

**Historic Architectural Review Commission
Agenda Packet
November 10, 2009 – 3:00 p.m.
City Commission Chamber
Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street**



Item 6.

Historic Preservation Planner's Report

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Staff Executive Summary For the public hearing of Tuesday, November 10, 2009

STAFF APPROVALS:

- H09-10-13-1170 **503 Noah Lane, Hurricane Shutters of Key West**
Replace existing Bahama Colonial shutters with impact Bahamas Colonials. Non-historic house as per Enid T. 10/28/09.
- H09-10-16-1196 **1405 Duval Street, SMB Restaurant LLC/Mc Kendry Builders**
HARC Guideline approved removable aluminum Hurricane panels. Tracks will match trim. Removable panels per Enid T. 10/19/09.
- H09-10- 19-1197 **906 Southard Street, Hurricane Shutter Key West**
HARC Guideline approved removable aluminum Hurricane panels. Tracks will match trim. Removable panels per Enid T. 10/19/09.
- H09-10-19-1022 **1022 James Street, Moe's Plumbing Services**
6ft high fence down one (1) side and along back 75 linear ft picket fence. Open picket painted in white per Enid T. 10/20/09.
- H09-09-30-1130 **1223 Petronia Street, John Dewald**
Build new deck at rear, approximately 425 sf.
- H09-10-07-1154 **540 Green Street, Sandra Mc Mannis**
Repair/Replace 13 existing outdoor fixtures with bulkhead 8" style fixtures for safety, vandal-proofing and appearance. New lights shown in "B" attached. Photo attached.
- H09-10-07-1164 **221 Duval Street C, Gary the Carpenter**
Remove and replace existing 2' by 7'-6" accordion door panels (6 total) at entrance, paint to match. Install storm panel system at entrance (panels to be installed during storm). Lower channel for storm panel will be removed during off season. Upper channel will be white. Wood doors painted white per Enid T 10/26/09.
- H09-10-19-1199 **725 Truman Avenue, JDS of North America**
Repair 280 sq/ft board and batten siding.

- H09-10-20-1201 **825 Georgia Street, Dan Ace Roofing**
V-crimp roof over asphalt shingles with v-crimp 10 sqs.
- H09-10-20-1202 **526 Simonton Street, Joseph Merrill Shea**
Continuing maintenance and minor paint. Touch-up with same colors:
Light yellow with white trim and dark green shutters.
- H09-10-20-1203 **210 Duval Street, A Plus Roofing**
Install 300 sq/ft 3 squares of white 60 mil single ply rear low slope.
- H09-10-20-1204 **1210 Von Phister Street, Paver Dave Inc.**
394 sq. of sand set brick paver driveway. Will be inside the property
line.
- H09-10-20-1205 **918 Duval Street, The Awning Guys Inc.**
Install 8" valance at front second floor patio rim and in two side
windows. Approximately 47 ln. ft.
- H09-10-20-1206 **720 Emma Street, (Serenity House), Victor Cushman**
Paint walls with white paint.
- H09-10-20-1207 **909 Grinnell Street, Victor Cushman**
Paint walls with white paint.
- H09-10-20-1209 **414 Simonton Street, Lynn Kephart**
Spot painting of 414 Simonton Street. Paint same existing color see
samples with building and spindles Benjamin Moore paints. Light grey
white trim Benjamin Moore.
- H09-10-21-1213 **923 Angela Street, Key West A/C & Ref. Inc.**
Install 3-ton condenser A/C on the back of house.
- H09-10-21-1214 **1119 Whitehead Street, Michael Larson by POA**
Paint exterior of house, paint fence. Remove non-historic broken
lattice. Doors will be white per Enid T 10/22/09.
- H09-10-21-1215 **531 Fleming Street, All Keys Construction**
Repair 55 lineal feet damaged convert tie beam. 40 ln/ft of support
column.
- H09-10-21-1216 **600 Truman Avenue # 9, Rodger Townsend**
Replace apprx. 100 sq/ft ½" by 6" wood siding and 2 windows sills.
Replace surface of existing wood deck with PVC decking. Repaint
house with existing colors. Replacement of deck is on the back of the
property and not on the front, non-historic, per Enid T. 10/26/09.

- H09-10-22-1218 **419 Duval Street, Southernmost Signs**
1-Wall sign 18 sq.ft, aluminum KENNEDY STUDIO SEAPORT GALLERY. Letters are less than 12 inches and sign is 21" high. Flat finish per Enid T. 10/28/09.
- H09-10-22-1219 **615 Amelia Street, Erica Mikula/Erica's Pool LLC & Solar Hot Water**
Install solar DHW panel-4' by 8' w 80 gal Lochivar storage tank, PC circulation pump run by 10 w PV panel which sister DHW panel out of sight from front of house.
- H09-10-22-1220 **900 Duval Street, Dan Ace Roofing**
Roof over flat roof at breezeway, 2 sqs use mod rubber. Color night gray over flat roof per Enid T 10/27/09.
- H09-10-22-1221 **901 White Street, Ken Pierce/Mark Neely**
Replace wood French doors with same and paint white (already done). Repair wood canopy soffit and roof. Repaint white. Install brick pavers front side walk. Remove concrete and build fence. White picket wood fence 4' height will be built on property line per Enid T. 10/27/09.
- H09-10-22-1222 **717 Caroline Street, F & W Fence Company**
Front and side (up to house façade line) remove 45' of white picket fence and install wrought iron (black) fence along front of house: including one 15' roll gate for driveway and one pedestrian gate for across to path way. Fence is 48' high w/ 3/4 " pickets and 37/8" air space between pickets. Please see attached drawings. Wrought iron fence, not aluminum.
- H09-10-23-1224 **126 Simonton Street, Southernmost Signs**
One wall sign 13 sq/ft, 1-hanging sign 5 sq/ft. Wall sign will be aluminum panel, hanging sign Red Cedar sand blasted, "INFINITY HAIR NAILS & SKIN ". Replacing existing signs per Enid T 10/26/09.
- H09-10-23-1225 **807 Waddell Street, Timothy Ryan**
Build 4ft solid fence in front. Build 4ft solid top 2ft 50% open (concrete) Side fence is more than 10 feet from Right of way per Enid T 10/26/09.
- H09-10-26-1226 **1319 Duval Street, Southernmost Hotel in Key West**
Replacing existing gates and moving forward so they will close and hide trash compactor. Move southern wall over 2' and replacing with Board and Batten. Will paint gray green as existing walls.

- H09-10-26-1227 **711 Catherine Street, Surfside Aluminum of Florida Keys Inc.**
Install 3 shade Bahama Shutters (2) 83" by 70" and one 46" by 70".
New construction per Enid T. 10/27/09.
- H09-10-26-1228 **330 Duval Street, Gary the Carpenter**
Install 80' of white seamless gutter on rear of north side of structure.
Existing is half round. Replace with same half round per Enid T
10/27/09.
- H09-10-26-1230 **921 Thomas Street, James A. Brown**
Painting exterior: trim and shutters-Yorktown green-Benjamin Moore-
HC-133. Walls color-Palladian blue HC-144 Benjamin Moore.
- H09-10-26-1231 **809 Frances Street, Rain Saver Gutters**
Install 6" seamless gutters and 3" by 4" downspouts.
- H09-10-27-1232 **918 Duval Street, J.J. Fairbank Construction Inc.**
Revision to building permit # 09-3402. Increase sign in size to 29" high
by 49 1/2" wide. Previously approved sign, H09-10-1-1136 was 28" high
by 48" wide.
- H09-10-27-1233 **1416 Catherine Street, Suburban Propane**
Set 23 gallon tank on concrete and strap per FEMA extend gas line
to range.
- H09-10-27-1234 **809 Whitehead Street, Suburban Propane**
Set 23 gal. tank on pad run line to range.
- H09-10-27-1235 **124 Duval Street, Suburban Propane**
Relocate 100 gal. tank from adjoining property of 124 Duval Street. On
the back of property per Enid T. 10/28/09
- H09-10-27-1236 **1107 Southard Street, Tony's Roofing Co.**
Install v- crimp metal roof in place of asphalt shingles.
- H09-10-27-1237 **906 Southard Street, Dan Ace Roofing**
Remove and replace only rear lower shingles with same. See
pictures. Same type of shingles per Enid T. 10/28/09.
- H09-10-27-1238 **1102 Duval Street, Wayne Garcia Bldg Cont.**
Replace existing wood deck with new approx. 240 sq/ft. Replace
approximately 20 sq/ft lap siding painting white. All wood materials
per Enid T. 10/28/09.

- H09-10-27-1239 **1108 Duval Street, Wayne Garcia Bldg Cont.**
Replace existing wood deck with new approx. 240 sq/ft. Total 160 sq/ft as per plans. Wood decking materials per Enid T. 10/28/09.
- H09-10-28-1240 **713 Whitmarsh Lane, Victors Roofing Co.**
Go over with tapered insulation hot mop a 75# felt. Hot mop a fiberglass felt, hot mop a modified Bitumen felt. Flat roof per Enid T 10/28/09.
- H09-10-28-1241 **414 Louisa Street, David Knoll, Architect**
Resubmission for approval of the installation of gutters at the new flat roof (next door Poinciana drops leaves on the roof causing a stain to run on to new siding).
- H09-10-28-1242 **1223 Petronia Street, Denis Savoie**
Remove 35 lineal ft of existing block wall, replace with 35 lineal feet of 6' picket fence with one gate. Pickets fence will be open and on the side of the house per Enid T 10/29/09.
- H09-10-28-1243 **1013 South Street, Thornburgh Construction**
Repair and replace rotted, damaged and missing spindles as needed. Repair and replace railing sections as needed, all to match existing. Repair threshold repair interior and exterior paint to match existing repair damaged interior and exterior trim. Using wood, duplicate as existing per Enid T. 10/29/09.
- H09-10-28-1244 **807 Washington Street, Go Sun & Wind, LLC**
Solar hot water. Will not be seen from the Street, two story condo, non historic per Enid T. 10/29/09.
- H09-10-28-1245 **700 Front Street, Suburban Propane**
Install 1000 gal. tank in curbed area of parking lot will be hidden by bushes and plants.
- H09-10-28-1246 **804 Elizabeth Street, ABC Contracting of the FL Keys**
Repair and replace existing approximately 30 lineal feet belt board and approximately 30 sq/ft of siding Replace approximately 30 sq/ft of various trim. Will use wood per Enid T. 10/29/09.

H09-10-29-1247 **417 Southard Street, Victor Mills**

1-Hanging sign 3' wide by 4 ½" height, 2-window signs left side-3 ft 10 inches high by 3ft 2 inches width, right side-3ft 10 inches high by 3ft 2 inches width, "SCOOTER RENTALS", RENT ME SCOOTER RENTAL ELECTRIC CARS MOTORCYCLES AND BIKE RENTALS 305-294-5551". Allowed just one window sign and hanging sign. Applicant will reduce the sign up to 25% of the window area per Enid T. 10/29/09.

H09-10-30-1250 **1029 Fleming Street, Thomas E. Pope, P.A.**

Repair porch column with same material (wood) 6 x 8. Existing column

**Old Business
Tabled Items**

**New Business
Clarification Items**

CL1- **Request to change roofing material - #1015 Simonton Street-** Dan Ace Roofing (H09-10-15-1188)

Remove metal shingles and replace with v-crimp.

The building is not listed in the survey. This is a one story frame structure that is located on a trailer park. The building, which is presenting decay on many areas of the roof wood members, is used as a laundry and storage area. According to the Survey map of 1962 there was no structure on the site. The existing metal roof has severe rust stains due to trees surrounding the building and poor maintenance. Actually the type of roof is metal panels that resemble shingles; there are "two shingles" per panel.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application;

- Roofing (page 26);
 - *...Roof replacements should be done on an in-kind basis, with the new roof matching the materials used previously, unless HARC believes that replacement material to be more suitable than the existing roofing material.* – Although this building is not listed as contributing, the replacement of roof materials should be done on an in-kind basis. V-crimp is not the existing material on this particular roof.
 - *(1) Historical roofing materials such as metal shingles should be preserved when possible. If replacement is necessary, similar metal shingles must be used, not inappropriate roofing materials such as v-crimp metal. If a roof can be shown to have been made of another material such as wood shingles or slate, it may be*

replaced with that material. V-crimp roofs may be replaced with metal shingles- Staff understands that the guidelines clearly states that metal shingles should be replaced with similar metal shingles.

Staff understands that this proposed project does not comply with the existing Historic Architectural Guidelines. Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **deny** the removal of the existing roofing and the replacement with v-crimp.

CL2- **After the fact request to paint building- #712 Caroline Street-** Mashin Ahmed (H09-10-22-1223)

Painting front and inside. Window trims Apple red, wall trims and canopy supports Sun yellow, doors trims Green grass, and walls white.

The building is listed as contributing. Built circa 1933 this is a frame vernacular, two and a half stories structure located on the corner of Peacon Lane and Caroline Street. Actually the first floor is used as a market. The applicant painted the first floor front façade, on Caroline Street, with the following colors;

Wall- white

Window trims - bright red

Doors trims- bright green

Wall trims and wood canopy supports- bright yellow

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this project:

- Exterior colors (page 35);
 - Traditional colors of Key West;
 - Doors- white, black, red, dark green, natural finished wood
 - Exterior siding or body- white, pastels, light grey, beige, buff
 - Exterior trim- white or off white

It is staff understanding that, with the exception of the white color for the exterior walls, the proposed colors are inconsistent with the Historic Architectural Guidelines. Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **deny** this application based on the fact that the existing colors are not in keeping with the historic urban fabric that surrounds this contributing building.

CL3- **Request for new addition - Lazy Way Lane-** ECS/ Laird Uberroth (H09-10-26-1229)

One story frame addition 20' by 24' to match existing with v-crimp roof and hardy siding.

The existing structures located on Lazy Way lane are not listed in the survey. The project proposes the addition of a one story frame structure on the east side of the existing retail shop complex. The addition will be square in footprint, approximately twenty feet wide by twenty feet depth by

thirteen feet six inches high from ground to ridge. The plans proposes hardi lap siding, painted in beige and v-crimp metals panels for the roof. The east elevation will have a pair of wood hinged hurricane solid doors and on the front elevation, facing north, a pair of wood single glass pane doors will be installed. The addition will have the same height as the rest of the complex. New entrance doors, same as the proposed ones on the north façade, will also be installed on the existing shop, next to the new addition.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this project:

- Additions and Alterations/ New Construction (pages 36-38)
 - *(2)- Additions and alterations may be reviewed more liberally on non-contributing buildings, which lack architectural distinction-* The existing retail shop complex is not listed in the surveys. The proposed additions will be at the end side of the existing complex.
 - *(4)- Additions should be constructed with a scale, height and mass that is appropriate to the original building and its neighbors-* The proposed addition has the same scale and proportions as the existing shops. The height will be the same as the existing ones, which is approximately 13'-6" from grade to ridge.
- New Construction
 - *Compatibility- Design must be compatible with Key West architectural characteristics in the historical zones. All new construction must be in keeping with the historic character in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture-* The proposed design is in keeping with the surrounding urban context. Although the siding material will be hardi lap, this is an accepted material for new structures. The siding will be painted.

Staff understands that the proposed plans are consistent with the Historic Architectural Guidelines. It is staff believes that the proposed addition will not have an effect on the surrounding urban context. Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **approve** the plans as presented.

CL4- **Request to install six signs - #712 Duval Street - One Call Construction - (H09-10-30-1252)**

Two hanging signs 60" wide by 16" high, PVC, copy KEY WEST BILMAR STATION FOOD FUN SPORTS, letters 12" high or smaller. One hanging sign 45.5" wide by 14" high, PVC, copy FOOD FUN SPORTS. Two wall signs 84" wide by 16" high, PVC, copy PARKING IN REAR. One wall sign 60" wide by 16" high, PVC, copy ELEVATOR IN REAR.

The building is not listed in the survey. The applicant is proposing to install signs for a new business that is located on the second floor of the building. This second floor has an extended porch on Duval Street; the exterior second floor main façade is recessed. The proposed application includes the installation of six signs, four of them directional signs.

Two main hanging signs, measuring 60" wide by 30" high will be located on each side of the extended second floor porch. The signs will read *Key West Bilmar Station Food. Fun. Sports*. Letters will be 12" high or smaller, white in color. A third hanging sign is proposed for the main stairs. This third sign will be 45.5" wide by 14" high. The sign will read *Food. Fun. Sports Upstairs* and will include two arrows. All letters and arrows will be white.

Two signs, 84" wide by 16" high containing the words *Parking in rear* will be attached to the fascia of the first floor porch, on the same bays were the two main hanging signs will be located. This signs will include one arrow and letters will be white. Another sign, 60" wide by 16 inches high, containing the words *Elevator in rear*, is also proposed to be installed on the first floor's fascia on the north façade. The six signs will have almost the same colors backgrounds with same font white letters. All six signs will be made of PVC.

This is not a corner building and the establishment is located on the second floor. The business has been approved for one hanging sign, less than five square feet for the stairway entrance. Two existing signs containing the words *Parking rear* and *Parking in rear*, each with arrows, are located on the same area the new two parking signs are proposed. These two signs have black letters over white background and a blue border. Another sign, containing the words *Elevator* with an arrow, is located on the same area were the new elevator sign is proposed. This sign has red letters over a white background and a blue border.

According to the Glossary of the Historic Architectural Guidelines a sign is *any devise designated to inform or attract the attention of persons not on the premises*. According to the Land Development Regulations (LDR), Sec. 114-1- Signs- Definitions, sign means *any display of characters, letters, illustrations or any ornamentations or the complete structure on which any such characters, letters, illustrations or ornamentations are supported or applied, except that guys or their anchorages or the poles of pole signs will not be considered to be any part of a sign*. The LDR includes a restriction on number of signs permitted in the Historic Districts; Sec 114-104 states the following;

No business shall display more than two permitted signs at its location; provided, however, that a business located on a street corner may display up to three permitted signs upon approval of the historic architectural review commission. A business shall be determined by its business tax receipt.

This business is not located on a corner building.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application:

- Commercial storefronts and signage (page 46);
 - (3)- *Awnings and signs must be appropriately scaled and must not obscure, damage or destroy a building's historic character or features.*- Although this is not a historic building the location of the signs will not obscure or destroy architectural elements of the building.
- Banners, Flags, Signage and Lighting (pages 49-50);
 - (1)- *A non illuminated projecting or hanging sign not exceeding five feet in area is permitted in conjunction with permitted public and semi public uses-* Staff understands that the two proposed main signs, measuring 60" wide by 30" high that will be located on each side of the extended second floor porch, will be hanging signs and they will exceed the five square feet area regulation. A third hanging sign, proposed over the stairways is less than five square feet in area.
 - (3) *A flush mounted sign board may extend the width of a storefront but should not be more than 2.5 feet high. The sign must be mounted above the display windows but below the second floor windowsills or cornice.* The application includes three signs that staff understands that are flush mounted ones; the two parking signs and the elevator sign. Each sign is less than 2.5 feet high.

Staff agrees with the applicant that the condition of having a business on a second floor constitutes a challenge on how to drive the attention. Nevertheless staff understands that this proposal is inconsistent with the number of allowed signs on a business, as regulated by the Code of Ordinances. Staff also understands that the size of the two main signs, which are hanging signs, exceeds the guidelines of square area permitted for hanging signs. Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **deny** this application as proposed. The proposal is inconsistent with the City of Key West ordinances, particularly Sec. 114-104, as well as the Historic Architectural Guidelines.

CL5- **Request for new addition and site improvements - #623 Grinnell Street - Gary the Carpenter (H09-10-30-1253)**
Remove addition and deck on rear portion of main house. Construction new addition and pool on rear and new pavers on North side. New deck on rear.

This is a contributing house, frame vernacular structure built circa 1890. The main house is a one and a half story with two attached structures on the back; one saw tooth and a rectangular in footprint front gable structure. The proposed plans include the removal of a non historic shed and shower, located on the southeast part of the house. The plans also include the removal of a non historic structure attached to the southwest side of the house, which is used as the laundry.

The project also consists on the renovation of the back portion of the house, used as a kitchen. This portion of the house will retain its original footprint as well as its roofline. The existing kitchen will have an addition to its southeast side. This addition will be approximately 6'-6" wide by 11'-7" depth. The proposed addition will have a front gable roof and will have the same height as the existing saw tooth. The plans also include a new swimming pool in the backyard and new pavers on the north west side yard.

V-crimp metal panels will be covering the roof and lap siding will be used, to match existing. The plans proposes one 6 over 6 aluminum window and impact resistance double French doors for the back. On the South East elevation the plans proposes the change of a one over one hung window, located on the saw tooth portion, with two 6 over 6 wood windows.

According to the Sanborn maps of 1912, 1926 and 1948 the house still have almost the same footprint configuration. Also according to the Sanborn Maps a cistern was located where the kitchen will be expanded.

Guidelines that should be reviewed for this application;

- Additions and alterations- pages 36-38:
 - *(1) A structure shall not be altered and/or expanded in such a manner that its essential character defining features are disguised or concealed-* Staff understands that the proposed addition is sensible to the historic fabric of the house.
 - *(2)- Additions and alterations may be reviewed more liberally on non-contributing buildings, which lack architectural distinction-* This house is listed as a contributing structure. The removal of non historic structures that has been attached through years will improve the historic character of this house. The proposed addition will be attached on the back side of the house.
 - *(3) Addition design should be compatible with the characteristics of the original structure, neighboring buildings and streetscapes-* The proposed addition will be compatible with existing materials, form and characteristics the contributing house has as well as its surrounding neighborhood.
 - *(4)- Additions should be constructed with a scale, height and mass that is appropriate to the original building and its neighbors-* The proposed project retains the existing footprint and roof line of the back portion of the house. The new addition will have the same height as the existing saw tooth and its mass is appropriate to the house and its surrounding houses.

- *(5)- Additions should be attached to less publicly visible secondary elevations of an historic structure-* The proposed additions will be attached to a secondary back side elevation.
- *(8)-New additions should be designed and constructed to be clearly differentiated from the historical so that character defining features are not changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed-* The use of a front gable for the small addition is a sensible way of differentiate the new construction from the historic fabric of the house.

Staff understands that the proposed project will not have an adverse effect to the historic house or its surroundings. Staff also understands that the proposed addition on the back is in keeping with the scale and mass of the existing house. Staff understands that the proposed plans are consistent with the Historic Architectural Guidelines. Staff recommends to this honorable commission to **approve** the plans as presented.