

HARC

Historic Architectural Review Commission
24 October 2006

The Historic Architectural Review Commission of the City of Key West, Florida, held a regular meeting on Tuesday, October, 24 2006 at 3:00 p.m., second floor, Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street, Key West, Florida.

Notice to Applicants: Once HARC approval is obtained a building permit application must be submitted. The Building Department will call the applicant when a building permit is ready to be issued.

*Discussion on any one item shall take a maximum of 20 minutes to include the presentation by the applicant (5-10 minutes), public comment, and discussion by the Commission. Further discussion beyond that time is at the Chair's discretion.

*If your item is tabled, any additional documentation must be submitted by Tuesday (4:00 pm) prior to the next meeting.

Please Note: Chapter 286- Public Business: Miscellaneous Provisions

286.0105 Notices of meetings and hearings must advise that a record is required to appeal. –Each board, commission, or agency of this state or of any political subdivision thereof shall include in the notice of any meeting or hearing, if notice of the meeting or hearing is required, of such board, commission, or agency, conspicuously on such notice, the advice that, if a person decides to appeal any decision made by the board, agency, or commission with respect to any matter considered at such meeting or hearing, he or she will need a record of the proceedings, and that, for such purpose, he or she may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. The requirements of this section do not apply to the notice provided in s. 200.065(3).

City of Key West Planning Department, Notice to HARC Applicants

If you are in the process of improving your property or making structural changes, there may be more required of you than the design and beautification requirements from HARC.

1. Please be advised that if you are contemplating an addition to your building (whether an additional story, or on the same level), you may need to go through the variance process.
2. If an additional structure is planned, whether separate or linked in any manner to the main or existing building, some configurations may trigger the variance application process.
3. Many alterations will need to meet the basic setbacks, building coverage and other requirements that are zone-specific.

Sometimes, simple changes in building plans now may help you avoid going through another process at a later date, delaying your project.

If you or your contractor, architect or other professional representative need further information, please visit us at 604 Simonton 2nd floor, or call for an appointment at (305) 809-3726.

Call to order:

Roll call.

Patricia Eables, chair

Barbara Bowers

Terry Garcia

Vincent Mancini

Nils Muench

Michael Miller, absent

Staff: Diane Silvia, Historic Preservation Planner

Invocation.

Pledge of Allegiance.

Approval of last minutes.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve the minutes from the meeting on October 10, 2006.

Nils Muench seconded the motion.

Changes to the Agenda.

Clarification item No.1: 606 Truman Avenue #3 and No. 4: 1410 Olivia Street are withdrawn from this agenda.

TABLED ITEM

T1. H06-08-28-1294 (A) 727 Waddell Street, Paul Cox

Change to roof structure. Change roof from hip to Gable.

Change side rear roof from Gable to Hip add rear porch roof on existing deck. Add 5' side door over on left side add Gable roof exterior on right side. Change rear fence from 6' to 9' tall.

H06-08-28-1295 (B) 731 Waddell Street, Paul Cox

Changes to roof structure. Change rear roof from Hip to Gable.

Add rear porch roof on existing deck. Add 5' side dormer on right side. Add Gable roof exterior on left side. Change rear fence from 6' tall to 9' tall.

Paul Cox, 710 White Street, presented the project. He explained they are changing the side gable roof to a hip roof and eliminating the rear dormer. The upper balcony has been

eliminated as discussed at the previous meeting. .

Barbara Bowers asked why the shutters were deleted

Mr. Cox said they will not be needed as they are using impact windows.

Public Input: Margaret Domanski said she and her husband Ken are here for the seventh time regarding this project. They have been concerned with the size of the structure from the start. She thanked Mr. Cox for eliminating the rear dormer and returning to a hip roof form. These were their biggest concerns. They would prefer that all of the dormers are eliminated as there are no other third story dormers in the area. For the record they are not concerned with the changes to windows and doors. They would have preferred the shutters to remain as neighboring homes have shutters.

Mr. Marcus and his wife Barbara referred to a letter in the file where Mr. Cox has agreed to a landscape plan that will screen the new construction from view. They are pleased with this agreement and requested a copy of the notarized letter.

Vincent Mancini said if the dormers are all eliminated the structures will look even more massive as the roof will not be broken up.

Barbara Bowers said the elimination of the shutters differentiates this from a historic structure.

Mrs. Domanski said she has some ideas about increasing community involvement and would like to participate in the upcoming workshop.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve. Vincent Mancini seconded the motion.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE TABLE

APPLICATIONS REQUIRING CLARIFICATION:

CL1. H06-10-03-1457 **606 Truman Avenue #3, Susan Ruskin**

Replace 5 windows in back. Replace shed doors on outside deck.
After the fact.

Withdrawn from this agenda.

APPROVE DISAPPROVE TABLE

CL2.H06-10-03-1459 912 White Street, Carlos Rojas A1A

Add 2nd story to rear half of residence.

Carlos Rojas, project Architect, said the homeowners need more room. The addition will be barely visible from across the street. This is a modest addition as the lot is small. There are other more imposing additions nearby. They have discussed the proposed addition with the neighbors and they are not objecting.

Nils Muench said he is concerned that the new addition (page 38, No. 8) is not differentiated from the historic structure as per our guidelines.

Mr. Rojas said they could distinguish it by siding type through the use of hardi-board or board and batten siding.

Barbara Bowers said the proposed siding looks nice. Perhaps it could be distinguished by using different windows like 2/2 or 4/4.

Vincent Mancini suggested using 1/1. He was concerned that the new addition will overlap the historic structure by 4 feet.

Mr. Rojas said he has no intention to do this. He plans to use the structural wall between the kitchen and the bathroom.

Vincent Mancini motioned to approve with the condition the addition begins at the rear-most structural wall so as not to overlap the historic structure; the siding is wood and windows are 1/1.

Barbara Bowers, Nils Muench, and Patricia Eables said they have no objection to using a different window style on the addition as this is new construction.

Barbara Bowers seconded the motion with the amendment that 1/1, 2/2, or 4/4 windows can be used on the addition.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE TABLE

CL.3 H06-10-03-1460 719 Fleming Street, Carlos Rojas A1A

Add gable/dormer to cabana at rear.

Carlos Rojas, project Architect, presented the project. He would like to add a gable/dormer to the cabana. This will not be visible from the street.

Vincent Mancini asked if the doors are wood.

Mr. Rojas said yes.

The property owner said they are using reclaimed windows from the house.

Vincent Mancini motioned to approve the project as submitted. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE__X__ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

CL.4 H06-10-04-1472 **1410 Olivia Street, JJ Fairbank Construction**

Demolition of rear porch and deck, demolish remove deck around pool. Replace w/new decking. Build new one story addition and storage shed, new kitchen and interior finishes as per plans.

Withdrawn from this agenda.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

CL5. H06-10-10-1504 **110 Geraldine Street, M. Skoglund**

New residence.

Michael Skoglund, project architect, presented plans for a new low cost structure for the Bahama Land Trust.

Barbara Bowers asked if there had been a structure on the property.

Nils Muench asked for clarification on the proposed structure's orientation.

Mr. Skoglund explained the structure will be on a portion of a larger property 87' X 100'. It is at the rear.

Vincent Mancini asked about the siding material.

Mr. Skoglund said he plans to use wood siding.

Terry Garcia asked why he prefers wood over hardi-board.

Mr. Skoglund said hardi-board does not hold up well once the skin is punctured.

Barbara Bowers motioned to approve the project as submitted. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE__X__ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

CL6. H06-10-13-1526 **715 Seminole Avenue, Gonzalez Architects**

Revision of existing approval reduction to 13 units. Plan changes.

No one was present to answer the Commission's questions. Vincent Mancini motioned to table. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X__

CL7. H06-10-13-1529 728 Love Lane, Wayne LaRue Smith

Replace all existing exterior alum. six over six windows with Anderson series 400 wood (vinyl-clad exterior) storm rated six over six windows.

Wayne LaRue Smith, project attorney, presented the project. He submitted blown up photos of the small photos that had been provided for the file. They are applying for after the fact approval of window changes. Window replacement had been previously approved as part of a large renovation project. They did not know that there was a problem until the final HARC inspection when the installed windows were not accepted as they are not wood. Mr. Smith feels the installed vinyl clad window exterior is indistinguishable from wood windows. They have obtained a temporary CO by posting as bond for the City. He provided a photo of the home showing that the house, when purchased, had all aluminum 6/6 windows. He explained that the plans approved specified Peachtree Aluminum clad 6/6 windows. The contractor could not get the windows so instead ordered a superior window, the Anderson vinyl clad window. Impact windows have to be clad with something. The owners were unaware of the window change.

Diane Silvia said she preformed the final HARC inspection and the HARC plans specified wood windows. These are not the plans that were submitted to the Building Department. The windows installed on the addition are fine and required to be impact. The windows on the historic house are the problem. Wood windows would require a shuttering system.

The Commission reviewed the minutes that specified the metal windows will be replaced with wood windows.

Patricia Eables explained we have been having a problem with applicants submitting different plans to the Building Department than the ones approved by HARC.

Nils Muench said his opinion is the rule needs to change. We will address this issue at the upcoming workshop. We should table this until after the workshop.

Mr. Smith said they cannot get a permanent CO until this is resolved.

Barbara Bowers said this issue does need to be resolved. The fact that so many windows have survived for 150 years suggests they are stable.

Barbara Bowers motioned to table so this topic can be addressed again after the upcoming special workshop in November. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE _____ DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE X _____

CL8. H06-10-13-1532 **508 South Street, Peter Pike Architect**

Revision: New conference facility raise some units for parking underneath.

Peter Pike, project Architect, presented the project along with Bob Newsome from his office. Also present are Matt Babage, General Manager, Carrie Babage, Marty Selion (sp), and Dale Rains (sp), owner and CEO of the project. They are not planning to raise any of the buildings previously approved. The buildings were already approved on 8' stilts to meet elevation requirements. They now plan to put the parking under the buildings which will allow them to decrease density and increase green space. They are proposing a half story on a portion of one building. They are here because of the recent court decision to allow 2 ½ stories over parking. This is a revision of the previous HARC approval. There will be an 80 unit expansion. They have removed one of the units on Southard Street to create more space between the two buildings. The unit has been moved to another building back on the site.

Nils Muench said we need a more detailed description of the proposed work. He wanted to know the number of floors above parking for each of the buildings.

Peter Pike said there are essentially three buildings and a lobby addition. One is 1 1/2 stories over parking, the one on the corner is 2 stories on grade, the third building is 2 stories over parking with the exception of a portion that is 2 ½ stories over parking. The other portion is 2 ½ stories with no parking.

Barbara Bowers asked if any of the buildings exceed 40'. When this project was previously reviewed there was no public opposition. How do the neighbors feel about the 2 ½ stories now.

Mr. Pike said Michael Halphren and Charlie Ramos have reviewed the drawings and still support the project.

Shelia Rowan asked how many units have been added.

Mr. Pike said they have not added any units. There will be 123 units and 100 parking spaces. 86 spaces are required as the City Code allows them to have a reduced number of parking spaces if they substitute bicycle parking. There will also be golf cart access through the property. This will be a destination resort.

Mr. Muench asked about public access to the site.

Mr. Pike said there will be some security for guest privacy.

Marty Saturn, 1401 Simonton is a partner on the Santa Maria and on the original Atlantic Shores proposal. The court decision gives HARC the ability to approve this project. The City Commission did not support Commissioner Verge's proposed ordinance as they did not want to re-invent the wheel. He fully supports the project.

Mr. Muench said we need a much more detailed summary of the work.

Vince Mancini said we can add the detailed description to a motion.

Mr. Pike said the drawings should speak for themselves. The file contains reduced drawings of the ones presented here on the display boards. He can get a copy of these to the HARC office.

Dale Rams, the managing member, said there is a misunderstanding. None of these buildings have been raised any more than when they were first reviewed. They are simply putting the parking below in the spaces that were already approved. The space before was going to be empty but was necessary to gain the required building elevation. By placing the parking under the buildings the atmosphere will be greatly improved by the additional landscaping.

Public input: Shelia Rowan said a presentation of this scope should require photos of the surrounding area. They should have to provide hard line drawings.

Patricia Eables said these are in the file from the initial application.

Vincent Mancini motioned to approve. Terry Garcia seconded the motion. Nils Muench objected to the motion.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

CL9. H06-10-13-1533 **717 Emma Street, Michael Demchak**

Remove existing siding and replace w/ Hardi plank painted white. Replace existing windows with 6/6 wood Marvin with new casings painted white same location, same size. Cover up hallway window on façade as shown. Remove existing carport shed.

Michael Demchak, 1425 White Street, presented the project. They would like to replace the asbestos siding and T-111 siding with hardi-board. He would like to replace all of the windows with wood Marvin 6/6. The carport will also be removed.

Barbara Bowers asked why they want 6/6 windows. As this is a newer structure why not use a more contemporary window style like 2/2 or 1/1.

Vince Mancini motioned to approve with the condition that 1/1 windows are used. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

(Barbara Bowers recused herself as she is the owner of the property).

CL10. H06-10-13-1534 **320 William Street, William Rowan, Architect**

Replace 1970 addition with new two story addition.

Barbara Bowers asked the Commission to table this as she has made changes to the windows and will present it next time.

Vincent Mancini motioned to table. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X__

CL11. H06-10-13-1535 **1227 Duval Street, Republic Builders, Inc**

Renovations to existing building as per attached drawings and sheet attached- scope of exterior work.

No one was present to answer the Commission's questions. Vincent Mancini motioned to table. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X__

TABLED ITEMS

T2.H06-08-11-1206 **622 Caroline Street, Greg Kerr, agent for Albert Canfield/Adele V. Stones**

Seeking Certificate of No Contributing Value to obtain approval for demo of existing single story residence and accessory structure.

Ginny Stones, Attorney, requested the application be tabled so the replacement plans can be completed.

Barbara Bowers motioned to table. Nils Muench seconded the motion.

APPROVE_____ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE__X__

T3. H06-09-01-1322 **722 Ashe Street, Greg Kerr/Adele V. Stones**

New single family residence, 2 story wood frame construction, gable roof with porches and balconies per plans.

Ginny Stones, Attorney, said these are revised plans (dated Oct. 3, 2006) based on the Commission's recommendations. The drawings have been annotated as requested. Anderson, Storm Guard, vinyl clad windows will be used. The structure will have hardi-board siding and v-crimp roofing. The exterior will be ocre (golden tan) with Kelly green shutters and white trim.

Nils Muench was concerned with the third level deck.

Barbara Bowers said this is one issue the neighbors on Waddell Street objected to. At the last meeting Michael Miller said third floor decks were not a typical element used in the past.

Terry Garcia said this is common in Truman Annex.

Ms. Bowers said it depends on the size of neighboring structures.

Mr. Muench noted this deck was shown on previous version of the plans.

Mr. Mancini said this is a new structure.

Vincent Mancini motioned to approve the plans dated October 3, 2006. and Terry Garcia seconded the motion.

APPROVE X DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

T4. H06-09-29-1442 **1401 Simonton Street, Gonzalez Architects**

Change text on canopy signage from "Motel" to "Resort" same size and style.

No one was present to answer the Commission's questions. Vincent Mancini motioned to table. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion.

APPROVE _____ DISAPPROVE _____ TABLE _____

T5. H06-09-29-1448 **809 Virginia Street, Thomas Kelly**

Pool house & carport.

Thomas Kelly presented the project. He explained the main structure that exists now is a noncontributing CBS structure. They have set the carport back 6'. The carport is 20' deep.

Barbara Bowers said the issue is that the carport is overwhelming to the house. Can you move it back 6 more feet so that it is back to the front edge of the house? He will get sun in the pool house if the overhang has to be eliminated.

Nils Muench said he does not feel the lack of a carport is a hardship. A carport is not a necessity.

Mr. Kelly said he has presented photos of existing carports within walking distance of this property.

The Commission reviewed the guidelines for outbuildings (Page 40) No. 2 "no accessory structure may be built in the front yard of a structure in the historic district" and No. 5

“the construction of new accessory buildings such as garages or carports which are highly visible from the public right-of-way are not appropriate in the historic district.”

Barbara Bowers motioned to disapprove. Nils Muench seconded the motion. Terry Garcia, Patricia Eables and Vincent Mancini voted against the motion. Therefore, the motion failed.

Terry Garcia motioned to approve the revised plans. Vince Mancini seconded the motion. Barbara Bowers and Nils Muench voted against the motion. Patricia Eables voted in favor of the motion. Therefore the motion carried.

APPROVE__X__ DISAPPROVE_____ TABLE_____

Other Business:

Patricia Eables reminded the Commission about the November 9th workshop.

The Commission will review a letter by Nils Muench for discussion at the workshop or at the next meeting.

As there was no other business, Vincent Mancini motioned to adjourn. Barbara Bowers seconded the motion.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane Silvia,
Historic Preservation Planner