

**Joint Workshop on 6.6-Acre Area Truman
Waterfront Parcel**

Douglass Gym

Key West, Florida

April 24, 2010

Facilitator's Summary Report

D R A F T
5-3-10

FCRC Consensus Center

Workshop facilitated and report prepared by
The FCRC Consensus Center
www.consensus.fsu.edu

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	3
WELCOME, AGENDA REVIEW AND BACKGROUND PRESENTATION	3
CRITERIA DISCUSSION	4
POSSIBLE USES	6
<i>COMMENTS</i>	6
<i>INITIAL LIST OF USES</i>	8
PRIORITIZATION OF USES	9
<i>DISCUSSION</i>	9
<i>PRIORITIES</i>	10
<i>IMPLEMENTATION GUIDANCE</i>	11
NEXT STEPS	11
APPENDIX	13

INTRODUCTION

On Saturday April 24, 2010 the Truman Waterfront Advisory Board of the City of Key West hosted a joint workshop together with the Bahama Village Redevelopment Advisory Committee and the City Commission to explore possible uses for a 6.6 acre parcel of the Truman Waterfront. Over 208 residents of the City of Key West and other interested parties participated, in addition to members of the hosting boards.

The overall purpose of the workshop was to provide guidance to the City in its future decision-making regarding the 6.6 acre site. The specific objectives of the workshop were to:

- identify considerations that should be taken into account when making decisions about the site;
- identify and discuss possible uses for the site;
- prioritize possible uses;
- understand next steps in making decisions for the site.

The workshop was facilitated by the FCRC Consensus Center. This report was prepared by the facilitator based on discussion notes taken during the meeting. For each discussion during the workshop, the report outlines the process used, provides a transcript of the notes taken, minimally edited for grammar and completeness, and summarizes key themes or conclusions where appropriate.

WELCOME, AGENDA REVIEW AND BACKGROUND PRESENTATION

Jim Gilleran, Chairman of the Truman Waterfront Advisory Board, welcomed participants and introduced members of the City Commission, Truman Waterfront Advisory Board, and Bahama Village Redevelopment Advisory Committee. He then introduced Rafael Montalvo, facilitator for the meeting, to review the agenda and guidelines for discussion.

Rafael Montalvo reviewed the overall purpose and specific objectives for the meeting. He noted that the meeting would have four parts – a presentation of background information to set the context, a discussion of the considerations (criteria) participants would like the City to weigh in making decisions about the 6.6 acres, a discussion of the uses participants would like to see on the parcel, and a prioritization of those uses. He then reviewed guidelines for the discussion, and introduced Doug Bradshaw, City of Key West Port Project Manager to provide background information.

Doug Bradshaw first described the location of the site, surrounding uses and leases, and access. He reviewed comprehensive plan objectives and principles for the Truman Waterfront, as well as zoning for the 6.6 acre property and summarized the results of previous planning efforts for parcel. He concluded the presentation with a

description of financial and other considerations relevant to any decision made about uses on the 6.6 acres.

The agenda, discussion guidelines and presentation materials are included in the Appendix of this report.

After the presentation, participants asked questions for clarification of the information presented. The questions asked and responses offered are presented below.

- Have plans for the marina and assisted living facility gone so far that they cannot be undone?
- The long term leases are set, but the designs still need to be approved by the City Commission.
- How long is long term?
- 99 years.
- Can you characterize the length of the other leases?
- There are no other leases at this time.
- Where is the Tax Increment Financing (TIF) property?
- City of Key West staff described the location of the TIF district.
- Were the comprehensive plan objectives for the Truman Waterfront property prioritized?
- No.
- Can you provide more information about what ingress and egress there will be from the site?
- The only agreement is for Southerd. We are also looking at Truman, Petronia, and Angela. They will be considered in the plan for the 6.6 acres.
- It is an odd shaped parcel. Is the long area part of Bahama Village? Is there a way to make the footprint more usable?
- Originally the Battery was included and the parcel was a little more regular in shape. There is probably a bit of wiggle room in the fact that designs for the surrounding properties have not been finalized.
- What is a TIF district?
- TIF stands for Tax Increment Financing. It applies to a designated district. Any increases in tax revenues resulting from an increase in property values or addition development in the district after it is established must be used to further benefit the designated area. Part of the TIF overlaps the 6.6 acres.

CRITERIA DISCUSSION

Participants were next asked to think about the following question.

What should be taken into account when making decisions about the site?

The facilitator pointed out that participants were not being asked to agree on the answer. Rather, this was an opportunity to share with others in the room those considerations or criteria that individual participants thought important. He further noted that the intention of this discussion was two-fold: 1) to help set the stage for a discussion of desired uses, and; 2) to provide additional guidance to City decision-making.

The considerations and criteria suggested by participants are listed below.

- The land was originally taken by the Navy from Bahama Village. The original intent of the Base Reuse Plan was to benefit Bahama Village. Over time we have diverged from that intention. Those plans should be brought back, including the economic development emphasis, the youth facility, open space and the fishing area.
- The plan should be financially self-sustaining, For that to happen, it needs to be multi-use so it can change as the economy changes.
- Limit parking, promote biking, walking and green spaces, and green building.
- Noise considerations and impacts on neighboring communities should be considered. How will you address the noise when the bars get out in the middle of the night?
- How long it will take to realize the proposal should be considered. How long is it going to take to create a new plan and then act? It has already taken a long time – don't create a new plan.
- Is the Bahama Conch Community Land Trust (BCCLT) plan still under consideration? Didn't the City approve it?
- No lease was finalized, but the BCCLT plan can still be considered.
- Job creation for Bahama Village residents.
- Instead of creating new buildings, focus on renovating existing structures. Use green building and renovation techniques.
- The BCCLT plan for this area should weigh heavily. Why are we recreating the wheel?
- The ingress and egress pattern of the final plan should have a positive impact on Bahama Village.
- Open space, green, trees.
- The affordability of housing.
- Consistency with the BCCLT plan – that plan was what the community wanted.
- No commercial development (except for commercial in Bahama Village) and open space preservation should be the priorities.
- Will the neighbors (District 6) have a strong say?
- Concern regarding amphitheatre's impacts on neighborhood. Remember what it was like at Woodstock. We don't want that here.
- A culinary school, as incorporated in BCCLT plan. Help put the people of Bahama Village back to work.
- Safety of residents and guests.

- Youth of community.
- Training youth for future employment.

POSSIBLE USES

During this discussion, participants next identified possible uses they wanted to see in the plan for the 6.6 acre parcel. The first list below is of the comments offered. The second list is of the uses suggested by the comments, as recorded on a screen at the front of the room during the discussion. The second list was simplified through combination and grouping of items in the subsequent discussion, but is presented here in its entirety.

A number of the issues raised during this and subsequent discussions in the workshop applied to Truman Waterfront properties surrounding the 6.6 acres. While the focus of the workshop was on the 6.6 acres, comments on the surrounding properties were also accepted. A number of participants expressed the opinion that to effectively plan for the 6.6 acres would require addressing all of the Truman Waterfront properties simultaneously.

Comments

- Soccer. We have 550 boys playing soccer, and we don't have our own field. We want shared fields and an agreement with the marina that they will maintain the green space.
- There should be a benefit to the entire community. Don't like that the Navy defined the uses in the land conveyance. The assisted living facility won't be used by the locals. For the 6.6 acres – a culinary school, restaurant, sustainable uses. Extend the streets and mix uses to reflect what was there before the Navy took over.
- The BCCLT had a good plan that should be considered. It shouldn't go away. The PAL gym should be maintained as a multi-use facility.
- Make an annex of Florida Keys Community College (FKCC) so it will be well managed.
- Capitalize on the viability of the waterfront as a tourist destination. Establish a fish market like they have in Panama City. Employ locals, bring fish boats in. Include an art market.
- Establish an open marketplace, with mixed uses.
- There is no cohesion here or in the mix of uses being discussed. It's a shame about the odd shape of the parcels. Why can't the soccer field be on the Spotswood property? A balance of scale doesn't exist.
- A museum with the verbal and written history of the Africans who came here. We want to be part of the description of the history. Tell the story of daily life, photos, etc.
- Keep the PAL gym as a multi-use facility. Expand the horse stables and the equestrian patrol of the park. No housing project, but do include affordable

- housing. The clean-up of the neighborhood has been successful – keep it up. Commercial uses.
- An emergency hospital to go with the assisted living facility. Keep the soccer field, and add an ADA dog park.
 - Open fields – soccer fields. Expand the PAL gym, and focus on the history of Bahama Village.
 - A tool library for kids to teach them to use tools (technical training and education). Keep Petronia pedestrian with a pretty entrance.
 - PAL gym – include a community theatre and pool.
 - Parking on the narrow Fort Street parcel.
 - Ingress and egress from Petronia. More soccer fields.
 - Would there be room on the other side of the mess hall for soccer fields if Petronia were extended into where the field is now?
 - A youth equestrian program.
 - A community park on Fort Street.
 - Fishing on the bight, available to the community.
 - Establish a community garden and solar panels.
 - There is no breeze on this island anymore. Consider how it used to be on the island – bring that back. Don't allow buildings along the waterfront that would block the breeze.
 - Look at the entire 33 acres -- you have to look at the entire area holistically. Also, could City-generated dollars (from ships docking at the outer mole) be used for a park?
 - Include a sustainable energy program. Include a solar heated swimming pool.
 - We have been promised a soccer field for years, but have always been asked to move (for example at Poinciana). We need a lease on the soccer field or we will be asked to move again.
 - Make sure the kids have permanent soccer fields. They have traveling competitive leagues.
 - Keep Bahama Village in the forefront – we are losing Bahama Village. We need development with emphasis on the roots of Bahama Village. Who really build the area? Bahamians. Continue with the plan for the culinary school, establish a history museum, and make space available for sculptures.
 - A black history museum.
 - Can the lease for the assisted living facility be cancelled?
 - The assisted living community is alive and well. Priority will be given to residents of Key West. The project is definitely moving forward.
 - Can revenue from ships be used to contribute to the area?
 - Don't allow any buildings over one-storey. Construct what buildings you do build sustainably, for example with grass on the roofs.
 - What about the traffic impact on Bahama Village? Where are people going to park?
 - We need a guarantee that the soccer fields will stay.

- Small shops, apprenticeships, small fix-it shops – zero waste. Keep the Bahamian character in the buildings.
- The history of this area has been lost. The land was supposed to be given back to the black people in the community. A plan was presented by BCCLT and accepted. Why aren't we talking about that? The citizens of Bahama Village should be working together. Give the land back to the black people of the community. There is more discrimination now than there was in the 60s.
- Set up a community garden with an emphasis on native plants, maybe offering classes and sales.
- A day care facility at PAL to serve Bahama Village children.

Initial List of Uses

- Culinary school
- Economic development for Bahama Village
- Soccer field (shared multipurpose green space) -- sustained irrigation, grass, lighting
- Uses prioritized with original conveyance of property
- Culinary school
- Youth training programs, restaurant
- Mixed-use commercial (ground-floor commercial, residential above)
- PAL gym -- maintain, but convert into a multi-use building
- Uses prioritized with original BCCLT Plan
- Extension of FKCC in the area
- Capitalize on proximity to waterfront
- Consider dependence on hospitality industry
- Fish market -- support for fishing industry
- Produce, flea, artisan markets
- Farmer's market
- Balanced (shared) uses on the site
- Verbal and written history of Bahama Village (documentation)
- Equestrian stable expansion
- Police station on Emma Street
- Eliminate homeless problem
- Affordable housing (with intent for sale)
- Arts facilities
- Emergency hospital/facilities
- Soccer field
- Small enclosed dog park
- Vocational training facility/shared museum documenting history of Bahama Village
- Tool library
- Woodshop (similar to 4H program)

- Walking pedestrian mall towards park (along Petronia)
- Full-service community center (PAL building)
- Parking along Fort Street
- Youth equestrian program
- Community park/garden
- Preserve area for fishing
- Parking/solar panels
- Sustainable building practices be implemented for uses
- Will a soccer field be maintained on the site (permanently)?
- Development emphasis on Bahamian culture (incorporate into uses, such as culinary school)
- Black history museum
- Height restrictions (single-story)
- Green roofs (not paint but plants)
- Impacts on traffic/parking
- Soccer fields, reinforcement of tree planting
- Smaller commercial shops, reinforcement of trade learning (emphasis on repairing and reusing items)
- Uses should ease back into the community

PRIORITIZATION OF USES

During the break after the initial listing of possible uses the facilitator tentatively grouped similar items and combined identical ones, as well as to identifying comments on the initial list that might be more appropriate as implementation guidance than as uses. Upon return from the break, participants reviewed and corrected the revised lists and suggestions, adding items that had been overlooked by the facilitator or offering more appropriate wording. The corrected lists were then transferred to easel-pad sheets.

Participants next indicated which uses they thought should be priorities by placing a dot next each to their highest priorities. Each participant was given five dots, and asked to place no more than one dot next to any particular item.

The facilitator pointed out that virtually all of the items on the list were priorities in some sense. The prioritization exercise would help the city understand which of the possible uses participants believed most important for this site.

Before placing dots, participants were invited to comment on what they thought the priorities should be.

Discussion

- Housing and the multi-use community center.

- The PAL gym/multi-use community center concept would include a lot of the other uses that have been suggested.
- The hospital should not be a priority for this site. Not sure it was actually suggested. The comment may have been a suggestion that the assisted living facility should be nearer a hospital.
- Parks and Recreation might not be the best use. Other portions of the site (other than the 6.6 acres) may be better for soccer fields.
- Open area and green space.
- The mixed-use/multi-use facility. The amphitheatre with the soccer fields, boxing rings, etc. Green space.
- We do not want parking lots. Provide for walking and biking.
- We don't want to lose the art from of the skilled fisherman and craftsman.
- Potential of moving the soccer field to leave the 6.6 acres for residents of Bahama Village.
- Keep BCCLT plan in consideration for Bahama Village, with more soccer fields.
- Open space -- green open space -- should be the priority. There are other places in the city for housing.
- A day care center would provide jobs and generate income.
- Long-term goal should be to generate activity and be self-sustaining. A combined child care/elder care facility would be a good idea.

Priorities

The items below are possible uses identified in the earlier discussion, as combined or grouped by the facilitator and corrected by participants, in the priority order resulting from the dot exercise. Numbers to the right of each item indicate the number of dots received by that item.

The facilitator noted that the results of the prioritization exercise suggest three tiers of priority. He also reminded participants that, as they had noted earlier, that the PAL Gym/Community Center concept (Item 2 below) might include some of the items in the second and third tiers.

Tier One

1. Passive recreational areas/green space: 46
2. Maintain PAL gym/community center with child and adult daycare: 37

Tier Two

3. Market – fish, arts, produce, fleas: 28
4. Community park and garden: 27
5. Mixed-use commercial on ground floor/residential above: 26
6. Recreational – multi-use, green field (soccer and other sports): 26

7. Bahama Village/Black History Museum: 24
8. Affordable Housing: 23
9. Other vocational and training programs -- job training, youth training, woodshop, library of wood shop tools: 20

Tier Three

10. Culinary school: 11
11. Arts and music facility: 10
12. Equestrian program: 8
13. Public arts space; 5
14. Dog park: 4
15. Hospital: 0

Implementation Guidance

The following are some of the suggestions made during the identification of possible uses that provide guidance for the implementation of any uses on the 6.6 acre parcel.

- Benefit and connection to Bahama Village
- Economic development – economically self-sustaining
- Height restrictions
- Green building/carbon neutral development
- Solar/self-sufficient power source
- Pedestrian/bicycle friendly
- Shade
- Parking
- Minimize impact to the neighborhood
- Ensure access to waterfront
- Breeze
- Lighting/safety
- Ingress and egress
- Native plants/native plant nursery
- Passive recreation/green space
- Mess hall building as revenue generator for Bahama Village

NEXT STEPS

At the conclusion of the meeting City Manager Jim Scholl outlined the expected next steps in the City's decision-making regarding the 6.6 acre parcel. He stated that the results of the workshop would first be presented to the Bahama Village Redevelopment Advisory Committee and the Truman Waterfront Advisory Board, and then forwarded with their recommendations to the City Commission. The City Commission will use this input to draft a request for proposals to develop a plan for the site.

During the closing comments, participants expressed a desire for follow-up meetings, and for an opportunity to address issues in a comprehensive or holistic way on all of the Truman Waterfront properties, not just the 6.6 acres. Mr. Scholl indicated that there would be additional public meetings during the review by the boards and City Commission.

Mayor Craig Cates thanked participants for their time and input, and expressed his hope that they would remain involved in the process. He then adjourned the meeting.

APPENDIX

AGENDA, DISCUSSION GUIDELINES AND PRESENTATION

BOARD PARTICIPATION

CITY COMMISSION
 Mayor Craig Cates
 Barry Gibson Teri Johnston Clayton Lopez
 Mark Rossi Billy Wardlow Jimmy Weekley

TRUMAN WATERFRONT ADVISORY BOARD
 Chairman Jim Gilleran
 Owen Trepanier Margaret Domanski Ashish Soni
 Kurt Lewin Albert Sullivan Jerry Curtis

BAHAMA VILLAGE REDEVELOPMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
 Madam Chair Carmen Turner
 Randy Becker Aaron Castillo Jerry Curtis
 Peggy Ward Grant Warren Leamard Annette Mobley

AGENDA

9:00	Welcome and introductions Purpose of meeting Agenda, guidelines, and hand-out review
9:15	Background information – presentations and discussion Location of Truman Waterfront Parcel and 6.6 Acre Area Recap of Public Planning Process 7c-Code The Defining Limitations Financial Considerations Current uses and approvals Discussion – What should be taken into account when making decisions about the site?
10:15	Break
10:30	Identification and evaluation of possible uses Identification and timing – What uses should be considered for the site? Discussion – Which uses should be the priority for the site and why?
11:45	Next steps
12:30	Lunch

**Joint Workshop on 6.6-Acre Area
 Truman Waterfront Parcel**

**Saturday, April 24, 2010
 9:00AM- 12:00PM**

**City Commission/Truman Waterfront
 Advisory Board/ Bahama Village
 Redevelopment Advisory Committee**

MEETING OBJECTIVES

- Identify considerations that should be taken into account when making decisions about the 6.6 acre site
- Identify and discuss possible uses for the 6.6 acre site
- Prioritize possible uses
- Understand next steps in making decisions for the 6.6 acre site

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

• **Location of Truman Waterfront Parcel and 6.6 Acre Area**

• **Recap of Public Planning Process To Date**

• **The Defining Limitations**

• **Financial Considerations**

• **Current Uses and Approvals**

CONCISE SIGNIFICANCE

- Respond to request (different responses)
- Letter to interested parties (already received necessary approvals)
- Specifics outlined – explain your committee and/or other interested parties (already received necessary approvals)
- Responding to requests to be added – notify
- Speak to each other
- Share the information
- Place your hand in the envelope

PROPOSED ACTION MEASURES

- All items during the meeting, documents, you may be asked to be included or excluded among the possible items to be included
- Use only the number of items included in the envelope
- Use only one set of items
- Write the number of items you wish to be included in the list
- Place list and envelope in the box or the main part

CONCISE SIGNIFICANCE INSTRUCTIONS

- All items during the meeting, documents, you may be asked to be included or excluded among the possible items to be included
- Use only the number of items included in the envelope
- Write the number of items you wish to be included in the list
- Place list and envelope in the box or the main part
- All items during the meeting, documents, you may be asked to be included or excluded among the possible items to be included
- Use only the number of items included in the envelope
- Write the number of items you wish to be included in the list
- Place list and envelope in the box or the main part
- All items during the meeting, documents, you may be asked to be included or excluded among the possible items to be included
- Use only the number of items included in the envelope
- Write the number of items you wish to be included in the list
- Place list and envelope in the box or the main part





PUBLIC PLANNING PROCESS TO DATE

- 1997 - Federal Base Reuse Plan
- 1999 - Chapter 288 Base Reuse Plan/Conceptual Plan
- 2002 - Economic Development Plan (EDC)
- 2005 - New Concept Plan based on reduced footprint

OBJECTIVE: Ensure that the integration of former military land provides for long-term, sustained, economic growth consistent with the community's vision for the City of Key West, as follows:

1. Provide meaningful integration of the sites into the community fabric;
2. Help diversify the economy;
3. Encourage balanced growth in the area's economy, including commercial and service sector job growth;
4. Provide employment opportunities for the region's unemployed and underemployed persons;
5. Strengthen the local tax base;
6. Help existing businesses and industries expand;
7. Help small businesses develop;
8. Provide affordable housing for Key West residents;
9. Provide public recreation and access opportunities, especially on the waterfront;
10. Provide opportunities for port, harbor and marina improvements;
11. Facilitate improvements and provide physical and economic links to Bahama Village;
12. Ensure environmental sensitivity;
13. Provide opportunities for social services and special needs facilities.

Truman Waterfront Organizing Elements. All new development and redevelopment within the Truman Waterfront Parcel shall be consistent with the following key organizing elements:

1. Recreation and open space linked through landscaped multimodal green ways and view corridors with multiple access points connecting the large park and recreational areas on the northwestern portion of the site
2. Uninterrupted public access to the waterfront through a wide promenade along the full length of the harbor.
3. Landscaped and landscaped areas which are visible and designed to provide a safe area for use by a diverse mix of recreational users including pedestrians, bicyclists and in-line skaters.
4. Affordable housing, neighborhood retail and social service uses which function as an extension of the neighborhood fabric of Bahama Village.
5. Educational and historical activity nodes.
6. Expanded use of the portions of the Truman Waterfront property for port activities.
7. Multiple ingress/egress points into the Truman Waterfront property.



ZONING DEFINITIONS

HISTORIC LIMITED COMMERCIAL DISTRICT (HCL)

The purpose of the HCL district is to provide a means for the "market place" adjacent to Bahama Village, south of the extension of Petrova Street. The HCL district shall accommodate limited commercial land uses in a building type suitable for the following activities:

- Neighborhood retail in a building within the immediate vicinity as opposed to off-site or regional markets;
- Specialized markets with customized market demands; or
- Tourist oriented markets in the immediate vicinity.

<p>USE IS PERMITTED</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Business and Professional Offices • Commercial Retail Low & Mid Rise • Maximum floor area per 1,000 sq ft of gross floor area: 10,000 sq ft • Maximum height: 40 feet • Maximum lot coverage: 40% of gross floor area • Openable walkway and wheelchair ramping to adjacent street or city regulations 	<p>CONVENTIONAL USES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Single-story Family Residential Developments located over commercial • Public and Private Useable • Restaurants, including drive-through, that generate less than 100 per hour vehicle trips per 1,000 sq ft
--	--

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Decisions for use of the property need to include financial considerations:

- How do we finance any development
- How do we maintain that development once built
- Does the development strengthen the local tax base

Navy Constraints on the Site

- Navy retained easements including road and utility
- Navy security standoffs from property lines
- Height restrictions (35 feet)
- Plans must be reviewed and approved by Navy

