Staff understands that the proposed white color differs from the color that is recommended by HARC as appropriate within the historic zones.

For the review of this application staff studied Florida Statutes regarding Energy Conservation and Historical Resources. According to Florida Statutes- 163.04- *Energy devices based on renewable resources*, clearly states the following;

*(1) Notwithstanding any provision of this chapter or other provision of general or special law, the adoption of an ordinance by a governing body, as those terms are defined in this chapter, **which prohibits or has the effect of prohibiting the installation of solar collectors, clotheslines, or other energy devices based on renewable resources is expressly prohibited.***

*(2) No deed restrictions, covenants, or similar binding agreements running with the land shall prohibit or have the effect of prohibiting solar collectors, clotheslines, or other energy devices based on renewable resources from being installed on buildings erected on the lots or parcels covered by the deed restrictions, covenants, or binding agreements. A property owner may not be denied permission to install solar collectors or other energy devices based on renewable resources by any entity granted the power or right in any deed restriction, covenant, or similar binding agreement to approve, forbid, control, or direct alteration of property with*

*respect to residential dwellings not exceeding three stories in height. For purposes of this subsection, such entity may determine the specific location where solar collectors may be installed on the roof within an orientation to the south or within 45° east or west of due south provided that such determination does not impair the effective operation of the solar collectors.*

*(3) In any litigation arising under the provisions of this section, the prevailing party shall be entitled to costs and reasonable attorney's fees.*

*(4) The legislative intent in enacting these provisions is to protect the public health, safety, and welfare by encouraging the development and use of renewable resources in order to conserve and protect the value of land, buildings, and resources by preventing the adoption of measures which will have the ultimate effect, however unintended, of driving the costs of owning and operating commercial or residential property beyond the capacity of private owners to maintain. This section shall not apply to patio railings in condominiums, cooperatives, or apartments.*

*History—s. 8, ch. 80-163; s. 1, ch. 92-89; s. 14, ch. 93-249.*

According to the Florida Statutes, Section 196.012, under Definitions for Taxation and Finance, Exemption, there is a definition for “renewable energy source device” or “device”, which is;

*14) "**Renewable energy source device**" or "**device**" means any of the following equipment which, when installed in connection with a dwelling unit or other structure, collects, transmits, stores, or uses solar energy, wind energy, or energy derived from geothermal deposits:*

*(a) Solar energy collectors.*

*(b) Storage tanks and other storage systems, excluding swimming pools used as storage tanks.*

*(c) Rockbeds.*

*(d) Thermostats and other control devices.*

*(e) Heat exchange devices.*

*(f) Pumps and fans.*

*(g) Roof ponds.*

*(h) Freestanding thermal containers.*

*(i) Pipes, ducts, refrigerant handling systems, and other equipment used to interconnect such systems; however, conventional backup systems of any type are not included in this definition.*

*(j) Windmills.*

*(k) Wind-driven generators.*

*(l) Power conditioning and storage devices that use wind energy to generate electricity or mechanical forms of energy.*

*(m) Pipes and other equipment used to transmit hot geothermal water to a dwelling or structure from a geothermal deposit.*

It is staff understanding that applying white paint over existing metal v-crimp roof system is not a *renewable energy source device* or *device* as defined in the Florida Statutes. Because staff did not have access to the device mentioned by the applicant we can not make any recommendation to this Commission regarding the proposed device.

Staff wants this Commission to be aware that the Florida Energy Efficiency Code for Building Construction- Chapter 13 includes under Sec. 13-101.5, Exempt buildings- Buildings exempt from compliance with this chapter include those described in Sections 101.5.1 through 101.5.7;

*13-101.5.5- Any historical building as described in Section 267.021, Florida Statutes.*

Chapter 267 of the Florida Statutes is about Historical Resources. Section 267.021 includes under Definitions, the following for historic property or historic resource;

*(4) "Historic property" or "historic resource" means any prehistoric or historic district, site, building, object, or other real or personal property of historical, architectural, or archaeological value, and folklife resources. These properties or resources may include, but are not limited to, monuments, memorials, Indian habitations, ceremonial sites, abandoned settlements, sunken or abandoned ships, engineering works, treasure trove, artifacts, or other objects with intrinsic historical or archaeological value, or any part thereof, relating to the history, government, and culture of the state.*

Florida Statutes recognizes and promotes the preservation and conservation of the integrity of historic resources and historic districts.

Staff recommends to this commission to review the proposed device that the applicant will present in the public hearing. This device must comply with the definition under Florida Statutes, Section 196.012.

CL3- **#906 South Street-** Thomas E. Pope, Architect (H09-12-23-1436)  
**New single family house on vacant lot with pool**

The proposed design project consists of a new one story residence with an attached garage to be built on a vacant lot. The proposed house is a wood frame building with v-crimp metal roof panels. The design includes hardi board lap siding, impact resistance aluminum clad windows, window resistance aluminum clad wood windows for the side and back elevations and Bahama shutters for all windows fenestrations, with the exemption of a colonial shutter for the front window, next to the entrance door.

The main façade is composed by three volumes, each set back from the right of way. Each volume has a gable roof; the two from the main house are 21'- 3/4" high from grade to ridge, while the attached garage gable roof is approximately 14'- 3" high from grade to ridge. The design proposes a covered entry porch with simple wood architectural elements and a four panel wood door with transom. A swimming pool is proposed on the back yard.

Staff understands that the guidelines for Additions and Alterations and New Construction (pages 36-38) are applicable for the review of the submitted plans. Under page 37 of the Historic Architectural Guidelines, last paragraph states the following:

*The criteria that guides new construction in historic zones insures that new construction shall not interfere with the essential form and integrity of the historic properties and their environment.*

*Key West's historic district's tightly spaced blocks contain a wide variety of architectural styles, which relate well to each other. The relationships between the buildings create much of the character of the district. Their height, detailing, mass, roof forms, and landscaping all contribute to its visual harmony. It is important that new construction harmonize with the existing historical building stock and streetscapes.*

1. **Siting-** According to the submitted plans the proposed new structure will conform actual setbacks for this particular historic district zone- HMDR;  
Front yard- 10 ft  
Street side- 7.5 ft  
Side- 5 ft

Rear- 15 ft  
Maximum height 30 ft

The proposed design uses a similar footprint configuration as the building's footprint that is shown in the 1962 Sanborn Map.

2. **Height**- The proposed house will be 20'-  $\frac{3}{4}$ " high, from grade to ridge on its highest point. The house is a one story structure. The proposed height is compatible with existing houses in the neighborhood.
3. **Proportion, scale and mass**- *Massing, scale and proportion should be similar to that of existing historical buildings in the historical zone.* The proposed house is a one story wood frame house with an L shape footprint. The proposed mass, scale and proportions of this new design are in kept with the historic urban fabric that will surround the new project. The new design will not outsize or obscure any surrounding structure.
4. **Compatibility**- *All new construction must be in keeping with the historic character in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture-* The proposed design is compatible with the existing historic buildings that will surround the new building. The new design is in scale with its urban context and will incorporate materials and textures which are compatible with the historic district.
5. **Building detail**-The proposed design presents a non traditional main façade configuration, a three volume one story composition with an off center covered porch. The design incorporates architectural elements, materials, and roof configurations that are compatible with the historic district.
6. **Relationship of materials**- As mentioned before the new design incorporates materials that can be found in the historic urban context.

It is staff believes that the proposed design is consistent with the guidelines for new construction. Staff understands that the project, as presented, will have **no effect on the historic urban fabric**. Staff recommends to this honorable commission to approve the proposed project.

CL 4 - #608 William Street- Thomas E. Pope, Architect-(H09-12-23-1437) -  
Renovation of existing cottage. New dormer at rear and new addition at rear. Demolish existing non-historic porch. New pool and hard-scape

The house located on 608 William Street is listed as a contributing resource in the 1998 and 2004 surveys. The one and a half story frame vernacular house was built circa 1889. The proposed project includes the incorporation of a dormer window on the back side of the main gable roof, the construction of a new one story attached addition to the south elevation of the main house, the enclosure of a back screened room and construction of a new swimming pool and hard scape.

The Historic Architectural Guidelines of the City of Key West includes under Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District (o and p) Additions, alterations and new construction, pages 36-38, the following;

*HARC reviews alterations of non-contributing structures to ensure that the proposed alterations will not create a structure that is an intrusion in the historic district. Whenever possible, HARC will encourage projects that lessen the detraction of an addition, alteration or new structure upon the integrity of the historic district, whether the construction is new or proposed for contributing or non contributing buildings within the district.*

The main house is a contributing resource. The proposed plans includes an attached one story addition to the south façade with a setback of approximately 31'- 4" from the right of way, new hip roof and enclosure of an existing back screened room and the addition of a dormer window at the back of the main house roof.

#### Guideline 1

*A structure shall not be altered and/or expanded in such manner that it's essential character defining features are disguised or concealed.*

Staff understands that the proposed design will not obscure character defining elements the contributing houses processes. The one story addition on the side of the house will be set back approximately 19'-11" from the main facade. The proposed dormer will be located on the back of the main house roof and will not be visible from the right of way.

#### Guideline 2

*Additions and alterations may be reviewed more liberally on non-contributing buildings, which lack architectural distinction.*

The main house is a contributing resource. The proposed plans includes an attached one story addition to the south façade with a setback of approximately 31'- 4" from the right of way, new hip roof and enclosure of an existing back screened room and the addition of a dormer window at the back of the main house roof.

Guideline 3

*Addition design should be compatible with the characteristics of the original structure, neighboring buildings and streetscape*

The proposed addition is compatible and harmonious with the existing house. The incorporation of metal shingles on the roofs is compatible to the original structure. The proposed project will incorporate wood siding for the main house dormer. Hardi plank siding is proposed as the exterior material for all new walls.

Guideline 4

*Additions should be constructed with scale, height and mass that is appropriate to the original building and its neighbors.*

It is staff understanding that the design is in scale and in proportion with the surrounding houses. The proposed height of the addition and new hip roof on the back of the house are lower than the existing main house.

Guideline 5

*Additions should be attached to less publicly visible secondary elevations of an historic structure.*

This addition will be attached to the side of the house and set back from the right-of-way 31'-4" from the right-of-way. The proposed window dormer will be located on the back of the existing main roof.

Guideline 6

*Additions should not alter the balance and symmetry of a historic structure.*

This proposed addition will not alter the balance and symmetry the house possesses. The proposed setback from the main façade makes this addition a secondary elevation.

Guideline 7

*No existing structure shall be enlarged so that its proportions are out of scale with its surroundings.*

The new design does not propose any alterations that may change or enlarge the existing proportions of the house. The addition is one story height.

Guideline 8

*New additions should be designed and constructed to be clearly differentiated from the historical so that character defining features are not changed, obscured, damaged, or destroyed.*

The new design proposes setbacks to the front façade of the house that will help in the differentiation between the new addition and the historic fabric.

Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **approve** the plans as proposed. The proposed design complies with the City's Historic Architectural Guidelines. The additions are harmonious and compatible with the existing house as well as within its historic context.

**CL 6 - #915 Cornish Lane- Robert L. Delaune, Architect (H09-12-28-1439)**

Remove existing wood doors and windows where indicated (five openings) and install new aluminum sliders (impact). Replace wood decking and modify pool edge. Re build entry stairs.

The house located on 915 Cornish Lane is listed as a contributing resource in the 1998 and 2004 surveys. The frame vernacular house was built in 1918. The proposed plans include the removal of non original wood doors and windows on the back of the house and replace them with aluminum impact resistant pocket sliders. The plans also propose the replacement of the existing pool deck and the repair of front wood steps.

The only elevation that is original to the historic fabric that will have new aluminum pocket sliders will be the north one. Infill for the transom windows that will be removed will match the existing board and batten. The existing kitchen and all the north east corner of the house were added after 1962. A new aluminum pocket slider is proposed for the south elevation of the kitchen. Also on the north elevation of the existing bedroom and master bathroom aluminum pocket sliders are proposed.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application;

- Entrances, porches and doors (pages 32-33);
  - *(12) Sliding glass doors are not appropriate for use on any publicly visible façade of a contributing historic structure.*

The plans propose the removal of existing non original wood French doors and windows. The proposed change will be on facades that are not visible from the right-of-way.

Although the Guidelines do not address the material for sliding doors for buildings located within the historic zoning districts, staff wants to refer to Guideline 9 under Entrances, porches and doors, page 33;

*Doors must be six or four paneled wood doors for 19<sup>th</sup> century residential buildings, unless historical documentation indicates otherwise. Two panel wood doors are suitable for buildings with*

*Greek revival detailing. Some late 19<sup>th</sup> century and early 20<sup>th</sup> century buildings used horizontal paneled or half glazed doors.*

Under windows guidelines pages 30 and 3, particularly Guideline 11 states:

*Wood or metal jalousies may be appropriate if proportioned properly with respect to the façade and if they are historically appropriate to the design of the building. Aluminum windows are generally inappropriate on contributing structures.*

Staff understands that the intention of the guidelines regarding windows and doors in the historic zoning districts is that the use of wood on these architectural elements is most appropriate on historic buildings. Wood is the traditional material used in the historic fabric and is the most appropriate material to use on the contributing portion of the house.

The proposed replacement of the pool deck as well as the repairs to the front steps will be done with wood.

Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **approve** the proposed improvements **with the condition that the pocket sliders, at least on the north elevation, are made of wood.** Staff understands that the proposed new deck and repairs of front steps are in keeping with the Historic Architectural Guidelines.

**CL 6 - #313 Truman Avenue- Carlos Rojas, Architect (H09-12-30-1450)**

Replace windows with wood 1 over 2 in existing openings. Add wood colonial shutters. Blind one window. Add wood finish to front porch. Replace roof in kind.

The house located on 313 Truman Avenue is listed as a contributing house. The frame vernacular house was built circa 1889 and is a true eyebrow structure. The proposed plans include the removal of non original jalousie aluminum-glass windows with one over two true wood divided windows. The plans propose the removal of all non historic concrete elements found in the front porch and its reconstruction with wood elements. The actual v-crimp metal roof is corroded and the proposed plans include an in kind replacement of the roof system. The existing front wood door will be restored. The plans also propose colonial wood shutters for the first floor main façade windows and side façades.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application;

- Entrances, porches and doors (pages 32-33);
  - (5) *Materials used to repair entryway elements should match the historic fabric as closely as possible in quality and durability (i.e., through use of cedar, cypress, redwood or pressure*

*treated wood) because exposed front elevations decay easily.*

The plans propose the removal of existing non historic concrete front porch and its reconstruction using wood elements on a traditional front porch design. The new design proposes a more appropriate wood front porch than the existing non historic concrete one.

- Windows (pages 29-30);
  - *(3) Replacement windows on contributing buildings should be made to fit the original window opening without the use of blocking or infill. Such replacement windows, sills, muntins, sashes, surrounds and other window features should be of similar and compatible configuration, material, size, design, and placement as those of original windows.*

The design proposes the removal of non historic aluminum-glass jalousie windows and their replacement with one over two wood hung windows. The existing fenestrations will not be altered to accommodate the new windows. Staff understands that the proposed window configuration, 1 over 2, is not a traditional one. This is a contributing resource built circa 1889. Although staff was not able to find historic photos showing the original windows, staff understands that 6 over 6 or 2 over 2 true divided wood windows will be more appropriated for this historic house.

Staff recommends to this commission to **approve** the proposed improvements that are proposed in the plans **with the condition that the proposed wood windows be 6 over 6 or 2 over 2 true divided lights**. The 1 over 2 wood windows is not a traditional window configuration for historic houses within the historic urban context. Staff believes that the porch reconstruction will be an appropriate improvement for the house.