

HARC

Historic Architectural Review Commission
13 March

The Historic Architectural Review Commission of the City of Key West, Florida, held a regular meeting on Tuesday, March 13, 2007 at 3:00 p.m., second floor, Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street, Key West, Florida.

Notice to Applicants: Once HARC approval is obtained a building permit application must be submitted. The Building Department will call the applicant when a building permit is ready to be issued.

*Discussion on any one item shall take a maximum of 20 minutes to include the presentation by the applicant (5-10 minutes), public comment, and discussion by the Commission. Further discussion beyond that time is at the Chair's discretion.

*If your item is tabled, any additional documentation must be submitted by Tuesday (4:00 pm) prior to the next meeting.

Please Note: Chapter 286- Public Business: Miscellaneous Provisions

286.0105 Notices of meetings and hearings must advise that a record is required to appeal. –Each board, commission, or agency of this state or of any political subdivision thereof shall include in the notice of any meeting or hearing, if notice of the meeting or hearing is required, of such board, commission, or agency, conspicuously on such notice, the advice that, if a person decides to appeal any decision made by the board, agency, or commission with respect to any matter considered at such meeting or hearing, he or she will need a record of the proceedings, and that, for such purpose, he or she may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. The requirements of this section do not apply to the notice provided in s. 200.065(3).

City of Key West Planning Department, Notice to HARC Applicants

If you are in the process of improving your property or making structural changes, there may be more required of you than the design and beautification requirements from HARC.

1. Please be advised that if you are contemplating an addition to your building (whether an additional story, or on the same level), you may need to go through the variance process.
2. If an additional structure is planned, whether separate or linked in any manner to the main or existing building, some configurations may trigger the variance application process.
3. Many alterations will need to meet the basic setbacks, building coverage and other requirements that are zone-specific.

Sometimes, simple changes in building plans now may help you avoid going through

another process at a later date, delaying your project.

If you or your contractor, architect or other professional representative need further information, please visit us at 604 Simonton 2nd floor, or call for an appointment at (305) 809-3726.

Call to order:

Roll call.

Patricia Eables, Chair
Barbara Bowers
Vincent Mancini
Michael Miller
Nils Muench

Staff: Diane Silvia, Historic Preservation Planner
Larry Erskine, Assistant City Attorney

Invocation.

Pledge of Allegiance.

Approval of last minutes.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve the minutes from the meeting on February 27, 2007. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

Changes to the agenda.

Clarification item 3- 315 Pecan Lane and Tabled item 3- 100 Admirals Lane were withdrawn from this agenda.

Vincent Mancini served as Acting Chair until Patricia Eables arrived.

APPLICATIONS REQUIRING CLARIFICATION:

Michael Miller recused himself as he is the Architect for 612 and 614 Ashe Street see form 8b).

CL1. H07-02-23-244 **612 Ashe Street, Michael Miller, Architect**

Demolishing past additions. Adding new structure to existing house with gabled roof. Adding rear porch with pergola.

Michael Miller presented a drawing showing this small historic cottage with inappropriate additions. A rear flat roof addition and a shed roof dormer were added, followed by a second floor deck and gable roof and a rear covered porch. He is proposing to remove these additions and replace them with a two story sawtooth addition and rear porch.

Nils Muench asked if the metal shingle roof will be retained on the historic structure.

Mr. Miller said they will probably use v-crimp.

Mr. Mancini said they can use metal shingles on the addition if they would like. He asked if the poolhouse is existing.

Mr. Miller said yes. The addition is in scale with the historic structure as it is only two feet higher.

Mr. Muench asked about impervious surface.

Mr. Mancini said we need to stay with design issues.

Mr. Muench said this is an excellent presentation.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve. Nils Muench seconded the motion. The addition may have either a metal shingle or v-crimp roof.

APPROVE__X__ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

CL2. H07-02-23-245 614 Ashe Street, Michael Miller, Architect

Add 4 dormers to existing roof. Rear covered porch addition.
Lowering attic floor.

Michael Miller presented the project. They are proposing to add 4 dormers to the gable roof and a covered rear porch.

The existing skylights would be replaced by the dormers for use as a bedroom. The rear would have French doors and shutters. French door and shutters would also be added at the side of the house.

Nils Muench noted the windows are of different styles.

Michael Miller said there are 2 over 2 and casement windows. There is a fanlight window at the rear. 3 over 3 windows are proposed for the dormers. They may apply latter for window replacement.

Vincent Mancini was concerned with the addition of 4 dormers. The dormers in the front are problematic as they are highly visible (guidelines for dormers page 27). The upstairs bathroom could be reconfigured.

Mr. Miller said the dormers are symmetrical.

Mr. Mancini said not everything has to be symmetrical.

Nils Muench motioned to approve. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion. Vincent Mancini objected to the two front dormers.

APPROVE__X__ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

CL3. H07-02-28-266 315 Peacon Lane, William Rowan, Architect

Removed 2 proposed windows in south elevation leaving 1. Offset addition from Historic Structure 6" to emphasize the addition as an addition. Added door in the east elevation onto existing deck. Revised roof to gable from shed.

Withdrawn from this agenda.

APPROVE _____ DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

CL4. H07-03-01-271 1201 Duval Street, Creative Construction, Inc.

Substitute 2 X 6 treks decking for 2 X 6 wood decking on balcony over Duval Street for durability and appearance.

No one was present to answer the Commission's questions. Therefore, the project was tabled.

APPROVE _____ DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE X _____

CL5. H07-03-01-272 518 Duval Street, Bruce Marteney

Removal of existing glazed storefront, glass entry doors, awnings, shutters, exterior lighting, signage and new paint on existing plaster face.

Bruce Marteney presented the project. They would like to replace the existing glazed storefront with new 3/4" thick tempered laminated glass storefront windows. A row of stone tile will run along the wall base with stainless trim. The flooring will be granite with a new sloped entry. A new dark blue awning will run across the façade.

Michael Miller asked what they plan to do with the windows regarding wind pressures. They may have to come up with a shuttering system. Perhaps removable panels.

Mr. Muench said the guidelines for signs (page 49) restrict letter height to 12". The signage shown has 18" letters.

Mr. Marteney said they will reduce the lettering height and will apply for signage in a separate application.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve the proposed project with the exception of signage. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE X _____ DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

CL6. H07-03-01-274 **1115-1117 Von Phister Street, Gary Thomas**
Demolish existing 2 story frame building. Building is unsafe and non-contributing.

No one was present to answer the Commission's questions. Therefore, the project was tabled.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X_____

CL7. H07-03-01-275 **519 Duval Street and 522 Bahama Street, Thomas Pope, Architect**
Increase building height from 28' to 33'6" (5.5' increase) for Bahama Street structure (original HARC # H06-01-12-54).

Thomas Pope and Mark Phillips (property owner) presented the project. This building is currently under construction. They are asking to increase the height 3'1". They have discussed this with the neighbors and there are no objections. The neighboring structure is 34'. This project is all new construction.

Michael Miller said this is a lot in the middle of down town. He does not object to the height. But would like to see some landscaping.

Mr. Phillips said Mr. Jungles will design a paver driveway and landscaping.

Vincent Mancini motioned to approve. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion.

APPROVE__X__ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

CL8. H07-03-02-281 **1317 Grinnell Street, Robert Delaune, Architect**
Demolish existing screen porch; entry deck & stairs; left, right, and rear chain link fences. Construct left side open porch; new roof with dormers; new rail @ second floor front deck; new left and right side 6' wood fences; new 5' CBS wall @ rear property line to match existing.

Robert Delaune presented the project. This is a noncontributing structure. He is proposing to remove the existing roof and replace it with a new roof with 6 dormers. A railing will be added to the second floor front deck. Replacement windows will probably be aluminum windows clad. The T-111 siding will be replaced with hardiboard.

Michael Miller asked what window manufacturer he is using.

Mr. Delaune said he will use Anderson aluminum clad windows.

Mr. Miller thinks Anderson uses internal mutins. There are other manufacturers that put

them on the outside. We need to be consistent on this.

Mr. Delaune said we can stipulate the use of external grills or mutins.

Mr. Muench asked what Mr. Miller thinks about the dormers.

Mr. Miller said they are actually gables. There is nothing in the guidelines that would disallow this.

Mr. Erskine said the guidelines for dormers on page 27 states "the juncture of a dormer with the main roof should be below the ridgeline of the main roof.

Nils Muench asked Larry Erskine if 1/2" lower is qualifies as lower.

Mr. Erskine said that is lower.

Mr. Delaune said they are gable additions.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve. Michael Miller seconded the motion.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

Patricia Eables arrived.

CL9. H07-03-02-283 North corner of William and Seminole Avenue, Gonzalez Architects

Revision to previous approval H06-02-03-189- relocate building on site at William and Seminole.

Jose Gonzalez explained they are asking to revise the previous approval by allowing the relocated building to be rotated to avoid an active lift station. They wanted to preserve this structure. It was to be located on an angle but can not be placed that way.

With this location the porches will be to the front facing Seminole Street. The level of the grade will be brought up to the porch so it is a gradual ramp for ADA access.

Nils Muench motioned to approve. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion. Vincent Mancini objected to the motion.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

TABLED ITEMS

T1. H07-02-01-138 922 Catherine Street, Thomas E. Pope

New front porch, dormers and windows at gabled end and new French doors.

Thomas Pope presented the project.

Michael Miller said the drawings are incomplete as they are not annotated.

Mr. Pope said this is an initial application as they are trying to find out if this can possibly be approved as they must go for a variance. They will use wood siding...

Mr. Miller asked Mr. Muench what he thinks about the height of the proposed dormers.

Nils Muench said he does not feel it follows the intent of the guidelines. The dormers should be clearly lower. The guidelines state (page 27) "the juncture of a dormer roof with the main roof should be below the ridgeline of the main roof."

Vincent Mancini said he feels the proposed porch fights the design of the house.

Mr. Muench reviewed the guidelines for outbuildings. The plans show a note for a carport. The guidelines for outbuildings state (page 40) "no accessory structure may be built in the front yard of a structure in the historic district" and "the construction of new accessory buildings such as garages or carports which are highly visible from the public right-of-way are not appropriate in the historic district."

Mr. Pope said there will not be a carport. That is a mistake. It will simply be car parking with no structure.

Vincent Mancini motioned to table so the project can be further developed and the drawings can be annotated. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X__

T2. H07-01-31-136 1401 Duval Street, Schroeder Builders

Rebuild first and second floor porches to original. Remove first floor porch enclosure. Build new porches on right side of building to match original. Approx. 40 linear feet per floor.

No one was present to answer the Commission's questions. Therefore, the project was tabled.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X__

T3.H07-02-12-187 **100 Admirals Lane, Edward De Leon**

I respectfully request HARC approval of pre-existing (installed in 2003) replacement PGT high impact windows and doors for a non-historic home constructed in 1994 located in the Truman Annex.

Withdrawn from this agenda.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

Other Business:

Nils Muench presented a revised brochure with a new cover illustration and new text font. He plans to embellish this new illustration with the addition of metal shingles on the roof, 6/6 windows and palm trees.

Vincent Mancini said they would not have had 6/6 windows at that time.

The Commission agreed the brochure looks very nice.

Michael Miller presented an analytical summary on wood windows. Marvin is now making a putty glazed wood window with thinner mullions and mutins priced at \$670. Jim Illinghouse Millwork makes custom windows exactly like the historic windows. They use Spanish cedar which will hold up in our climate. Marvin said they can use cedar but it would be substantially more expensive. Lindsey windows are made out of white pine like the Marvin. The Lindsey would run a total of \$775.

Mr. Miller hopes we can soon come to an agreement on windows. Putty glazed windows are the appropriate form for historic structures.

Vincent Mancini said most historic windows are 2'10" wide by 4'7" high. The size of the historic openings should be retained.

Mr. Miller agreed with Barbara Bowers that windows create the personality of the house. Noncontributing structures and additions should be permitted to have the impact windows.

Nils Muench said his windows are historic. He is concerned that so many people are installing solid wood panels and aluminum panels on their historic houses for insurance purposes.

Mr. Miller said if someone buys an antique house they should know what they bought.

Barbara Bowers said we need to protect the integrity of historic structures while allowing some protection.

Mr. Mancini said we need to save as much of old Key West as we can. We need to work with the structure, not against it and have more public workshops.

Mr. Muench said 90% of the fences are inappropriate.

Mr. Miller said he is flattered that Mr. Muench would like to use his application as an example for others. There are not many applicants that could be that thorough. We can develop an example for the public. It is difficult to tell an applicant their application is insufficient.

The Commission set a tentative workshop date for 5: 00 for on April 16th or 17th.

Ms. Eables said we should think about the different things we want to address. If anyone wants to write on a topic they should do so we can discuss it at the workshop.

As there was no other business Vincent Mancini motioned to adjourn. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane Silvia,
Historic Preservation Planner