



**City of Key West
Tree Commission Meeting
February 9, 2009
510 Greene Street, Old City Hall, 5:00 PM
Minutes**

1. Call Meeting to Order

2. Roll Call

Tree Commissioners:

 x **Julio Barroso**
 x **Danilo Crespo**
 x **Gregory Curry**
 x **Mimi McCoy Grantham**
 x **Sandra Lee – Chairperson**
 x **Rudy Molinet**
 x **Niels Weise**

Staff:

 x **Ronald Ramsingh**
Asst. City Attorney
 x **Cynthia Domenech-Coogle**
Urban Forestry Program Manager
 x **Gladys Abreda**
Administrative Secretary

3. Approval of the Agenda

(a) Additions/Changes:

Ms. Sandra Lee requested the addition of 2 items not on agenda but were submitted prior to deadline. Added: 7 (e) 526 Louisa Street, John Maloney and 7(f) 920 Cornish Lane, Gayle Norton.

4. Presentations

Urban Forestry Program Manager Report

Staff has 2 items to report; Ms. Amy Kimball-Murley, Planning Director is working to close loopholes in permitting, staff is very diligent with applications making sure applicant has considered all trees and landscaping in project. Staff will hold application until Landscape Dept. reviews plan.

Cont. Pg. 2 TC Agenda 02/09/09

Wednesday 02/11/09 at 5pm, Old City Hall a special meeting has been scheduled by the City Commission regarding the Washingtonia palms at the city's cemetery.

5. Approval of Minutes

- (a) **May 14, 2007**
- (b) **September 10, 2007**
- (c) **October 15, 2007**
- (d) **December 08, 2008**
- (e) **January 12, 2009**

Julio Barroso, motion to approve minutes for December 08, 2008 and January 12, 2009, Niels Weise second.

6. Resolutions Tabled Items: n a

7. Resolutions:

(a) **714 Windsor Lane, Brad Shirley:** Represented by Dan's Tropical Tree Service and Craig Reynolds and Craig Reynolds, Landscape Architect. Remove (8) Spanish Lime trees.

Approved **Denied** **Tabled** **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. Reynolds preliminary landscape plan shows, 24 Pigeon Plum and 8 Crabwood trees. Ms. Lee questioned the installed height to which Mr. Reynolds replied minimum 2 inch caliper at 4' above ground.

Replacements: 48.9 caliper inches of native canopy trees, Fl #1, to be planted on site.

Motion to approve: Julio Barroso, second Niels Weise

(b) **907 Packer, Jacob & Margie Humbert:** Request concerning replacement requirement.

Approved **Denied** **Tabled** **Further Action**

Notes: Staff described financial hardship of applicant and requested the replacement requirement to be waved. The Humbert's tree was an emergency removal of an Orchid tree in December, 08.

Motion to approve with no replacement Niels Weise, second Julio Barroso.

(c) **822 Thomas Street, David Dulinski:** Represented by Bill Wilson. Remove Ficus benjamina tree.

Approved **Denied** **Tabled** **Further Action**

Notes: Ficus is growing on fence, roots have extended into the sidewalk

Replacements: 4 caliper inches, native canopy trees, Fl #1, to be planted on site.

Motion to approve, Gregory Curry, second Rudy Molinet

(d) 3400 Duck Avenue, Housing Authority/Poinciana Plaza, Poinciana Royale:

Represented by Craig Reynolds, Landscape Architect. Landscape Plan Approval.

Approved **Denied** **Table** **Further Action**

Notes: Mr. Reynolds has been working with staff to make sure what is being removed is replaced; he also submitted a second set of drawings at meeting to reflect changes made with staff since application submission. 19 Seagrape trees will be retained closest to Duck Avenue and remove remainder of buffer hedge, swales have been adjusted and planter areas have been increased. Staff described changes made in second set of drawings; Gumbo Limbo closest to Duck Avenue – planter space has been increased by 2 parking spaces to give root system ample space 28’, all remaining trees will have barricades to dripline. Ms. Mimi McCoy-Grantham asked if project is for private town homes or affordable houses, Mr. Reynolds response: Aids Help; Ms. Sandra asked if plan is in proper scale and building orientation correct, Mr. Reynolds response was affirmative, building footage is on plan. Mr. Rudy Molinet asked Mr. Reynolds about synthetic grass shown in plan. Mr. Reynolds response was to be considered only in courtyard as St. Augustine or Bermuda grass is high maintenance, he chose synthetic grass instead of concrete. Staff stated the utility wires will be removed. Mr. Reynolds said they are going to leave 19 seagrapes on Duck Ave. side and remove the rest. He mentioned that in his plan ramp will be raised at entrance of building for wheelchair access.

Replacements: 121.9” caliper inches, native canopy trees, to be planted on site.

Motion to approve as per plans submitted: Rudy Molinet requested to retain the 4 buttonwoods toward North end of property, if possible, second Julio Barroso.

(e) 526 Louisa Street, John Mahoney: Represented by Ken King Golden Bough Tree.

Remove (1) Poinciana tree.

Approved **Denied** **Table** **Further Action**

Note: Mr. King stated that the tree has decay in the trunk and in very poor condition, staff agreed. Co-dominant branch had been removed; staff also added that Poinciana trees are very poor compartmentalizers and has decayed at least 2’ into the trunk from large branch removal, wet, and necrotic branch tips.

Replacement: 13 caliper inches native canopy trees, Fl #1, to be planted on site.

Motion to approve Niels Weise, second Julio Barroso

(f) **920 Cornish Lane, Gayle Norton:** Represented by Ken King Golden Bough Tree Service. Remove (1) Poinciana tree.

Note: Ken King reported tree is uplifting part of the porch connected to the house, the support roots are very close to the house, is only 8 years old and is already very large. Mr. King stated the homeowner wants to build an addition onto the house where the tree is. Ms. Mimi McCoy-Grantham asked staff the condition of tree, staff replied the tree is in very good condition, but one of the support roots is growing under one of the columns that support the roof and is slight lifting the porch. Ms. Sandra Lee said that this is a consequence of planting trees too close to the house we have to educate the community. Ken King stated the house has been rented for 20 years and that the owners would be returning to live in the house. Mr. Rudy Molinet's opinion is the tree is beautiful and it provides a lot of canopy to the neighborhood. Mr. Barroso shares same opinion and he would like to have proof of the landscape plan and a letter stating that the tree is damaging the house.

Motioned to deny: Mr. Barroso, second Mr. Molinet, discussion: Mr. Crespo stated by denying motion homeowner has to wait 6 months to reapply again, **Mr. Barroso requested to resend denial motion and to table pending a landscape plan and a letter stating damage is currently being done to house. Mr. Molinet withdrew original second to deny motion and seconded motion to table.**

Asst. City Attorney Mr. Ramsingh stated a unanimous decision must be made in order to overturn the denial motion and to table. Ms. Lee asked commissioners if there is unanimous consent to change motion to which everyone responded in the affirmative.

Ms. Lee asked if there was no further discussion are there any no votes to table, to which Mr. Curry replied. Roll Call: Mr. Curry-no, Mr. Molinet-yes, Ms. Lee-no, Mr. Barroso-yes, Mr. Weise-no, Mr. Crespo-no. **Motion to table failed.**

Further discussion ensued concerning safety, building safety and documentation of damage.

Motion to approve removal with landscape plan submitted prior to release of permit: Mr. Weise, second Mr. Curry

Roll call: Mr. Curry-yes, Mr. Molinet-no, Ms. Lee-yes, Mr. Barroso-no, Mr. Weise-yes, Mr. Crespo-yes. **Motion carries to approve removal.**

8. Administrative Hearing

9. Champion Tree Nomination

10. Discussion Items

Staff would like Commission to think about set money fines for the first and subsequent offenders of Tree Protection Ordinance, for instance signs nailed to trees, yard sale signs etc.; hurricane pruned palm trees like Southernmost and Hyatt Hotels.

Mimi McCoy-Grantham excused at 5:51 for prior engagement

Meeting adjourned at 6:00 pm

11. Staff and Emergency Approval Permits

- (a) **1406 Laird Street**, Allen Zamrok. Remove (3) Coconut Palms. **Permit 5273**
- (b) **901 Grinnell Street**, Bill McLin. Remove (2) Queen Palms. **Permit 5274**
- (c) **1221 Duval Street**, Jerry & Yuliya Andrews. Remove (1) Coconut Palm. **Permit 5275**
- (d) **1221 Newton Street**, William Carmack. Remove (1) Coconut Palm. **Permit 5276**
- (e) **410 Caroline Street**, Suzanne Campbell. Remove (1) Christmas Palm. **Permit 5277**
- (f) **701 Fleming Street**, Robert Alfandre. Remove (7) McArthur Palms. **Permit 5281**